

Impact of E-commerce on Customer's satisfaction of Guaranty Trust Bank Plc, Ilorin Kwara State, Nigeria

Ayobami Paul Abolade¹, Aliyu Ndalile Idris², Mayokun Adetula¹

¹Kwara State University, Malete, Kwara State Nigeria,

²Department of General Studies, Ibrahim Badamasi Babangida University Lapai Niger State, Nigeria

Correspondence Email: ayoabolade@gmail.com

Abstract

This paper considered impact of electronic commerce on customers' satisfaction of Guaranty Trust Bank in Ilorin Kwara State. The rationale behind the study is to find out whether electronic commerce, like e-purchase e-transfer brings about customer satisfaction. Assimilation Contrast Theory was used in this study. Survey research method was adopted; questionnaire was employed as instrument to gather data from the selected respondents. Non probability sampling was utilised: convenience sampling was utilised in the data collection procedures. Findings show that student customers of Guaranty Trust Bank Plc Ilorin, Nigeria, are significantly influenced by use of e-commerce, e-purchase, e-transfer etc. The study recommends that management of Guaranty Trust Bank should invest more on e-commerce as it satisfies their customers most especially their student customers and also gives competitive advantage in terms of patronage and customer loyalty which is made possible through e-commerce services of Guaranty Trust Bank Ilorin Kwara State.

Keywords: Electronic Commerce, Customer Satisfaction, Guaranty Trust Bank

JEL Classification: L81, M10

1. Introduction

The Internet population is exploding and it has resulted in the World Wide Web (www) multiplying so rapidly across the globe. More so, the use of the Internet is no longer limited to computer subscribers who use it for fun or curiosity. This has opened up tremendous business opportunities for users and businesses. The Internet began as the ARPANET during the cold war in 1969. It was developed by the U.S. Department of Defence's (DOD) in conjunction with some military contractors and universities to explore the possibility of a communication network that could survive a nuclear attack. It continued simply because the DOD, its contractors, and the universities found that it provided a very convenient way to communicate (Wu Lu, Latif Al-Hakim 2016) (Barua&Whinston 2000). The main purpose of the banking Internet service is to share information on bank account balance, no one owns the Internet, nor is it controlled or regulated by anyone. There is no single governing body, such as the censor board, that regulates the Internet. However, many of the general laws and

legal principles that have developed over the years in other fields, such as computer law, copyright, libel and trademark also apply to the Internet (Zusman & Landis, 2002). It is a truly universal, shared resource (Netscape, 2000).

Driven by more demanding customers and global competition, Banks try to distinguish themselves from others. Commercial Banks search for new ways to increase customer value and achieve competitive advantage. Banking services offer more than just core value to the customers, they also want to add additional value to satisfy them and earn increased patronage through e-commerce. Nigerian banks try to establish strong emotional connections with their task environment. An organisation's task environment consists of those things outside an organisation such as customers, competitors, government agencies, suppliers, labour, firms that are relevant to an organisation's operations. Connecting emotionally with customers requires banks to create a cohesive, authentic and sensory-stimulating total customer experience that resonates, pleases, communicates effectively and differentiates the organisation from the competition (Berry & Carbone 2017).

On the part of the customers, maintaining an emotional connection requires the banks to systematically offer experiences and its offerings from the customers' perspectives. This is important because it is the customers' overall service experiences with banking services it offers that evoke the perception of value that determines the preference. As a result, customer's satisfaction has become a critical issue in the success of every banking system. The development of e-commerce is at an unprecedented rate that permeates all aspects of society. Information technology application in the active area of trade shows, e-commerce through the Internet-based information publishing, online purchases, money transfers, electronic transactions and calculations for a series of means of information transmission and processing of breaking the constraints of time, logistics and other operation have greatly improved. Thus, it has greatly reduced the transaction costs, which not only profoundly changed the traditional way of production and management of existing services and consumption patterns but also had far-reaching implications. E-commerce represents the future direction of development of trade; the market has great potential and a broad development prospect. With the improvement of living standards and accelerating pace of life, consumers' shopping behaviour has changed greatly.

E-commerce represented by the network economy is changing the way people live. Nowadays, more and more consumers are turning to go shopping on the web. Generally, businesses have been accustomed to the traditional way of transacting, but the emergence of a global village has led the major business organisation to adopt I.T infrastructure, which was necessitated because of the dynamic nature of the business environment and the change in behaviour of the customers. Hence e-trading was introduced to give diverse customers across geographical frontier access to the product and service offered by a respective business organisation. Therefore e-commerce has to do with mobile or online trading of goods and services, with the use of the internet, computer, mobile phone and other electronic gadgets that use internet services.

