

## Ethics Management for Effective Public Service Institutions in Tanzania: The Case of Kinondoni Municipal Council

Dr. Paul Mtasigazya, Orcid Id- <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4635-0025>

Department of Management Studies, Tanzania Institute of Accountancy, Dar es Salaam Campus, Tanzania.

Email: [p.anton75@yahoo.com](mailto:p.anton75@yahoo.com) or [paulo.mtasigazya@tia.ac.tz](mailto:paulo.mtasigazya@tia.ac.tz)

### **Abstract**

*The main objective of this study was to examine ethics management in public service Institutions in Tanzania. Specifically, this paper examined the extent in which public servants comply on Code of Ethics and Conduct for Public Service. This paper was guided by specific objectives such as i. to examine the mechanisms put forward to ensure public servants' compliance on code of ethics, also ii. to explore the factors which hinder ethical practices in public services. Additionally, this study examined the measures to be taken to increase ethical practices in public service. The research methodology adopted were both qualitative and quantitative research methods and sampling techniques such as random sampling and purposive sampling were used in selecting different categories of respondents from their respective departments from Kinondoni Municipality. The target population was Kinondoni Municipal Staff and the citizens who are receiving services from Kinondoni Municipality. The sample size was composed of 80 respondents selected using random and purposive sampling techniques. The methods of data collection were interviews and documentary review which were used in collecting both primary and secondary data to complement the gaps left by primary sources. Thus, data analysis was done through thematic data analysis and descriptive statistics were used to establish frequencies and percentages. The major findings revealed that low incentives, conflict of interest and mal-administration contributed to unethical practices in Kinondoni Municipal Council. The mechanisms established by the government were not effective in promoting compliance on ethical codes of conduct which in long run caused a poor services delivery particularly health services, judicial services, education services.*

### **Journal of Policy and Development Studies (JPDS)**

Vol. 17 Issue 1 (2024)

ISSN(p) 1597-9385

ISSN (e) 2814-1091

Home page

<https://www.ajol.info/index.php/jpds>

### **ARTICLE INFO:**

#### **Keyword:**

Ethics, Ethics Management, Public Service Institution,

#### **Article History**

**Received:** 2<sup>nd</sup> September 2024

**Accepted:** 20<sup>th</sup> November 2024

**DOI:**

<https://dx.doi.org/10.4314/jpds.v17i1.2>

## **1. Introduction**

Ethics management has been used interchangeably with integrity management which is construed to mean the deliberate efforts to create an ethical culture and to impede unethical behavior and promote ethical behavior within an organization. The governments across the globe have established broad variety of ethics management instruments such as ethics codes, ethics training, whistle-blowing arrangements, disciplinary procedures or ethics audits (Maeschalek, 2024). It also provides advice on the processes necessary to bring these instruments to life and on the ways in which ethics management can be anchored in the organizational structure. In this paper, ethics management refers to legal and institutional set up established in order to create ethical performance and service delivery and impede unethical practices. These legal and institutional set ups include code of ethics, ethics secretariat, integrity committees, laws, regulations that promote ethical behaviors and practices among public servants at Kinondoni Municipal Council.

Recent years have seen an impressive increase in interest in public sector ethics management, partly in reaction to public management reform in general. More specifically to New Public Management (NPM) and the pressure from citizens calling their government to be responsive (Pollitt & Bouckaert, 2000). These reforms include the introduction of competition both within government and between governmental agencies and private sector organizations, the use of performance management systems as well as compliance on codes of ethics have been important aspects of public sector reform worldwide (Pollitt & Bouckaert, 2000; Hood & Michael 1991). At the global context, these reforms are alleged to have changed public sector values, and ethics management is seen as an appropriate reaction to complement these reforms and compensate for their possible negative impact on the ethics of public servants (Hood & Michael, 1991; Osborne & Gaebler, 1992).

The interest in ethics management has also been linked to broader changes in society. It has been proposed as a lever to restore trust in government in a time when concern about public trust in government is increasing all over the Western world. It is also a reaction to society's changing values. They are no longer satisfied with the traditional hierarchical accountability of public servants to their superiors and ultimately to elected officials. Ethics management is a way to deal with these and other demands for changes in the ethos of public servants.

In the same vein, ethics management internationally is a rapidly evolving reality with many countries placing considerable emphasis on anti-corruption initiatives. A recent study of the 26 member countries of the European Union notes that 'the focus in national public administrations and the media is on corruption, fraud and conflicts of interest, but much less on unethical behavior in general' (OECD, 2000; Fox, 2021). Broader worldwide efforts have been to put into place to implement ethics management strategies that encourage ethical behavior and combat corruption.

Perhaps the most active region of the world today in the management of public servant ethics i.e development and implementation of codes of ethics is Central and Eastern Europe where many countries are in transition from authoritarian regimes to democratic regimes. A study by Fox (2021), a scholar from Lithuania, tracked the approaches taken in ten countries which are Albania, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Estonia, Lithuania, Poland, Macedonia, Romania, Slovak Republic. She reports that two trends are discernable in which some countries focus on the behavior of public servants through laws and codes

while other countries rely on statutory regulation only. The implementation of ethics codes and/or laws follows one of two paths. The first path is the use of an impartial council or board much like that found in the United States and the United Kingdom. The second path is left up to the individuals themselves ‘to interpret and apply the code of ethics (Bossaert, & Demmke, 2005). This latter approach is consistent with the professional norm of self-enforcement which is central to the codes adopted by many professional societies in the United States.

In Tanzania, a Code of Ethics and Conduct for the Public Service is being issued for the first time since our independence in 1961. During the colonial rule a Code of Ethics and Conduct was inherent in different laws and regulations (ibid). This approach continued even after independence. Since these laws and regulations were not easily available to all public employees’ people were generally unaware of expected ethical conduct. To counter that shortcoming this code is being widely distributed so that public service employees will clearly understand what is required of them in terms of ethical conduct and standards of performance acceptable in the Public Service. Besides stipulating clearly the standard of behaviors, the code also aims to enhance ethical performance and to regain public confidence. The Code will also enable Public Servants to participate fully in fulfilling the mission of the Public Service, which is to deliver quality service to the people of Tanzania efficiently, effectively and with the highest standard of courtesy and integrity.

