

Non-Financial Incentives and Performance of Teaching Hospitals in Enugu State Nigeria

Uchechukwu, Chinedum Bonaventure¹,

chinedumuchechukwu@gmail.com

Ezeodili Walter²

Ezeodiliwalter2006@yahoo.com

Eneh Maximus Ikenna³

maximus.eneh@esut.edu.ng

^{1,2,3} Department of Public Administration, Enugu State University of Science and Technology Enugu Nigeria

<i>Abstract</i>	<i>Journal of Policy and Development Studies (JPDS)</i>
<p><i>This study examined non-financial incentives and performance of teaching hospitals in Enugu State.. The study adopted survey design. The population consists of junior, senior and management staff of both teaching hospitals, numbering 1813, out of which 328 were sampled for the study. A structured questionnaire were used for data collection. Simple percentage rating were used for analysing the data while simple regression technique were used for testing the hypotheses. It was revealed, among other things that staff development and training have significant positive effect on workers' efficiency; that provision of working tools and equipment have significant positive effect on patients' satisfaction; and that issuance of honorary awards and recognition have significant positive effect on worker's attitude. In its recommendation, the study submitted that since teaching hospitals double as health and educational institutions, they should provide professional development programmes for in-house staff. Furthermore, since they are public service institutions, the government should do well to provide modern innovative working tools to help staff members update their on-the-job skills and boost patients' confidence on the quality of healthcare services rendered in these institutions.</i></p>	<p>Vol. 15. Issue 2 (2024) ISSN(p) 0189-5958 ISSN (e) 2814-1091 Home page https://www.ajol.info/index.php/jpds</p> <p>ARTICLE INFO: Keyword: <i>Non-financial incentives, Performance, Staff training and Development</i></p> <p>Article History <i>Received 5th March, 2024</i> <i>Accepted: 5th Mayl, 2024</i></p> <p>DOI: https://dx.doi.org/10.4314/jpds.v15i2.11</p>

1. Introduction

People work for a wide variety of reasons. Some want money, some want challenge, and some want security. The things that each unique individual in organization decides that he or she wants from

work plays an instrumental role in determining motivation to work (Mbah, 2009). On the other side, the staff member has to be retained in an organization because of various reasons because among other things: long serving employees in an organization gain experience and thus improve on their efficiency, costs of training and workshops are reduced, time wastage is minimized because of employees' experience. This has made it imperative for the management of an organization to guarantee that employees are retained, and the turnover is reduced (Orga, Mbah and Ekechukwu, 2018).

Motivation represents one of the largest competitive reserves and a key element for increasing competitive advantage of any organization. It is a central force and strong factor in employee performance. It is the energizing force that induces or compels and maintains behaviour (Mbah, 2009). It is not easy to motivate an individual, for the success of any motivational effort depends on the extent to which the motivator meets the needs of the individual employees for whom it is intended. Motivation is an internal psychological process whose presence or absence is inferred from observed performance (Eze, 2012). Putting it succinctly, motivation is anything that stimulates people to act or achieve in a better way any stated objective.

Broadly speaking, motivation is implemented in the form of financial incentives and non-financial incentives (Syukra, 2014). Though financial reward or incentive is very important and most obvious in the motivation of workers, it is not the only incentive used to achieve maximum results. Other incentives, which are non-financial have significant role to play as well. Expanding on this point, Orga, Mbah, & Ekechukwu (2018) stated that motivation is not just restricted to physical or tangible things like money but extends to intangible things such as psychological factors. They further explained that what motivates is also affected by the situation, the inner drives, the needs, and objectives or goals of people. Ezewuzie (2008) submitted that money is no longer the exclusive motivator it was formerly believed to be. The job itself must be appealing for the individual to make up a type of reward. One has to get the satisfaction that the job itself is good enough for him or her. Other non-monetary incentives such as price, job promotion, upgrading and advancement, job security and recognition may go a long way to advance the confidence of workers (Uzochukwu, Onwujekwe and Ezumah, 2014).