This is done to bring the business closer to the customers. Satisfying this customer becomes important, for the survival of every business organisations depends on their sales turn over through the level of patronage by the customers. Most of the business organisations

triumphing in today's business world use online trading and e-services to their advantage, by taking their business activities online to remain in business, examples of these organisations are, Amazon, Chinavasion, E-bay, Alibaba, Konga, Africa, Jumia, Olx, and many more. It is expected that a higher level of customer's satisfaction leads to greater loyalty. Although, the impact of satisfaction on customer loyalty is rather complex, it is believed that customer's satisfaction accounts for only part of why people change product or service providers.

Today, all banks are seeking information on how to build customer loyalty and customer patronage. Loyal customers not only require more information themselves, but they serve as an information source for other customers. Building customer loyalty is one of the biggest challenges for business today. A customer will only be loyal once he or she is satisfied from the purchase of product or service offered by the business organisation. Therefore, satisfying a customer depends on different factors, because of the fact that customers' preference change and diverse from one customer to another, which is consequential to how a business organisation satisfies its customers (Bitner, Ostrom and Morgan (2007)). This is why the study seeks to investigate the impact of e-commerce on customer's satisfaction, from the perspective of student customers, unlike previous studies that predict the customers as a whole; whereas the heterogeneous nature of customers is diverse and with different sense of satisfaction which makes it difficult to accept a generalised opinion about customer satisfaction. However the broad aim of this study is to examine the impact of e-commerce on customer satisfaction, while the specific objectives are to analyse the extents of e-purchase on customer loyalty and evaluate the effect of e-transfer on customer patronage.

2. Literature Review

Theoretical Review

In a highly competitive business environment like the banking industry in Nigeria, an understanding of assimilation and contrast effects is of substantial interest. The theory was introduced by Anderson (2000) in the context of post-exposure product performance based on Sherif and Hovland's (1961) seminal research which suggest that judgments of objects can be affected by contextual factors (Joan & Brian, 2001). The theory states that if performance is within a customer's latitude (range) of acceptance, even though it may fall short of expectation, the discrepancy will be disregarded, that is, assimilation will operate and the performance will be deemed as acceptable whereas if they fall within the customer's latitude of neutrality, there will be minimal change. On the other hand, if performance falls within the latitude of rejection, contrast will prevail and the difference will be exaggerated and the product or service will be deemed unacceptable (Oxford, 2014).

The theory suggests that satisfaction is a function of the magnitude of the discrepancy between expected and perceived performance. When the expectations and the actual product performance do not match, the consumer will feel some degree of tension. In order to relieve this tension, the consumer will make adjustments either in expectations or in the perception of the product's actual performance. Consumers will tend to assimilate or adjust differences in perceptions about product performance to bring it in line with prior expectations if the discrepancy is relatively small. However, if the discrepancy is relatively high, contrast will occur and consumers will magnify or exaggerate the discrepancy and the product would be

rejected as totally unsatisfactory. Based on this theory, which is a function of difference between expected and perceived performance, this implies that customers can only be loyal if their perception of their purchase meets the required expectation of the services or product, which will also lead to re-order through consistent patronage.

Review of Related Literature

E-commerce refers to the use of communication technology particularly the internet to buy, sell and market products and services to customers. The Internet has brought about a fundamental shift in national economies that are isolated from each other by barriers to cross border trade and investment; isolated by distance, time zones and language; and isolated by national difference in government regulations, culture and business systems (Mohammad, 2004). It involves transfer of funds from one account to another that occurs electronically. An electronic transfer can take various forms, including a transfer made between an individual's various accounts (move from savings to checking), and from one individual's account to a corporation's account for an automatic reoccurring bill payment, or via a credit or debit card swiped at a retail location to pay for a purchase(Griffin, 2002).According to Ojo A. T. (2004)Electronic purchasing (e-purchasing), automates and extends manual buying and selling processes, from the creation of the requisition through to payment of the suppliers. The term e-purchasing encompasses back-office ordering systems, e-market places and supplier websites. Customer's satisfaction has been one of the top tools for a successful business. Customer's satisfaction is defined as an overall evaluation based on the total purchase and consumption experience with the good or service over time (Fornell, Johnson, Anderson, Cha & Bryant 1996). With marketing, customer's satisfaction also comes along with it which means it ascertains the expectation of the customer on how the goods and services are being facilitated by the companies. Actionable information on how to make customers further satisfied is therefore, a crucial outcome (Oliver 1999).