To this end, Tanzanian government has implemented a number of reforms in order to promote ethical practices in an endeavor to serve the citizenry. Such public sector reforms include Civil Service Reform Programme (CSRP) was implemented between 1991-1999, which redefined the role of the Government. Further reforms include Public Service Reform Programme Phase (PSRP)-I which was implemented between 2000-2007 focusing on management systems (Mwajande, 2022). This was followed by (PSRP)- II implementation between 2008-2012, with the objective to improve public service delivery in terms of performance efficiency, quality, timeliness, and ethics and conduct in the public service (Mwajande, 2022). Promoting integrity in the public service is one of the components to improve governance. In view of PSRP-II, public servants ought to provide services with integrity; measured by the core values of public service, including; professionalism, honesty, objectivity, impartiality, and accountability. Integrity in public service is observed when public servants do not seek or accept bribery or corruption as inducement offered in exchange of discharging their primary duties (United Republic Tanzania (URT), 2012).

It is also observed when public servants do not use public offices, properties or official time for their own private gains. The defining principles of ethics in the Tanzanian Public Service are prescribed in the Code of Ethics and Conduct for the Public Service, that states; “in order for the public service to be efficient and respected, public servants shall behave, conduct and observe the Code of Ethics and Conduct displaying excellence in services, diligence, integrity, accountability, respect of Law, and proper use of official information”. Courtesy to all is described as that “public servants” treatment of their clients and colleagues with politeness and considerate when dealing with clients especially the vulnerable members of the public, such as the elderly, the poor, the sick and people with disabilities” (Transparency International, (TI), 2017).

Pursuant to the established principles, public servants are expected to deliver services with integrity principles, which require them to “not exercising power for personal gain, safeguarding public funds and properties, honesty in discharging public services, not soliciting or accepting bribes or not indulging in

all forms of corruption” and readiness to declare property within specified procedures (Transparency International, (TI), 2017).

Furthermore, an integral part of the public sector reform has been an institutionalization of codes of ethics and conduct in the public service to enhance its practice and compliance. The Code of Ethics and Conduct for Public Service has been made by The Ministry of State, Presidents’ Office Public Service Management under the authority of section 34 of the Public Service Act of 2002 and regulation 65 (i) of the Public Service Regulations of 2003. The primary responsibility for ethics in public service lies with the Ethics Division of the Presidents’ Office Public Service Management. The Public Service Act No. 8 of 2002 gives Presidents’ Office Public Service Management the mandate to oversee public service ethics in Ministry, Government Department and Agencies (MDAs) also in Local Government Authority (LGA) by coordinating and monitoring ethical practices in workplaces. The main objective of the Ethics Division is to enhance integrity, discipline, transparency and accountability in the public service and bring about an attitudinal change among public servants in order to restore and sustain public service ethics and conduct.

Among other things the Code of Ethics and Conduct of Public Service of 2005 states “that in order for public service to be efficient and respected, public servants shall behave, conduct and observe the code of ethics and conduct such as punctuality, confidentiality, respect of law, discharge duty with integrity, team work, maintenance of political neutrality, impartiality, as well as loyalty.

This effort of putting code of ethics and conduct in the Public Service Management and Employment Policy of 1999 intends to enhance compliance of public servants on the practice of the code of ethics and conduct as the policy states, “Public servants shall be bound by a core shared value, these core shared values shall be the basis of code of ethics that shall lay down standards of conduct and behaviors that employees in public service should observe.

However, recent studies such as United Republic of Tanzania (URT) (2005) indicated that the current reports show that the existence of unethical practices and integrity violations in the Tanzania public service is self-evident. The assumption that the existence of formal code of ethics will generally yield high standards of behavior and inhibit unethical conducts in the public service does not hold.<sup>15</sup> In the same vein, the transformation from public administration to new public management reforms in Tanzania which came with a new organizational culture and the development of ethical leadership training programs have not been fully investigated.

## **1.2 Statement of the Problem**

Tanzania government through the Ministry of Public Service management and good governance has under taken various efforts to enhance compliance of public servants and leaders on ethics and conduct for public service as part of ethics management. These efforts include the enactment of Public Leadership Code of Ethics Cap 398, Code of Ethics and Conduct 2005, providing government leadership commitments to ethics and conducting ethics training. Moreover, the Government implemented National Anti-corruption Strategy and Action Plan phase III 2017-2022 and establishment of e-Government in the public service delivery including the e-feedback (Kimwiko, 2019). The President’s Office, Public Service Management and Good Governance (PO-PSMGG) has been investing on and promoting integrity public service. Despite these efforts, the compliance on code of ethics and conduct for public service is still dismal, this fact is demonstrated in the study conducted by<sup>16</sup> which indicates that in 2022, 80% of Police

Officers were involved in corrupt practices. This view is corroborated by Kimwiko (2019) which found that Police officers were rated as the most corrupt institutions in six out of eight participating African Countries. Also, Mutahaba (2005) concluded that there is no doubt that corruption is rampant in all sectors of the economy, public services and politics in the country. There is evidence that even some officers of government organs vested with the responsibility of administration of Justice namely the Department of National Security services such as Migration, the Police, the Judiciary and the Anti-Corruption Bureau are themselves immersed in corruption. Furthermore, unethical practices are underscored by United Nations (2021) which recorded that Tanzania has seen a slight improvement from 38 points in 2022 and is ranked position 87 out of the 180 countries and territories assessed.

Similarly, Petty corruption is part of everyday life for Tanzanians (Lamerck, 2024). In the view of the main reasons for prevalence of corruption are the culture in the East Africa region that people are prepared to pay bribes (a form of corruption) include: (a) (b) (c) (d) Bribes being expected by service providers; and to hasten up services (Mutahaba, 2005). When dealing with government officers in various departments, especially healthcare, education, traffic, customs and immigration, citizens often find themselves paying bribes or making facilitation payments.

Therefore, this paper examined the factors dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conduct for Public Service. This paper departs from the fore mentioned studies such as OECD (2017), study conducted by Global Integrity (GI). (2016), Bangser, & Mamdani, (2004). and study conducted by Mamdani, (2004) mainly focused on examining unethical practices and corruption to public officials while<sup>23</sup> focused on the effects of unethical practices on primary education. Therefore, this paper focused on examining the factors for dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conducts in public service specifically at Kinondoni Municipality as they were not involved in studies by fore mentioned scholars and there is no study that has been conducted at Kinondoni municipal level on the factors of dismal compliance on codes of ethics. Similarly, the study intends to assess the mechanisms put in place to ensure compliance of public servants particularly Kinondoni Municipal Staff and citizens on code of ethics and conduct for public service as well as examining the effects of unethical practices on public service. This paper was guided by the following research objectives: i. To explore the causes which hinder ethical practices in public services with reference to public servants in selected institutions ii. To assess the mechanisms put in place to ensure compliance of government staff on code of ethics and conduct for public service in selected institutions. iii. to examine the effectiveness of the measures to be taken to increase ethical practice in public service. The research questions were such as i. what are the causes which hinder ethical practices in public service? ii. What are the mechanisms put in place to ensure compliance of government staff on Code of Ethics and Conduct of Public service in selected in institutions? iii. How are the measures effective in increasing ethical practices in selected in institution and to the citizens?