So if the rewards (financial or non-financial) are attractive and linked to performance, people are motivated to take action. The intended effort is expected to turn into actual effort when people believe their hard work will result in a good reward. Many still ignore that fact that no organization can survive without its workers, and the workers themselves cannot be productive if their needs are not met. Nnadi (2010) posits that managers motivate employees for them to put in their best in the production process and the attainment of organizational goals adding that employees are motivated according to their commitment to the organization. Managers of an organization motivate their workers to enable them to exhibit their potential skills and ability effectively for the achievement of the organizational goal and some of the things they do to motivate their workforce is by providing their psychological, social, love, esteem and self-actualization needs (Eboh, 2013). This is even more imperative for the health sector, which caters for health need of the people. It is against this backdrop that this study sought to investigate the relationship between non-financial incentives and performance of teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Every organization's existence is tied to performance of its employees. Non performance will definitely lead to folding up of the organization. To ensure maximum contribution of employees,

management must ensure adequate incentives. Incentives however must not be financial especially if the organization is already giving the employees enough financial packages. Non-financial incentive may include modern working tools that simplify work, awards at different occasions, verbal appreciations and recognitions etc. Any organization involved in this style of leadership and management usually has high performance of employees as outcome.

However, in our public organizations, this management strategy rarely occurs. What we witness is negligence of staff to the extent that both financial and non-financial incentives are not available as rewards that could propel performance. This usually leads to frustration of employees and most times to industrial actions. Public hospitals in Nigeria are in this quagmire also.

The incessant strike actions of the health workers in Nigeria in recent years are often tied to poor working tools and inadequate staff training/development among other issues. They often argue that inadequate and obsolete equipment in Nigerian hospitals had over the years contributed to the exodus of Nigerian doctors and other health personnel abroad in search of better opportunities with state of the art medical equipment. These medical personnel constantly demand for better working conditions yet, their demands remain unmet. With these demands unmet, workers' productivity will continue to be minimal; hence high level performance will continue to elude the teaching hospitals and all other public sector organizations. This is the worry that prompted this study.

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The broad objective of this study was to examine non-financial incentives and performance of teaching hospitals in Enugu State. However, the specific objectives were to:

- (i) Determine the extent to which staff development and training affect workers efficiency in teaching hospitals in Enugu State.
- (ii) Evaluate the extent to which the provisions of working tools affect patients' satisfaction in teaching hospitals in Enugu State.
- (iii) Assess the extent to which the issuance of honorary award and recognition affect workers attitude to work in teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

1.4 Research Questions

The following questions guided this study

- (i) To what extent do staff development and training affect workers efficiency in teaching hospitals in Enugu State?
- (ii) To what extent does provision of working tools affect patients' satisfaction in teaching hospitals in Enugu State?
- (iii) To what extent do issuance of honorary award and recognition affect workers attitude to work in teaching hospitals in Enugu State?

2. Review of Related Literature

2.1 Conceptual Review

2.1.1 Non-Financial Incentives

Orga, Mbah & Ekechukwu (2018) describe non-financial rewards as compensation given in a transaction which does not involve cash. A non-monetary reward can consist of almost any material object such as jewellery, precious metals or an automobile for example. In business, a non-monetary

reward can also be a service such as improvements made on a property or repairs done on a car (Business Dictionary, 2018).

In employment, it is a reward to an employee other than extra pay. Many non-financial rewards are bonuses such as company cars, free private medical care, and free pension entitlement. However, an employee may be rewarded, for example, by being given a better office or a bigger budget to control, or by being given the choice of where to take a posting in a company. Non-financial rewards can be very cost effective for companies because, in contrast with a pay increase, little or no income tax or national insurance contributions are paid.

Non-financial incentive programmes and reward programmes structured to motivate positive behaviour change through means other than money motivate and retain employees; a motivated employee will achieve a great deal. A demotivated employee will be slow, horizontal to error and not likely to achieve. Non-financial reward helps to build feelings of confidence and satisfaction in employees and can be very important for their long-term effect (Armstrong, and Brown, 2016).

Eze (2012) posit that non-monetary rewards are more varied and unique than monetary rewards and other major advantages. They help meet employees' needs for recognition, growth and responsibility and most can be relatively inexpensive. In the organization, non-monetary rewards range from small merchandise rewards to certificates of appreciation. The technical requirements are equally varied, ranging from rewards with no documentation (certificates of appreciation) to rewards requiring management's signature (external rewards) before being submitted to the employees (Eze, 2012).