Some authors view e-Business as the evolution of e-commerce from the buying and selling over the Internet, and argue that the former is a subset of the latter (Turban et al., 2006). Others defend that, although related, they are distinct concepts (Laudon & Traver, 2008). Others use both terms interchangeably to mean the same thing (Schneider, 2002).

Kalakota and Robinson (2000) proposed a definition of e-business that clearly stresses the difference between e-commerce and e-business. More precisely they assume that "e-business is not just about e-commerce transactions or about buying and selling over the Web; it is the overall strategy of redefining old business models, with the aid of technology, to maximize customer value and profits". Kalakota and Robinson's definition is of great importance because it describes e-business as an essential business-reengineering factor that can promote company's growth.

According to Melao (2008), the clear commonalities among these definitions, include the improvement of business processes and the use of ICT in intranets, extranets and the Internet to conduct business. He defines e-Business as the use of ICT as an enabler to (re)design, manage, execute, improve and control business processes both within and between organisations.

Thus, front and back-office integration and multi-channel integration become crucial in e-Business, which requires a challenging process improvement approach to support the necessary organisational, technological and social changes.

A Study conducted by Rahmath, Hema and Abdullah (2001) states that, the various areas where the business organisations are preparing to use e-business approach include familiar and relatively mature electronically based products in developing markets, such as, online marketing, shopping mobile trading, credit cards. This means that most of the businesses have recognised the need to change their business process to conform to changing business trends in order to keep up with competition and increase patronage and loyalty.

In a study conducted by Rafiu (2007), he observed that customers are using E-service, to pay utility bills, insurance premium, to book orders online, to book flight tickets, purchasing the products online using net banking or online banking (e-banking), credit cards, debit cards or smartcards, this is made possible through business expansion and investment in information technology by business organisations, similarly, in a study conducted by Windrum, and De Berranger in (2002) focused on the integration of the internet and related ICTs into the business organisation forming e-business. It has two facets. One is the integration of the supply chain so that production and delivery become a seamless process. The other is the creation of new business models based on open systems of communication between customers, suppliers and partners, where the integration of the supply chain provides increased efficiency and significant cost advantages through waste minimization, the development of new products and services are facilitated by new ways of conducting business based on internet working between organisations and individuals, electronic business can be approached in many different ways, depending on the specific business process that might be carried out through the Internet. Thus, several Internet usage profiles or approaches are possible (Al-Qirim, Nabeel, 2005). A company must determine which profile or combination of profiles best suits its particular business context and strategy (Mendo & Fitzgerald, 2005).

Wang, Lin and Tang (2003) claim that in the 1990 e-commerce was under-utilised as business organisations used it only to market their products and services. Thornton and White (2001), examined customer orientations and usage of financial distribution channels in the Australian financial industry, found that more recently most financial institutions, faced with competitive pressure after the introduction of deregulation in 1983, have rethought their strategies to take full advantage of IT. Rafiu (2007) opines that the challenge to expand and maintain market share has influenced many business to invest more in making better use of the Internet. The emergence of e-commerce had made many business organisations rethink their IT strategies in competitive markets. This findings suggest that the business that fail to respond to the emergence of e-commerce in the market are likely to lose customers and that the cost of offering e-commerce services is less than the cost of keeping branch and opening of new outlets. Ayo (2006) investigated the prospects of e-commerce based on ability, motivation and opportunities (AMO) model and observed that virtually all companies have online presence. The study reported the motivation and opportunities for e-commerce as low based on lack of e-Payment infrastructure and access to information and communication technology (ICT) facilities. Chiemeké (2006) conducted an empirical investigation on adoption of e-commerce in Nigeria. The study identified the