## **2. Literature Review**

This chapter presents literature review based on the theory and practice of ethics in public service. It includes definition of key terms, theoretical and empirical literature. Policies, regulations and practices by the public servants are seen as components of an integrity system meant to elevate the integrity in the public service (OECD, 2017). Ethics in public service in Tanzania therefore is about the standards of right and wrong that should guide public servants as they conduct and carry out their duties.

## **2.1 Conceptual overview of Code of Ethics and Conduct for Public Service**

Code of ethics in general encourage groups and individual employees to display as espouse particular characteristics such as loyalty, honest, objectivity, integrity, transparency and accountability.

Similarly, Gilman (2005) contends that ethical codes of conduct for public servants can articulate an acceptable behavior as well as providing a vision for which the government official is striving. Additionally, the Public Service Management and Employment Policy of 1999 stipulates that “the ethical codes of conducts such as pursuit of excellence in service, loyalty to the government, diligence to duty, impartiality in service, integrity, respect for the law and proper use of the official information just to mention few are essential aspects to be adhered by public servants”. Therefore, in this research paper, code of ethics and conduct of public service means set of standards such as respect of human rights, perform diligently, promote transparency and accountability, integrity and objectivity which will enable public servants to participate fully in fulfilling the mission of public service which is to deliver quality services to Tanzanians efficiently, effectively and with the highest standards of courtesy and integrity. On the other hand, public servant is construed to mean Kinondoni Municipal Staff who are remunerated by government and working in local government departments. Compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conduct of public service, entails assessing whether public servants adhere to the standards and rules of code of ethics and conduct for public service in Tanzania.

## **2.2 Theoretical Overview**

There are various theories which explain about ethics in public service, such as the right theory, the fairness and justice theory, common good theory, utilitarian theory and deontological theory of ethics. However, Gilman, (2005) pointed out two approaches to understanding and managing ethics issues in public sector namely compliance approach and integrity approach.

The integrity approach focuses on internal control i.e self-control exercised by each individual public servant. The internal control mechanism consists of two components (Hejka,1994). One component is the public servant’s moral judgment capacity, which can be strengthened in two ways: by learning and understanding the necessary values and norms and by developing the skills in ethical decision making, needed to apply those values particularly when they conflict with one another in daily practice. The other component of internal control is moral character: the intrinsic will to act upon judgments reached through ethical decision-making (Bawole, & Sakyi, 2009). Integrity management aims to stimulate moral character and improve ethical decision- making skills through interactive training sessions, workshops, ambitious codes of values, individual coaching, and similar means.<sup>28</sup>

On the other hand, compliance approach to ethics management emphasizes the importance of external controls on the behavior of public servants. It prefers formal and detailed rules and procedures, and ultimately aims at a situation in which “the individual ethical choice is limited to choosing to follow the rules (the ethical thing to do) or to violate them by commission or omission (unethical acts)”. Typical instruments of this approach include legislation, strict behavioral ethics codes and other rules, extensive control mechanisms, and control institutions with extensive powers which are not stated by the fore mentioned theories. Thus, for the purpose of this study compliance approach examined the existing code of ethics for public service and how other mechanisms put by Tanzania government to ensure compliance of public servants on code of ethics are followed to enhance ethical practices among Kinondoni Municipal Staff.

## 2.4 Empirical Studies

In Europe, the founder of Transparency international (TI) and an activist European lawyer, Jeremy Pope, notes that when TI was launched in the early 1990s the guiding philosophy was to fight corruption by building a country's 'national integrity system.' More than a decade later, he concluded that no matter how hard we work trying to strengthen public institutions and implement international standards, little seems to change. The bottom line is that 'it does not really matter how strong one's institutions are if the wrong people are inside them'. An individual's ethics, however acquired and influenced, cannot be ignored.

Choi (2023) conducted a survey in more than 40 countries around the globe, the GBES surveys thousands of employees about their experiences and perceptions around ethics in the workplace. Countries use this vast but easy-to-sort dataset to understand the current global state of Ethics & Compliance, identify potential issues at their own companies, and generate benchmarks that reveal how well their companies are doing in achieving their ethics goals. The survey indicated that retaliation against employees who report misconduct continues to occur at unacceptable rates. While observed misconduct and reported misconduct rates have risen, retaliation rates have stayed steady. The number is still high, as almost half of employees around the world who reported misconduct experienced retaliation. When retaliation rates are lowered, employees are likely to feel more comfortable reporting wrongdoing. If observed misconduct reporters are not protected, fewer reports of misconduct will come in, putting your organization at risk. This report presents the findings on experiences and perception about ethical standards at work place but the compliance of public servants on ethics in Tanzania has not been dealt with. Code of Ethics in East Africa indicate that unlike the private sector, research into public sector code of conduct is limited, this view is supported by <sup>31</sup> who have intimated that although interest on research of code of ethics has increased since the early 1980s' the emphasize has been in the private sector codes of ethics and that, studies on public sector codes of ethics appear to be limited.

In the same vein have argued that there appear not to have any in-depth examination of the conduct of the codes of ethics and related organizational ethics act facts in public sector organizations (Sikika, 2010). Therefore, the empirical literature limiting code of conduct and employees' behavior and compliance is not very strong. However, there are few studies which need to be reviewed in order to reveal the knowledge gap. For that case, Transparency International (2023) study was able to identify only a weak link between the existence of ethical codes and employee's behavior where he concluded that when there is code of conduct in place it is not necessarily or does not guarantee the conformance or compliance of employees on ethical codes of conduct. Therefore, this scholar did not explore the factors for non-compliance of codes of conduct, which this project intends to unravel.