2.1.2 Performance

Performance, especially in public sector organisations, is often measured in terms of productivity. Productivity describes various measures of the efficiency of production (Orga, Mbah&Ekechukwu, 2018). A productivity measure is expressed as the ratio of output to inputs used in a production process, i.e., output per unit of input. Productivity is a crucial factor in the production performance of firms and nations. Increasing national productivity can raise living standards because more real income improves people's ability to purchase goods and services, enjoy leisure, improve housing and education and make businesses to be more profitable. There are many different definitions of output, and the choice among them depends on the purpose of the productivity measurement and/or data availability (Abramovitz, 2016).

To say that the most important asset of an organization is its human resources has become almost a cliché. In the same vein, the importance of employee performance to the growth of an organization can hardly be overstated. Organization go extra length to ensure that they recruit and retain employees who are expected to perform according to, or exceed predetermined standards. Consequently, finding means and ways of improving worker performance has emerged as a major preoccupation of managers in organizations.

2.1.3 Staff Development & Training

Staff development refers to the institutional policies, programs and activities that facilitate and support staff in acquiring the skills, knowledge and attitudes required to undertake current and future responsibilities and roles in ways that are considered with the goals of the organization. Staff development can also be seen as a process that assists individuals in an agency or organization in attaining new skills and knowledge, gaining increasing levels of competence and growing professionally (Eze, 2012).

Training and development is a function within Human Resources management used to fulfil the gaps between current and expected performance (Rodriguez & Walters, 2017). Training is planned and systematic activities which are focused on enhancing the level of skills, knowledge, and competency (Nassazi, 2013). It is the process of conveying essential skills, programmed behaviour, so individuals become aware of rules and procedures to guide their own behaviour to accomplish their job effectively. Training is focused on improving the skills necessary for accomplishing organizational goals since it expands the efficiency of individuals, groups, and organizations (Jehanzeb& Bashir, 2013). Although the concept of development can be seen as training, gaining new abilities and skills for personal growth, it may also be seen as a broader concept. It may be seen as the holistic, long-term growth of individuals in order to perform future roles and responsibilities (Nassazi, 2013).

According to Uzochukwu, Onwujekwe & Ezumah (2014), staff development can be defined as the process of providing opportunities for employees to improve their knowledge, skills and performance in line with the goals and values of the organization and in relation to the interest and needs of the employees.

2.1.4 Working Tools & Equipment

“You’re only as good as the tools you use” is a saying that has been around for many years and highlights the importance of using the correct tool for the job. Consequently, it means that employees are only as good as the tools that they use. What does the term “tools” mean? It is the devices, equipment, mechanisms, resources, applications — anything that is utilized during the job to assist you in completing organizational task (Mahmood, Otto, Shevtshenko&Karaulova, 2016).

There are thousands of tools out there. The challenge for managers is to find the right ones to implement in the workplace to aid their employees. Whether physical equipment that is needed to perform a task or different applications to facilitate processes at work, it is important for your business to have the correct tools available for your employees to do their work effectively. Let us examine two prominent categories of tools often used in organizations:

The first kind of tool is the physical device that employees directly use to complete a task correctly. This can include carpentry equipment, scientific instruments, paintbrushes, syringes, CTR scanner, etc. They are so important, in fact, that oftentimes a job can’t be done correctly without them. Having the right tool is imperative to successful completion of the task at hand. In addition, the right tools allow employees to complete their task efficiently, which afford employees opportunities to expand their range of capabilities (Mahmood *et al.*, 2016).

The second kind of tool expedites processes at work. These might not be necessary to complete a task but are just as important to the business endeavour. There are many applications and services out there that can be implemented into the workplace that do things like facilitate communication between employees, assist them in keeping their tasks organized, and store their shared documents and resources. Tools like this help take care of internal things that don’t directly affect production so that more time and brainpower can be spent focusing in the things that matter most to the business (Wang, Wang, Chiu, Liou& Yang, 2015).

2.1.5 Honorary Award (Employee Recognition)

Employee recognition has been identified to be a strong motivational tool that enriches employees’ energies towards the accomplishment of organisational goals and objectives (Imran, Ahmad, Nisar&

Ahmad, 2014) and also have significant positive relationship with employee performance (Rahim &Daud, 2013).