major inhibiting factors to Internet, e-commerce adoption in Nigeria such as, insecurity, inadequate operational facilities including telecommunications facilities and electricity supply, and made recommendations on how Nigeria businesses can narrow the digital divide. Also, the report revealed that e-commerce is being offered at the basic level of interactivity with most of the businesses having mainly information sites and providing little Internet transactional services. According to the investigation of Olatidoye (2004), E-commerce is the paperless exchange of business information using Electronic Data Interchange, electronic mail, computer bulletin board, FAX, Electronic Fund Transfer and similar technologies. The information technology industries viewed e-commerce as an electronic business application aimed at commercial transaction. It also means the conduct of business commercial communication and management through electronic data interchange and automated data connection system and according to earlier study, whether companies are doing business over the internet or not, security is a serious issue. Grant(2001), Morri, and Siege (2003) posited that electronic commerce is simply defined as the commercial transaction of services in an electronic format. Electronic Commerce according to Clinton, (2000) is also defined as doing business electronically. It is based on the electronic text, sound and video. It encompasses many diverse activities including electronic trading of goods and services, online delivery of digital content, electronic fund transfers, electronic shares trading, electronic bills of lading, commercial auctions, collaborative design and engineering online sourcing, public procurement, direct consumer marketing and after sales services.

It involves both products (consumer goods, specialized medical equipment) and services (information services, financial and legal services). E-commerce refers to the use of communication technology particularly the internet to buy, sell and market goods and services to customers. The Internet has brought about a fundamental shift in national economies that are isolated from each other by barriers to cross border trade and investment; isolated by distance, time zones and language; and isolated by national difference in government regulations, culture and business systems (Mohammad, 2004). E-Commerce has dramatically reduced location importance. Retailers are now able to sell their products all over the world. This has the potential to increase their revenue and customer base dramatically.

However the work of Stockdale and Standing (2004) stated that the benefits using e-commerce should be visible and substantial so that the companies are encouraged to climb to the ladder from a simple to a more complex stage of e-commerce. Chong (2008) describes e-commerce as a process of integration of all company's processes, activities and services toward buying and selling of products and exchange of information and funds with the company's partners via computer networks and electronic technologies. Rainer and Cegielski (2011) also defined e-commerce as a "process of buying, selling, transferring, or exchanging of products, services, and/or information via computer networks, including the Internet". Schneider (2011) as cited in Diyan, (2012) divided the development of e-commerce into two stages: first wave and second wave. "First wave" of e-commerce was adopted by large enterprises in USA with easy access to capitals, primarily from external sources. Evans and Wurster (1999) refer to e-commerce in this early stage as a "land grab". At once, the whole new marketplace was created and companies who had sufficient

resources and willingness could “grab from the land”. These large companies firstly understood the possibilities that ecommerce can offer and started exploring and developing them. Since most companies were dependent on external investors, achieving the profit was relatively rare. The pressure to the smaller companies was far more intensive, and many of them suffered losses. Kotler (2003) states that there is a general agreement that satisfaction is a personal feelings of pleasure or disappointment resulting from comparing a product perceived performance (or outcome) in relation to his or her expectations. During the last four decades, satisfaction has been considered as one of the most important theoretical as well as practical issues for most marketers and customer researchers (Jamal, 2004). Nerges, et al (2014), conducted a research on the impact of service innovation on customer’s satisfaction using Tehran based Parsian Banks account owners. The result showed that concerning different aspects of modern services, customer’s interaction with institute is most effective element on customers satisfaction, followed by the provision of new services and delivery system. They added that regarding new services, development of new services caused the highest effect on quality of services followed by customer’s interaction with institute and delivery system. Moreover the result from their analysis demonstrated that all aspect of service quality contributed in customer satisfaction. Findings in the work of Bitner, Ostrom and Morgan (2007), revealed that there is a relationship between electronic service innovation and customer satisfaction. They carried out their research on Aramark Parks and Resorts. The result from their finding shows that service quality improvements and innovating new services increase customer’s satisfaction and increase repeat customers.

3. Methodology

The study employed a quantitative procedure to investigate the impacts of electronic commerce on customer’s satisfaction on Guaranty Trust Bank student customers in Ilorin Kwara State, Nigeria. Descriptive statistics such as frequency distributions and percentages were adopted to analyse the demographic responses collected. It was also used to determine the mean and standard deviation of the variables. The inferential statistics was then utilized to measure the relationship between electronic commerce on customer’s satisfaction of guaranty trust bank Kwara state, Nigeria.