In East Africa with reference to Kenya, the level of ethical conducts among public officials in the management of public affairs has consistently declined since independence. The rate of annual economic growth of the country has generally declined over the period. Transparent International (2021) noted that at time, the efficient and effective delivery of public services to the ordinary citizen have continuously deteriorated. A combination of these two factors has resulted in widespread unemployment and poverty in the country. Since independence, Kenya has formulated various legal instruments and established a number of watchdog institutions for regulating and monitoring the ethical behavior of its public officials. Besides, in the early 1990s, domestic opposition groups assisted by the international community demanded and eventually achieved the restoration of competitive party politics or multi-partism in the country. The reason the majority of Kenyans demanded Liberal democracy was due to the belief that good governance could only be guaranteed through the system.

However, despite the existence of a number of legal instruments and watchdogs' institutions for regulating and monitoring the ethical standards of public officials, and the adoption of multiparty, the management of public affairs and institutions by those who are entrusted with positions of authority in the country has not improved. For instance, according to Transparency International, since 2020, Kenya has remained among the top ten most corrupt countries in the world. During the period, the transparency index of the county has generally declined. Whereas in 2020 Kenya's transparency rating was 31 with a change of -1 since last year and it ranks 126 out of 180 countries, in 2023. The continued deterioration of the level of accountability among public officials in the country shows that the adoption of multiparty has not contributed to good governance. This study confined itself on examining the effectiveness of multiparty politics in restoration of ethical practices among the public officials, thus this study will examine the causes of unethical practices among public servants, and mechanisms put in place to ensure ethical practices in public services (Sikika, 2016).

In this case, in order to ensure that ethical codes of conduct for public servants actually work, they must be entrusted to specially established institutions that can implement or administer them effectively. Such institutions include the supervisory or managerial positions in the executive arm of government; the agents of law and order, for example, the police and prisons; quasi-legal agents, for example, and Ombudsman or an anti-corruption authority; the judiciary; the legislative; and other constitutionally established offices, for example, the Auditor-General Office.

There are various studies conducted in Tanzania concerning ethical practices among public servants, the study conducted by Mtahaba (2005) on corruption in Local Authorities in Tanzania revealed that as long as working conditions are not improved especially for primary school teachers, health workers, Ward executive officers, police officers and village executive officers, corruption will always persist. Therefore, this study has not stated explicitly other factors on non-compliance on Code of Ethics for public servants as the study confined itself on working condition.

In the same vein study conducted by Dye, (1990) on Petty corruption in health services in Dar es Salaam and Coastal region revealed that bureaucratic procedure in provision of health services if will not be addressed corruption will persist as health services provider use that procedure to solicit and take bribe. But this study has not stated clearly other causes of non-compliance of health workers on code of ethics and conduct for public service. However, this study did not state explicitly factors for dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conduct for public services as it confined itself to corruption as manifestation of unethical behavior that necessitate further study to explore other causes constituting to unethical practices in public sector

Therefore, this paper intends to examine the factors of dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conduct for Public Service. This study departs from the fore mentioned studies such as Choi (2023), and Boki, (2001), study conducted by and study mainly focused on examining unethical practices and corruption to public officials while Transparency International (2020) and focused on the effects of unethical practices on primary education and UNDP (2020) and Roberto (2018) focuses on the extent of unethical practices in developing countries and Scandinavian countries. Therefore, this paper examined the factors for unsatisfactory on codes of ethics and conducts in public service specifically at Ilala Municipality as they were not involved in studies by fore mentioned scholars.



### 3. Methodology

This section presents methods and procedures that were used in gathering information relevant to the study. It is this part that explains and covers research design, target population, sample size and sampling procedure, data collection methods and the reason as to why they are used according to research objectives and study questions. Furthermore, this section involves data gathering instruments, validation of instruments and data processing and analysis procedures.

The study was conducted at Kinondoni Municipal in Dar s salaam Region. Kinondoni Municipality is taken in this study because is one of the municipals in which studies on compliance of public servants on code of ethics has not been conducted while complaints from public on poor service delivery at this municipality are prevailing. For that matter, the area is very advantageous for the study so as to examine the causes of dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conduct for public service. This is because the public service sector including local governments carry high corruption risks for companies in Tanzania. Bureaucratic procedures for licenses and permits are burdensome, time-consuming and prone to corruption. Administrations suffer from a lack of resources and weak capacities, poorly trained staff and political interference.<sup>35</sup> Public officials are furthermore, poorly paid making them even more susceptible to corruption (BTI 2016). Indeed, gifts and other bribes are perceived to be widespread when applying for public utilities and permits.

In this study, the target population comprises government staff in selected Kinondoni Municipality. This study involved 80 respondents selected by using random sampling and purposive sampling techniques from different institutions. Their choice is based on the fact that each category of respondent has different insights, information and experiences related to unethical practice among the public servants. Thus, in each ward 40 respondents were selected from Kinondoni Municipal and other 40 respondents from citizens. This is because the researcher on her own judgment selected them accordingly as they pose some particularly and appropriate characteristics required for the study objective.

**Table 1: Sample Size and Composition**

<b>Respondent Categories</b>	<b>Name of Institutions</b>	<b>No. of Respondents</b>	<b>Sampling Techniques</b>
Kinondoni Municipal Staff	Kinondoni Municipal	40	Simple random sampling
Citizens from Kinondoni Municipality	Citizens from Kinondoni Municipality	40	Purposive sampling
<b>Total number of Respondents 80</b>			

Source: Field data, September 2024

#### 4.1 Data Collections Methods

. In this study where the main interest is to examine compliance of public servants on ethical code of conducts in-depth interviews were well suited, these methods will be further complemented by documentary review. The use of multiple methods was done intentionally because no single method is adequate in itself in collecting valid and reliable data on a particular problem.

In this paper semi structured interview was used. The advantage of using this method is that it conforms to the qualitative approach and facilitates the required level of interaction between the researcher and respondents. Secondary sources provide interpretation and analysis of primary sources. This paper used the necessary books, journals, relevant official reports, statistics, and records of relevant information concerning compliance of public servants on code of ethics.

Data collected from the field were analyzed using thematic analysis technique. This is the method used to analyze data from both qualitative researches. With the outcomes of understanding deeply the problems under investigation. Therefore, findings of the paper were subjected to both qualitative and statistical analysis with the application of Statistical Package for Social Sciences.

## **5. Presentation of the Findings and Discussions**

This sub-section presents the demographic characteristics of respondents and their influence on the findings of the paper.