Employee recognition, according to Harrison (2005), involves the timely, informal and/or formal acknowledgement of a person's behavior, effort or business result that supports the organization's goals and values, and which clearly has been beyond normal expectations. Recognition has been held to be a constructive response and a judgment made about a person's contribution, reflecting not just work performance but also personal dedication and engagement on a regular or ad hoc basis, and expressed formally or informally, individually or collectively, privately or publicly, and monetarily or non-monetarily (Brun & Dugas, 2008). As rightly stated by (Nyakundi, Karanja, Charles & Bisobori, 2012) the aim of employee recognition is to allow individuals to know and understand that their work is valued and appreciated, provides a sense of ownership and belongingness, improves morale, enhances loyalty and increases employee retention rate in the organization.

With organisation success tied to the performance of employees, recognition is now globally more relevant and embraced in organizations determined to succeed in an economically competitive era (Nyakundi, Karanja, Charles & Bisobori, 2012) and its extensive scope presents varied options for use (Sonawane, 2008). Maritz Institute (2011) has pointed out that recognition encompasses a variety of practices and experiences that expand and enrich employee capabilities. Brun and Dugas (2008) in their scientific literature have identified four approaches to employee recognition expressed in the form of personal recognition, recognition of work practices, recognition of job dedication and recognition of results.

2.2 Theoretical Framework

This work is anchored on multiple interacting factors theory. The theory was propounded by Sutermeister in 1969. The theory argued that there is no way motivation and performance can be realized by a single factor. Other factors include physical, material reward, socio-economic or physiological factors or forces. A university authority or any superior officer who combines effectively the economic, physical, social and psychological factors appropriately in the task of motivation and performance would definitely achieve maximal results. It is on the strength of this that Sutermeister (1969) observed that affective motivation is considered to result from the interacting forces in the socioeconomic conditions of the job or the job's environmental, physical and individual needs.

Therefore, motivation and performance in the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital (UNTH) and Enugu State University of Science and Technology Teaching Hospital, park lane is shaped, determined and conditioned by physical, socio-economic and psychological conditions which the hospitals' authorities must identify, control and effectively used to boost motivation and performance of their staff effectively and efficiently. This would go a long way in reducing frustration, alienation, turnover, absenteeism, etc. in the staff of the hospitals.

2.3 Empirical Review

2.3.1 Staff Development and training and workers efficiency.

Eze (2020) conducted a study on the role of reward management in organizational performance with special reference to University of Nigeria Nsukka in Enugu State. The study used the survey research method. The findings of the study include that; there is a significant relationship between monetary rewards and employees performance among University of Nigeria Nsukka Staff and that

there is a significant relationship between non-monetary rewards and employees performance among staff in University of Nigeria Nsukka..

Ren and Thomas (2021) studied firms' sickness costs and workers' sickness absences. In many countries, social security insured firms against their workers' sickness absences. They applied a regression discontinuity design to estimate the differences in the incidences and durations of sicknesses for firms that faced the deductible and those who did not. They found that the deductible did not lead to different sickness outcomes and concluded that relatively low deductibles had little impact on firms' management of sicknesses.

Mohammad, Indra, and Abu (2021) carried out a study on the relationship between motivational factors and job performance of employees in Malaysian Service Industry. A correlation research design was used in the study. Finding of the research was that intrinsic motivational factors were considered more important compared to extrinsic motivational factors such as payment, job security, and friendly environment.

2.3.2 Provision of Working Tools and Patients' Satisfaction

Orga, Mbah and Ekechukwu (2018) conducted a study on the effect of non-financial rewards on staff productivity in Shoprite Company Enugu. The study sought to determine the relationship between medical benefits and level of absenteeism; the relationship between having relaxation areas and volume of output. Two hypotheses were tested using F-statistic. It was found that the relationship between medical benefits and the level of absenteeism was significantly high, hence $F(95, n = 275) = 1046.270$. The relationship between having relaxation areas and volume of output was significantly high, hence $F(95, n=275) = 1345.096, p < 0.05$. It was concluded that non-financial reward impacted on staff productivity, and commitment to the task.

Syukra (2020) examined the relationship between training, compensation and employment promotion with labour productivity of employees in the public health centre. The research design used in the study was descriptive and analytical with a cross sectional study. Data analysis was bivariate analysis using the Chi-Square test and the degree of confidence (CI) 95 percent ($\alpha = 0.05$). The research showed that there was a significant association between the employment promotions with labour productivity.