Table 1: Response Rate of the Questionnaires

Response	Frequency	Percentage (%)
No. of Questionnaires	200	100
Questionnaires returned	178	89
Questionnaires not returned	22	11
Questionnaires Valid	164	82
Questionnaires not Valid (Due to outliers, double ticking and incomplete)	14	7
Valid response rate		82%

Source: Authors’ Field Survey (2019)

4. Result

Table 2 Descriptive result

Items	Frequency	Percentage (%)
<i>Gender</i>		
Male	98	59.8
Female	66	40.2
<i>Age</i>		
20yrs and below	29	17.7
21 – 25yrs	65	39.6
26 – 30yrs	69	42.1
31yrs and Above	1	0.6
<i>Institution Type</i>		
College	35	21.3
Polytechnic	43	26.2
Mono-technic	1	0.6
University	85	51.8
<i>Student Status</i>		
Pre-graduate studies	2	1.2
Undergraduate	156	95.1
Postgraduate	6	14.5
<i>Current Level</i>		
100 level	6	3.7
200 level	42	25.6
300 level	39	23.8
400 level	45	27.4
500 level	31	18.9
Above 500 level	1	0.6
Total	164	100%

Source: Authors' Field Survey (2019)

Out of the 164 valid responses used in this study, 98 (59.8%) of them are males while the remaining 66 (40.2%) are females. Also respondents' ages revealed in the descriptive analysis that, 29 (17.7%) of the respondents are below the age of 20 years, 65 (39.6%) are between 21-25 years of age, 69 of the respondents representing 42.1% are in the age of brackets 26-30 years. And 1 of the respondents representing 0.6% is above 31 years of age. Similarly, respondents institutions indicate, 35 (21.3%) of the respondents are college students; 43 (26.2%) are polytechnic students, while 1 respondent representing 0.6% of respondent is a mono-technic student. University had 85 (51.8%) of the Respondents. Also respondents by student status reveals that, 2 (1.2%) are pre graduate students. 156 (95.1%) are undergraduates, while only 6 (14.5%) are postgraduate students. Response rate by current level indicates that, 6 (14.5%) respondents are 100 level students, 42 (25.6%) respondents 200 level students, 39 (23.8%) respondents are 300 level students, 39 (23.8%) respondents are 400 level students, 31(18.9%) respondents are 500 level students, while 1(0.6%) respondents is above 500level.

Table 3: Mean and Standard Deviation of Variables

Variabes	N	Min	Max	Mean	Std. Dev.
E_transfer	164	1	5	3.031	.348
E_Purchase	164	1	5	2.823	.906
Patronage	164	1	5	3.057	1.503
Customer_Loyalty	164	1	5	2.910	.779

Source: Research Survey 2019

Multicollinearity Test

Multicollinearity is a situation where two or more exogenous latent constructs become highly correlated.

Table 4: Shows the VIF values and tolerance values for the exogenous latent constructs.

Variabes	Tolerance	VIF
E-transfer	.897	1.115
E-purchase	.383	1.935

Source: Research Survey 2019

Table 4 indicates that multicollinearity did not exist among the exogenous latent constructs as all VIF values were less than 5 and tolerance values exceeded .20 as suggested by Hair *et al.* (2011). There, multicollinearity is not an issue in the present study.

Regression Analysis and Hypotheses Testing between E-transfer and Customer patronage

Multiple regression analysis was conducted in determining the relationship between E-purchase and Customer patronage

Table 5: Model Summary^b

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson
1	0.821 ^a	0.674	0.672	0.86084	1.933

Note: a. Predictors: (Constant), E-transfer; b. Dependent Variable: Patronage

The model summary as indicated in table 4.12 above shows that R Square is 0.67; this implies that 67% of variation in the dependent variable (e-transfer) was explained by the constant variables (customer patronage) while the remaining 33% is due to other variables that are not included in the model. This means that the regression (model formulated) is useful for making predictions.

Table 6: ANOVA^a

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	248.253	1	248.253	335.006	0.000 ^b
Residual	120.048	162	0.741		
Total	368.301	163			

Note: a. Dependent Variable: Patronage; b. Predictors: (Constant), E-transfer

Table 6 above summarised the results of an analysis of variation in the dependent variable with large value of regression sum of squares (248.253) in comparison to the residual sum of squares with value of 120.048 (this value indicated that the model does not fail to explain

a lot of the variation in the dependent variables. However, the estimated F-value (335.006) as given in the table above with significance value of 0.000; which is less than p-value of 0.05 ($p < 0.05$) which means that the explanatory variable elements as a whole can jointly influence change in the dependent customer patronage).