### **Demographic Characteristics of the Respondent**

The characteristics of respondent are characterized in terms of demographic and social, where by demographic characteristics are based on age and social characteristics of respondent it based on gender and level of education. The study involved 80 respondents who were representing two categories namely; Kinondoni Municipal council staff 40 (50%), and Citizen from Kinondoni Municipal Council 40 (50%) who are Mtaa council members from three wards namely Sinza, Tandale and Kinondoni wards were 40 (50%) respondents.

#### **5.1 Age of Respondents**

The age pattern shows that 20 (25%) of respondents' age is between 35 and 44 years. The next age group forming 40(50%) is made up of respondents whose age is 45 and above years. The third age group forming 20 (25%) is made up of respondents whose age is between 25 and 34 years. The findings suggest that respondents aged from 35 and above were aware of public service code of ethics than younger respondents because most of aged respondents had undergone various capacity building training that have facilitated them to be aware of public service code of ethics so as to examine the causes of dismal compliance of public servant on the code of ethics. The study revealed that Kinondoni Municipal Council staff with the age of 18 and 24 years as well as 25 and 34 years of age had not attended even induction training when they were employed at Kinondoni Council, thus they are performing their duties using their own experience and by leaning organization culture only. All respondents were adults and were all able to provide down to earth experience of causes which hinder ethical practices by public servants at Kinondoni Municipal level.

#### **5.2 Gender of Respondents**

The study considered the gender of the respondents in order to establish between men and women who were aware on the existing of public service code of ethics and the causes which hinder ethical practices by public servants. These respondents differed in gender. In order to analyze the population involved in the study, respondents were categorized by their gender as 40(50%) were male and 40(50%) were female.

Due to these findings the bigger sample was drawn from both male and female respondents. The implication that one drawn from data is that a good number of men were equal in numbers to women who were public servants at Kinondoni Municipality. The study revealed that men and women were aware of causes of dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics and conduct for public service as it is indicated in the further pages.

### 5.3 Education of Respondents

It is believed that the level of education contributes a lot in making people aware of their profession ethics which are more related with code of ethics for public services. The more one is educated the higher the possibility of being competent in performing his or her duties which is one aspect of code of ethics for public service that is diligence. Education is crucial to improve performance, reducing poverty, improving general health, and enabling people to play their full part in their communities and nation by delivering services with integrity, accountability, loyalty, and respect of law and with proper use of official information. Table 2: shows various levels of education for respondents involved in the study.

**Table 2: Education of Respondents**

Education Category	Frequency	Percentage
Primary education	-	-
Secondary education	5	6.25
Diploma education	5	6.25
Bachelor Degree	40	50
Advanced Diploma/ 1 <sup>st</sup> Degree	10	12.5
Master's Degree/ Post Graduate Diploma	20	50
PhD	-	-
Total	<b>80</b>	<b>100</b>

**Source:** Field data, September, 2024

Data from Table 2 reveal that most public servants were involved as respondents in this study conducted at Kinondoni Municipal Council are educated where as 6.25% have secondary education, 6.25% of respondents have a diploma in education, 50% have bachelor degree or advanced diploma while 12.5% of respondents have either post graduate diploma or Master's degree. This suggests that most public servants are educated thus they are aware of their profession code of ethics as well as the causes of depressing code of ethics and conduct for public service. However, the study revealed that although 50% of the sample is graduate and 50% have post graduate diploma or Masters' degree yet still compliance of these public servants is dismal due to number of reasons such as low salaries in relation to cost of life, shortage working facilities, poor working environment, lack of nationality and moral decay of public servant as it is discussed further on exploring the causes hindering ethical practices in public services.

### 5.4 The factors which hinder ethical practices in public services

The first objective of this study was to explore the factors which hinder ethical practices in public service with reference to public servants in Kinondoni Municipal Council. The study had a total number of sixty (N=80) respondents who were interviewed and various causes were underscored which have accelerated to dismal compliance of public servants on Code of Ethics. In order to know the causes which, hinder ethical practices in public service at Ilala Municipal Council, the researcher started by asking respondents about the causes of unethical practices among public servants. A total of 80 respondents were interviewed in order to get their responses with regard to the causes of un-ethical practices in Kinondoni Municipal Council. The responses were as follows 20 (12.5%) respondents had the view that low incentives for supporting staff and officers in public service as when one assesses the salary in relation to the increasing cost of life it prompted one to demand the bribe from citizens who seek services.

In addition to that, the fore mentioned respondents had the view that the low incentives including low salary of some of Kinondoni Municipal council staff whereby the low cadre with certificate, their basic salary ranged from Tsh.300,00/= to 350,000/= while diploma holder to bachelor degree basic salary ranged from Tsh 400,000/= to 500,000/= where as the top cadre's basic salary ranged from Tsh.1200,000/= to 2,700,000/= and above. From the findings above, it shows that low cadre's salary is approximately seven times the salary of top cadre. The same range of salary are shown in the table 2.

Additionally, 40 respondents (50%) of all respondents (N=80) said that lack of motivation such as promotion, attending training, workshop and allowances were not based on merit system rather on favoritism, nepotism, religious discrimination, selfishness, and tribalism which discourage staff to perform their duties diligently. Moreover, these respondents revealed that apart from lack of motivation poor working condition and lack of working facilities were the causes which lead to dismal compliance on Code of Ethics as pursuit of excellence in service was not achieved as a result public servants were misusing official information for private gain.

On the other hand, responses from of all respondents (N=80) said that bad administration which was associated with lack of accountability of top management at Kinondoni Municipal Council, lack of training related to code of ethics, lack of patriotism of public servants in general and lack of enforcement of code of ethics and conduct at Kinondoni Municipal Council increased unethical practices, as the respondents argued that there is no strong punishment for those who breach code of ethics and the assumption that everyone at Kinondoni Council was unethical had deteriorated public servants' ethics.

In the same vein, 40 respondents (50%) of all respondents (N=80) said that other causes which lead to dismal compliance on code of ethics are corruption and political interference that is to say every department in Kinondoni Municipal Council is corrupt, when you are seeking services, you must provide a bribe. For example, when you go to a certain department to seek services, you need to provide things like lunch food so as to get such services. This, view is corroborated by the study conducted by <sup>35</sup> on corruption in Local Authorities in Tanzania revealed that as long as working conditions are not improved especially for primary school teachers, health workers, Ward executive officers, police officers and village executive officers, corruption will always persist. With respect to political interference, councilors and Member of Parliament in Kinondoni Municipal council are performing their duties without the limit of their jurisdiction. The above findings are shown in the table 3.