Table 7: Coefficients^a

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients		
	B	Std. Error	Beta	t	Sig.
1 (Constant)	0.787	0.221		3.569	0.000
E-transfer	1.362	0.074	0.821	18.303	0.000

Source: Research Survey 2019

The dependent variable as shown in the table 7 explains the influence of e-transfer on customer patronage. This was used as a yardstick to examine the influence between the two variables. According to the result in the table 7, e-transfer-test coefficient is 18.303 and the P-value is 0.000 which is less than 0.05 (i.e. $P < 0.05$). The overall summary of this regression outcome in relations to the coefficient of e-transfer have significant influence on customer patronage. This implies that the null hypothesis was rejected while (i.e., e-transfer significant influence on customer patronage). Therefore, hypothesis H_1 is supported.

Regression Analysis and Hypotheses Testing between E-purchase and Customer Loyalty

Multiple regression analysis was conducted in determining the relationship between E-purchase and Customer Loyalty

Table 8: Model Summary^b

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson
1	0.903 ^a	0.815	0.814	0.33648	1.841

Note: a. Predictors: (Constant), E-Purchase; b. Dependent Variable: Customer-Loyalty

The model summary as indicated in table 8 shows that R Square is 0.82; this implies that 82% of variation in the dependent variable (e-purchase) was explained by the constant variables (customer loyalty) while the remaining 18% is due to other variables that are not included in the model. This means that the regression (model formulated) is useful for making predictions.

Table 9: ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	80.643	1	80.643	712.272	0.000 ^b
	Residual	18.342	162	0.113		
	Total	98.984	163			

Note: a. Dependent Variable: Customer-Loyalty; b. Predictors: (Constant), E-Purchase

Table 9 summarised the results of an analysis of variation in the dependent variable with large value of regression sum of squares (80.643) in comparison to the residual sum of squares with value of 18.342 (this value indicated that the model does not fail to explain a lot of the variation in the dependent variables. However, the estimated F-value (712.272) as given in table 9 above has significance value of 0.000, which is less than p-value of 0.05

($p < 0.05$) which means that the explanatory variable elements as a whole can jointly influence change in the dependent customer loyalty).

Table 10: Coefficients^a

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	0.719	0.086		8.336	0.000
	E-Purchase	0.776	0.029	0.903	26.688	0.000

Note: a. Dependent Variable: Customer-Loyalty

The dependent variable as shown in the table 10 explains the influence of e-purchase on customer patronage. This was used as a yardstick to examine the influence between the two variables. According to the result in the table e-purchase t-test coefficient is 26.688 and the P-value is 0.000 which is less than 0.05 (i.e. $P < 0.05$). The overall summary of this regression outcome in relations to the coefficient of e-purchase have significant influence on customer patronage. This implies that the null hypothesis is rejected while (i.e., e-purchase significant influence on customer loyalty). Therefore, hypothesis H_2 is supported.

Discussion of findings

As explained in the analytical findings, the e-transfer and e-purchase possess the potentials to predict the customer's satisfaction among GTBank student customers in Ilorin Kwara State Nigeria. The discussion mainly focuses on the research questions stated in the objective of this study. There were two hypotheses formulated to test the direct effect e-commerce. The hypotheses and summary of the findings are presented in Table 12

Table 12 Summary of Hypotheses Testing

Hyp.	Relationship	T – value	P -value	Decision
H_1	E-transfer -> Patronage	18.303	0.000	Supported
H_2	E-purchase -> Customer Loyalty	26.688	0.000	Supported

Source: Research Survey 2019

The result indicates that the e-transfer variable is found to predict customer patronage with the following figures ($t = 18.303$, $p = < .000$), hence, the Hypothesis H_1 is supported.

As such, the result indicates that the e-transfer significantly influence customer patronage among GTBank student customer's in Ilorin, Kwara State which is in line with the stated theory explaining the impact of E-transfer on customer satisfaction. Also, the result in H_2 indicates that e-purchase variable is found to predict customer loyalty with the following figures ($t = 26.688$, $p = < .000$), hence, the Hypothesis H_2 is also supported. As such the result indicates that the e-purchase significantly influence customer loyalty among GTBank student customer's in Ilorin, Kwara state which is in line with the stated theory that explaining the impact of E-purchase on customer loyalty.

5. Conclusion and Recommendations

This study provides an improved explanation on the nexus between electronic commerce and customers' satisfaction utilising results of the empirical findings from literature, which are in tandem to the research objectives in relations to electronic commerce and customer's satisfaction. This indicates that there is an established connection between electronic commerce and users, i.e, the organisation and the customers. The research objective of

electronic commerce and customer's satisfaction provides that there is strong significant relationship between Electronic commerce (e.g. E-purchases, e-transfer) and customers' satisfaction in Nigeria banking industry; this makes the customers to be loyal. Similarly, in hypothesis (H₂), the alternative route presented a better explanation that there is a significant relationship between E-transfer and Customer patronage in Nigeria banking industry, through the utilisation of electronic commerce. The alternative route supported that both factors considered in Electronic Commerce like E-purchases and E-transfer and factors considered in Customer's satisfaction (e.g. Customer Loyalty, Customer Patronage) adequately and equally contributed to E-commerce outcomes. Therefore, research objective one and two of this study were supported.

Finally, the proponent of assimilation-contrast theory viewed that customer's satisfaction can be achieved by meeting the expectation of the customers in products and service performance, and this can be done through E-commerce platforms. Investments in e-commerce will improved the awareness, experience, attitudes, of customers towards business organisations and give the organisation competitive edge. However, this study found that the objectives of E-commerce were reached through investment in information and communication technology and the adoption of management information system in organisation Therefore this study, recommended that organisation should adopt the use of information technology to gain more competitive advantage and improve overall customer's satisfaction.

References

- Ayo C. K. (2006). The Prospects of e-Commerce Implementation in Nigeria. *Journal of Internet Banking and Commerce*, 11(3) (<http://www.arraydev.com/commerce/jibc/>)
- Babbie, E. (2004). *The Practices of Social Research, 10thed*. The US: Wadsworth, Thomson Learning, Inc.
- Berry & Carbone (2017). The Impact of e-service Quality, customer's satisfaction and Loyalty on e-marketing: Moderating Effects of Perceived Value. *Total Quality Management and Business Excellence*, 20(4), 423-443.
- Business Dictionary. (2017). Available: <http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/commitment.html>. Accessed 6 June 2017.
- Calvo-Mora, A., Picón, A., Ruiz, C., & Cauzo, L. (2013). The relationships between soft-hard TQM factors and key business results. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 34(1). 115-143.
- Chambers, R. L. (1986). Outlier Robust Finite Population Estimation *Journal of American Statistics Association*, 81, 1163 – 1169.
- Chiemeke S. C, (2006). The Adoption of Internet Banking in Nigeria: An Empirical Investigation. *Journal of Internet Banking and Commerce*, 11 (3) (<http://www.arraydev.com/commerce/jibc/>)
- Chong, S. (2008). Success in electronic commerce Implementation, A cross-country study of small and medium-sized enterprises. *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 21(5), 468-492
- Cohen, J. (1988). *Statistics Power Analysis for the Behavioural Sciences, (2nded)*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