**Table 3: Motives for unethical practices**

S/N	Motive	Frequency	Percentage
1	Low Incentives	40	50
2	Conflict of Interest	20	25
3	Mal-administration	10	6.25
4	Corruption	10	6.25
<b>Total number of respondents</b>		<b>80</b>	<b>100</b>

**Source:** Field data, September, 2024

From the above responses, the researcher noted that the respondents had different understanding of various motives of unethical practices. For example, while some respondents mentioned low salary, others said that lack of motivation and incentives, bad administration, political interference and corruption. However, as it is shown in the table 3 above, many respondents (50%) viewed low incentives in relation to the increasing cost of life as the major cause of dismal compliance on code of ethics, while 6.25% of respondents considered conflict of interest associated with poor working condition and shortage of working facilities as the cause dismal compliance on code of ethics. Whereas 6.25% of respondents confined themselves on bad administration as a cause depressing ethical practices and 10% stated that political interference and corruption undermines ethical behavior in public service.

These findings were corroborated by compliance approach to ethics management emphasizes the importance of external controls on the behavior of public servants. It prefers formal and detailed rules and procedures, and ultimately aims at a situation in which the individual ethical choice is limited to choosing to follow the rules (the ethical thing to do) or to violate them by commission or omission (unethical acts). Typical instruments of this approach include legislation, strict behavioral ethics codes and other rules, extensive control mechanisms, and control institutions with extensive powers which are not stated by the fore mentioned theories.

Hence, this study indicates that incentive increase and improving motivation to staff as well good administration, minimization and prevention of corruption should be given first priority by Kinondoni Municipal Council Management and the Government at large. This view was supported by <sup>35</sup> who contends that revenue collected in Local Government Councils was not used to provide services as they were misused by unethical public officials for private gain resulting into low quality of service due to unethical practices.

Due to the number of causes of un ethical practices as stated above,40 (50%) of all respondents (N=80) said that they experiences un ethical practices in receiving services at Kinondoni Municipal Council, which included providing bribe, abusive language in service delivery, delay in service delivery, poor customer care, embezzlement, extravagant of funds and hiding personal files for staff and customers which record management assistants technically called "...sending the files to mortuary". While 20 respondents (25%) had not experience of unethical practices in receiving services at Kinondoni Municipal Council, whereas 20(25%) respondents did know anything about experiences of unethical practices in public service. In the same vein this view has been supported by Choi (2023) who argue that the government should have to consider the adequacy of resources in term of salary for staff, competitive staff and maintain staff skill.

### **5.5 Mechanisms to ensure effective Management of Public Service Institutions**

The next specific objective of the study was to assess the effectiveness the mechanisms put in place to ensure compliance on code of ethics and conduct for public services at Kinondoni Municipal Council.

Among 80 (100%) of the respondents who were interviewed, the responses were as follows 40 (50%) of respondents revealed that the mechanisms put in place at municipal level were signing attendance register in the morning aiming to enhance punctuality and minimize absenteeism at work place, having weekly and monthly meeting at the department level, filling PEPMIS as part of performance evaluation management and establishment of integrity committees while at national level the mechanisms established were establishment of President's Office-Ethics Secretariat which is independent government department entrusted with powers to monitor the conduct of public leaders stipulated in the

public leadership code of ethics Act No13 of 1995. Establishment of Prevention and Combating Corruption Bureau (PCCB) so as to prevent corruption in the public sector and private sector, establishment of the Commission for Human Rights and Good Governance with aim of protecting and promoting good governance and human rights and Ethics promotion department under the President’s Office-Public Service Management in which the department has responsibility of monitoring the conduct of public servants in all MDAs and LGAs while 40 (50%) did not know whether there is any mechanism put in place to ensure compliance on code of ethic at both municipal and national levels.

In assessing the effectiveness of the mechanisms put in place to ensure ethical practices, out of a total of 8(100%), 60 (75%) of respondents had the view that mechanism put in place at national and Kinondoni municipal levels were not effective due to conflict of interest whereby the public interest was overridden by their personal interests, inadequate financial resources, ineffective law, and lack of independence due to interference from politicians and other government departments. For instance, one respondent stated that “some of the integrity institutions are not independent as they receive directives from the politicians” (Interview, September, 2024). In the same vein this view was supported by Akim, (2022). arguing that little or no action in part of disciplinary authorities has always been fueling unethical activities among unscrupulous public servants. These findings give impression that laxity in taking legal action to those who violate ethical codes of conduct hinder compliance on ethical codes of conduct.

On the other hand, 20(25%) of respondents said that the mechanisms put in place were effective because various public servants were strongly punished due to the breach of code of ethics, the punishment included termination of job, demotion, and others were taken to the court of law. From the findings above, it is noted that majority of respondents (75%) had the view that mechanisms put in place to ensure compliances on ethical codes were not effective. The findings are summarized in Table 4.

**Table 4 Assessment of effectiveness of mechanisms to enhance ethical practices**

Effectiveness of mechanism put in place	Frequency	Percentage
Not effective	60	75
Effective	20	25
<b>Total</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>100</b>

Source: Field data, September, 2024

In that regard, there is an evident need to strengthen the institutions entrusted with powers to monitor the ethical conducts of public servants at municipal and national levels.

### **5.6 State of ethics and service delivery at Kinondoni Municipal Council**

Among the total of 80(100%) of respondents, 40(50%) had the view that to a large extent dismal compliance on code of ethics has resulted to low revenue collection due to corruption. This fact is further supported by <sup>36</sup> who argued that there is no doubt that corruption is rampant in all sectors of the economy, public services and politics in the country. There is evidence that even some officers of government organs vested with the responsibility of administration of Justice namely the Department of National Security, the Police, the Judiciary and the Anti-Corruption Bureau are themselves immersed in corruption.

Delay of social service provision unnecessarily had made citizens to lose confidence over the government, also incorrect reports on financial utilization were provided to the citizens, whereas 20(25%) said that unethical practices have increased deaths of the people due to negligence of medical practitioners, increase of citizens' dissatisfaction toward the general performance of the council and poor performance in education for example form four National examination result in the year 2012 revealed that half of respondents i.e 50% of form four student got division zero, while 20(25%) respondents said that there was increase of land disputes due to double allocation of plots and performance of various activities were below standards like road construction. The findings are summarized in Table 5.

**Table: 5. Effects of unethical practices on service delivery**

S/N	Effects of unethical practices on services delivery	Frequency	Percentage
1	Delay in social services provision and loss of confidence over the government	20	25
2	Poor performance in health, education, and other services	40	50
3	Disappointment of citizen with Government	20	25
4	Total No. of Responses	80	100

**Source:** Field data, September, 2024

From the findings above, it is noted that unethical practices have resulted into low revenue collection due to corruption and delay of social service provision, increase of deaths of the people due to medical practitioners 'shortage of working facilities and negligence as well as lose of the citizens' confidence over their government. Therefore, it is imperative to enhance and promote ethical practices in all government sectors in order to improve the wellbeing of the people and in long run to attain social economic development and restore confidence of citizens over the government.

### **5.7 Measures to be taken to increase ethical practices in public service**

The last specific objective of this study was to examine the measures to be taken to increase ethical practices in public service, the finding revealed that 20 (25%) respondents out of all respondents (N=80) reported that in order promote ethical practice, incentives of employees should be increased because public servants were forced to take bribe due to income poverty meaning having nothing in the pocket, provision of working facilities such as papers, printer, cartilage and car to facilitate officers like land officers and engineers who need to go to the field, and availability of electrical power can facilitates public servants to perform their duties diligently, additionally this group of respondents argued that improving working condition is an important aspects of encouraging staff to work effectively, as currently the offices are not conducive at Kinondoni Municipal Council the offices have poor ventilation.

On the other hand 40 (50%) respondents out of all respondents (N=80) had these to say, strengthening public institutions entrusted with powers to monitor the conduct of public servants (Watch dog institutions) such as Ethics promotion department under Presidents' Office Public Service Management, Presidents' Office Ethics Secretariat, as well as Presidents' Office, Prevention and Combating Corruption Bureau is among measures to promote ethical practices and compliance of public servants on code of

ethics, and to be accountable public servants who were proved to breach code of ethics is an important attribute in order to enhance ethical practice in public services. This has been corroborated Choi (2023) who argues that strong ethics institutions have to be supported at the highest levels of government if any ethics management strategies are to succeed. These findings corroborate with Transparency International (2017) who aptly found that more than 8,000 private-sector employees across 14 countries found that firms with a strong ethical culture outperformed in customer satisfaction, employee loyalty, innovation, adaptability, and growth compared with those operating in a weak ethical culture.

On top of that 20 (25%) respondents of all 80 respondents viewed that minimizing political interference from some of Members of Parliament and Councilors is among the measures to promote ethical practices in public service, Seminars and workshops concerning code of ethics should be provided to public servant and politicians so as to reduce unethical practices among public servants. Additionally, 20 respondents (25%) viewed provision of motivation and other incentives such as breakfast, lunch allowance and having computerized system of record keeping is among measures to be taken to enhance ethical practices as issues like hiding staff personal files and client files for private gain for example files of Land Certificate of Occupancy can be minimized.

However, including ethics subject in education curriculum so as ethics to be imparted to children from kindergarten school to university level is valuable thing in building future generation for socio- economic development. As it has viewed by <sup>39</sup> that formal training of ethics in educational institutions is essential in fostering ethical conduct in public sector and in the entire community.

Based on the findings the researcher gets the picture that improving salary and working condition strengthening watch dog institutions, minimizing political interference and provision of motivation and incentives like promotion when they deserve, lunch allowances and moral incentives like recognition were important in effective and efficient service delivery to the public.

Based on a review of the available literature and assessment of selected area of this study it is seen that compliance of public servants on code of ethics would be an effective tool of qualitative and quantitative service delivery in Tanzania government in all MDAs and LGAs as code of ethics instill discipline in the profession, ensure professionalism and integrity of its members, maintain public trust, and remind the old public servants on do and don'ts.

However, the findings of this study revealed that there were number of causes which hinder ethical practices in public service such as low salary, lack of motivation and incentives, bad administration, shortage of working facilities and political interference as well as corruption. The mechanisms put in place to enhance compliance of public servants on code of ethics were not effective due to lack of political will, lack of its independence, inadequate budget and ineffective laws. The effects of dismal compliance of public servants on code of ethics were low revenue collection, increase of death, and delay in services provision as well as lose of citizen confidence over the government, poor performance in education, increase of income poverty and increase of land disputes as well as disillusionment of citizens over government.

In the same vein, the suggested measures to enhance ethical practices and thus compliance on code of ethics by public servants were improving salary and working condition, strengthening watch dog institutions such as Ethics Secretariat, Prevention and Combating Corruption Bureau, as well as Ethics promotion department under Presidents Office Public Service Management. Similarly, minimizing political interference through civic education to politicians concerning the limit of their jurisdiction in



performing their duties, which should go hand in hand with provision of motivation and incentives to staff such as promotion, recognition and training as well as provision of strong punishment for public servants who breach code of ethics.

### **5.8 Conclusion and recommendations**

To conclude it can be said that the research general objective was to examine the compliance of public servants on code of ethics at Kinondoni Council. There were four specific objectives of the study which included, to explore the causes which hinder ethical practices in public service with reference to Kinondoni Council, to examine the mechanisms put in place to ensure compliance on code of ethics at Kinondoni Municipal Council, to examine the extent in which dismal compliance on code of ethics by public servants affects public service delivery at Kinondoni Municipal council and to examine the measures to be taken to increase ethical practice in public service.

For the case the factors which hinder ethical practices it is evident that low incentives compared to the increase cost of life is one aspect which depress ethical practices as according to response from respondents 50% viewed low incentives as hindrance of ethical practices, followed by lack of motivation and incentives, mal-administration associated with lack of accountability of top leaders, as well as political interference and corruption. On the other hand, mechanisms put in place to ensure compliance on code of ethics were found ineffective as 70% of respondents stated that there is little enforcement of code of ethics. The results of depressing code of ethics were low revenue collection as 52% of respondents stated that most of revenue collected were used for private gain other effects were citizens' disappointed by their government institutions, increase of death, poor performance in education and health services.

As un-ethical conduct was viewed as problem among public servants which need to be addressed. Measures recommended by interviewees were to increase incentives, provision of working facilities and improve working facilities, strengthening public institutions entrusted with powers to monitor the conduct of public servants which should go hand in hand with strong punishment for those who were proved to breach the code of ethics, minimizing political interference from politicians and provision of motivation and other incentives to public. The researcher, after conducting the research on ethics management for public service institutions would like to recommend further research to be conducted on the effectiveness of watch dog institutions in Tanzania.