- Cooper & Schindler. (2004). Essentials and fundamental principle of project writing, in academic environment.
- Deng, Z; Lu, Y., Wei, K. K. & Zhang, J. (2009). Understanding Customer's satisfaction and Loyalty: An empirical analysis in the service sector. *International Journal of Information Management*, 30, 289-300.
- Dillman, D. A. (2000). *Mail and internet surveys: the tailored design method*. Brisbane: Wiley.
- Emenyi, E. O. (2013). Impact of e-commerce on tax revenue in Nigeria: A study of the Federal Inland Revenue Service in South-South States of Nigeria.
- Eshghi, A; Haughton, D. & Topi, H. (2007). Determinants of Customer Loyalty in the Banking Industry. *E-banking Policy*, 31(2): 95-108.
- Evans P & Wurster T S, (1999), *Blown to Bits: how the new economics of information transforms strategy*, Harvard Business School Press, Boston, USA.
- Alonzo M. F., G. Fitzgerald. (2004). An analysis of stages of growth models in SMEs e-business progression, presented at the Proceedings of the 1st European and Mediterranean Conference on Information Systems, 2004 Tunis, Tunisia
- Fornell, C., Johnson, D.M., Anderson, W. E., Cha, J. & Bryant, E B. (1996). The American Customer's satisfaction Index: Nature, purpose, and findings. *Journal of Marketing*
- Gerrit, V. B., Martin, S., Gary, L., & Bernd, S. (2010). Prediction Markets as Institutional Forecasting Support Systems. *Decision Support Systems*, 49(4), 404-416.
- Griffin, J. (2002). *Customer Loyalty: How to earn it how to keep it*. United States of America: Jossey Bass.
- Hair, J. F., Anderson, R. E., Tatham, R. L. & Black, W. C. (1988). *Multivariate data analysis* 5thed. New Prentice-Hall
- Hennig – Thurau, T. & Klee, A. (2000). The impact of customer's satisfaction and relationship quality on customer retention: A critical reassessment and model development. *Psychology and Marketing*, 14(8), 737-764.
- Ho & Wo (1999). Customer's satisfaction a critical issue in business operation and management. *International Journal of Information Management*, 40:468-250.
- Kalakota, R & Robinson, M. (2000). *'E-Business 2.0: Roadmap for Success'*, Canada, Addison-Wesley.
- Laudon & Traver (2008). *E-Commerce: Business, Technology, Society*, 4th Edition
- Bitner, M. J., Ostrom, L. & Morgan, N. (2007) *Service Blueprinting: A Practical Technique for Service Innovation*. 50(3), 66-94
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Morri, K. & Siege, L. N (2003). E-commerce, *Journal of Nigerian Computer Society*.14, 60.
- Al-Qirim, N. (2005) An Empirical Investigation of an e-commerce Adoption-Capability Model in Small Businesses in New Zealand. *Electronic Markets*, 15(4), 418-437, DOI: [10.1080/10196780500303136](https://doi.org/10.1080/10196780500303136)
- Nemati, A. R., Khan, K., & Iftikhar, M. (2010), Impact of innovation on customer's satisfaction and brand loyalty. A case study of mobile phones.
- Ojo A. T. (2004): "Enhancing the efficiency of the payment system: Conceptual Framework", A paper presented at the 9th CBN Monetary Policy Forum, Abuja, May 2004.

- Olatidoye, O. (2004). Cyber-security and E-commerce. <http://www.mail-archive.com/gkd@phoenix.edc.org/msg01823.html>. International, Inc.
- Oliver, R.L. (1999). Whence consumer loyalty. *Journal of Marketing*. Volume 63, pp 33-44.
- Oxford (2014). Assimilation-Contrast Theory, Oxford Reference, Retrieved from: <http://www.oxfordreference.com/10.1093/oi/authority.201108083095429808>.
- P, Kotler (2003). Evaluating the effectiveness of brand-positioning strategies from a consumer perspective. *European Journal of Marketing*, 44 (11/12), 1763-1786.
- Percy, W. H., Kostere, K., & Kostere, S. (2015). Generic Qualitative Research in Psychology. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(2), 76-85.
- Rafiu, O. S. (2007). The Emergence of Internet Banking in Nigeria: An Appraisal. *Information Technology Journal*, 6: 490-496.
- Rainer, K. & Cegielski, C.(2011). Introduction to Information Systems: Enabling and Transforming Business. Third Edition. John Wiley & Sons Inc.
- Sekaran, U. (2003). *Research method for business: A skill building approaches*(4thed.). New Jersey: John Wiley and Sons.
- Sherif, M. & Hovland, C. I. (1961). Social Judgement: Assimilation and Contrasts Effects in Communication and Attitude Change, New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- [Stockdale, R.](#) & [Standing, C.](#) (2004), Benefits and barriers of electronic marketplace participation: an SME perspective, *Journal of Enterprise Information Management*, 17 (4), 301-311.
- Tabachnick, B. G. & Fidel, L. S. (2007). *Using multivariate statistics* (5th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education Inc.
- Thornton, J. & White, L. (2001) Customer Orientations and Usage of Financial Distribution Channels. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 15, 168-185.
- [Wang, Y.](#), [Wang, Y.](#), [Lin, H.](#) & [Tang, T.](#) (2003). Determinants of user acceptance of Internet banking: an empirical study. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 14(5), 501-519.
- Windrum, & de Berranger,(2002). *The adoption of e-business technology by SMEs*. UNU-MERIT Research Memoranda. UNU-MERIT.
- Lu, W. & Al-Hakim, L. (2016). Banking on the internet a blueprint: for services innovation caliform management. *Review 2007*, 50(3), 66-94.
- Zusman & Landis, (2002) *Managing Services*, 1st edition, New York: McGraw-Hill/Irwin Publishing House.