### **References**

- Armstrong, M. (2005). *A Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice* (9th ed.). International Students Edition. London: Kogan Page.
- Bangser, M. and Mamdani, M. (2004). *Poor peoples' experiences of health service in Tanzania: Literature review: Reproductive Health Matters*.
- Bok, D, (2001). *The Trouble with Government*. Boston: Harvard University Press. Pope, J. (2005). *Observations Concerning Comparative Administrative Ethics in Europe and the U.S.*' Paper presented at the Ethics and Integrity of Governance: The First Transatlantic Dialogue, Leuven, Belgium, 2-5 June.
- Bossaert, D. and Demmke , C. (2005). *Main Challenges in the Field of Ethics and Integrity in the EU Member States*. Maastricht, the Netherlands: European Institute of Public Administration.

- Choi W.J. (2023). *Ethics Management in Public Sector: Implication for Performance and Productivity*: Asia Productivity Organization, Asia Productivity Organization.
- Dye, M. & Staphenurst, R. (1997). *Pillars of Integrity: The Importance of Supreme Audit Institutions in Curbing Corruption* Kenneth. The Economic Development Institute of the World Bank 1998.
- Fox, C. J. (2021). *The Use of Philosophy in Administrative Ethics.*” In *Handbook of Administrative Ethics*. New York.
- Hood, C. and Michael J. (1991). *Administrative Argument*. Aldershot, UK.
- Maesschalck, J. (2024). Ethics management. In de Sousa, L. & Coroadá, S. *Elgar Encyclopaedia of Corruption and Society* (pp. 92-98). Edward Elgar Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781803925806.ch20>.
- OECD (2000). *Economic Studies*, OECD Economic Studies No. 30, 2000/I.
- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) (1996). *Ethics in the Public Service: Current Issues and Practices*. Paris.
- Osborne, D. and Gaebler, T. (1992). *Reinventing Government: How the Entrepreneurial Spirit is Transforming the Public Sector*. Reading, MA; Addison-Wesley.
- Palidauskaite, J. (2006). ‘Codes of Ethics in Transitional Democracies: A Comparative Perspective.’ *Public Integrity* 8:35-48.
- Pollitt, C, and Bouckaert, G.(2000). *Public Management Reform: Comparative Analysis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mwaijande, F. (2022). *The United Republic of Tanzania President’s Office Public Service Management and Good Governance Integrity Survey Report In Tanzania Public Service, 2022*.
- United Republic Tanzania (URT) (2012). *Population and Housing Census*. National Bureau of Statistics. Dar es Salaam.
- Transparency International, (TI) (2017). *Report on Corruption*, New York.
- United Republic of Tanzania (URT) (2005). *The Code of Ethics and Conduct for Public Servants of 2005*.
- Lamerck, W.(2024). *New Public Management Reforms, Ethics Training Programs, and Ethical Conduct of Public Servants in Tanzania in Empowering Public Administrators* Imprint Routledge eBook ISBN9781032651835.
- Global Business Ethics Survey (2023). *The State of Ethics & Compliance in the Workplace*.
- Transparency International (2023). *Corruption Perceptions Index: Weakening Justice Systems Leave Corruption Unchecked*.

- Akim, A (2022). Public Expenditure Review of the Health Sector (2015–2018), Primary Health Care. REPOA, Dar es Salaam. <https://www.repoa.or.tz/?publication=public-expenditurereview-of-the-health-sector-2015-2018-primary-health-care>.
- Mutahaba, G. (2005). *Pay reform and corruption in Tanzania's public service*. Dar es Salaam.
- Kilimwiko, L. (2019). In Tanzania, Local Structures in the Countryside Are Empowered for the Fight against Corruption. D+C Development and Cooperation.
- Transparency International (2023), Report on Corruption, 2023.
- Global Integrity (GI). (2016). Africa Integrity Indicators - Tanzania 2016.
- Fjelstad, H, O. (2003). *New Challenges for Local Government Revenue Enhancement, Formative process research on local government Reform in Tanzania*, Dar es Salaam, REPOA (Project Brief No. 2; 2003).
- OECD. (2017). OECD Integrity Review of Peru: Enhancing Public Sector Integrity for Inclusive Growth. In OECD Public Governance Reviews. [https://www.oecdilibrary.org/governance/oecd-integrity-review-of-peru\\_9789264271029-en](https://www.oecdilibrary.org/governance/oecd-integrity-review-of-peru_9789264271029-en) accessed 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2024.
- Ngware, S. (2005). *Report on Corruption in Local government authorities Tanzania*.
- Gilman, C. S. (2005). *Ethics codes and Code of Conduct as tool for promoting an Ethical Professionals Public Service: Comparative success and Lessons*. Washington DC.
- Hejka-E. (1994). "Ethics in In-service Training." In *Handbook of Administrative Ethics*, edited by Terry L. Cooper, P. New York.
- Bawole, J. N. and Sakyi, E.K. (2009). 'Challenges in implementing code of conduct within the public sector in Anglophone West African countries: Perspectives from public managers, *Journal of public administration and policy research* Vol. 1(4) pp. 068-078.
- Liddle, J.(2009). *Implementation, communication and benefits of public sector codes of ethics*. Sweden.
- Finegan, J. (1994). The Impact of Personal Values on Judgments of Ethical Behaviour in the Workplace. *Journal of Business Ethics* Vol. 13, No. 9 (Sep., 1994), pp. 747-755 (9 pages).
- Transparent International (2023). Annual Report 2023.
- United Republic of Tanzania (2023). National Anti- Corruption Strategy and Action Plan Phase Four (NACSAP IV) 2023-2030. President's Office State House Dodoma, Tanzania.
- Sikika (2010). Petty Corruption in the Health Service. Sikika.
- OECD. (2017). OECD Integrity Review of Peru: Enhancing Public Sector Integrity for Inclusive Growth. In OECD Public Governance Reviews. [https://www.oecdilibrary.org/governance/oecd-integrity-review-of-peru\\_9789264271029-en](https://www.oecdilibrary.org/governance/oecd-integrity-review-of-peru_9789264271029-en) accessed 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2024.
- Roberto Martínez B. Kukutschka (2018). Anti-Corruption in The Commonwealth, Transparency International.

United Nation (UN) (2021). The Sustainable Development Report,2021, United Nations.