Alabi, Olonade, Omotoye and Odebode (2022) investigated Non-Financial Rewards and Employee Performance in Money Deposit Banks in Lagos State, Nigeria. This study adopted a cross-sectional design. The formulated hypotheses were tested with Pearson Correlation. The findings reveal that all the dimensions of non-financial reward significantly affect employee performance among the selected financial institutions at a 0.05 level of significance. Thus, the study concludes that non-financial rewards significantly impact employees' organisational performance.

2.3.3 Issuance of Honorary Award and Recognition and Workers Attitude

Oleribe, Udofia, Oladipo, Ishola and Taylor-Robinson (2018) conducted a study on Healthcare workers' industrial action in Nigeria: a cross-sectional survey of Nigerian physicians. Data were analysed using SPSS version 23. Poor staff welfare, salary and leadership/management and governmental inability to implement agreements were the common causes of healthcare worker strikes in this study.

Egwuonwu (2023) conducted a study on the influence of favouritism as non-financial incentives on employee performance. A thematic analysis was employed to interpret and summarize the

qualitative data. Findings of the study show that favouritism is prevalent in the Nigerian banking industry and arises from factors such as nepotism, cronyism, tribalism, gender, religion, and performance. The findings show that favouritism can be regarded as a non-financial incentive which acts as an extrinsic motivator for employee performance.

In another study, Oluwakemi (2022) investigated the effect of non-financial incentives on employees' performance in an organization. A survey method was adopted. A closed and open-ended questionnaire was used for data collection. The data were analyzed with the use of quantitative (descriptive statistics) and qualitative techniques (methodology). The research result shows that job promotion element needs to be improved; also there is space to improve job promotion. There is also space to improve job promotion elements.

Ibok (2020) conducted a study on the effect of teacher motivation on students' performance in Biology in Calabar Municipality. Three research questions were raised, and three research hypotheses were also formulated. The research design adopted for this study was survey. Each of the hypotheses was tested at 0.05 level of significance. The results obtained from the analysis revealed relationship between the conditions of service and students' academic performance in Biology, relationship between regular promotion, regular payment of salary and students' academic performance in Biology.

3. Methodology

3.1 Research Design

For the purpose of this study, survey research design was adopted. This method allowed for the careful collection of data from targeted subjects. The study was conducted using staff of UNTH, Ituku/Ozalla and ESUT Teaching Hospital, Park lane, Enugu. It comprises of one thousand two hundred and twenty-three (1223) workers in UNTH and five hundred and ninety (590) workers in ESUT teaching hospital. Therefore the population of the study is one thousand eight hundred and thirteen (1813).

3.2 Sample Size determination

Since the population of the study is large, the researcher shall decide to take a sample believing it would be a fair representation of the population. This shall be achieved using Taro Yamani's formula as given below:

$$n = \frac{N}{1+N(e)^2}$$

Where

n = the desired sample size

N = population

e = Maximum acceptable level of error

The researcher assumed a 5% level of tolerable error hence the sample size shall be determined as shown below:

Substituting N = 1813

e = 0.05

Using the formula

$$n = \frac{N}{1+N(e)^2}$$

$$n = \frac{1813}{1+1813(0.05)^2}$$

$$n = \frac{1813}{1+4.5325}$$

$$n = \frac{1813}{5.5325} = 327.69995 \approx 328$$

3.3 Stratified Sampling

To be able to allocate copies of questionnaire proportionally to each stratum, the Kumar proportional allocation formula was used and is shown below:

$$nh = \frac{nNh}{N}$$

Where n = Sample size

Nh = Population of each stratum

N = Total population

UNTH Staff

$$\frac{1223 \times 328}{1813} = \frac{401144}{1813} = 221$$

ESUT Teaching Hospital Staff

$$\frac{590 \times 328}{1813} = \frac{193520}{1813} = 107$$

$$\therefore 221 + 107 = 328$$

3.4 Instrument for Data Collection

The instrument for data collection in this research is a structured questionnaire. The questionnaire has two parts. All the questions in part A provides general information about the respondents while the remaining questions in part B address the research questions. Five-point Likert scale format was used. There are 15 questions in the questionnaire. The organizational processes were observed in the teaching hospitals by the researcher.

3.5 Validation of the Instrument

In order to ensure the validity of the instrument, the drafted copies of the questionnaire will be presented to two experts for face validation. The experts are one lecturer from the Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management Sciences, ESUT and another from Department of Management in the University of Nigeria, Enugu Campus. Their corrections and suggestions were used to modify the final questionnaire that was used for the study.

3.6 Reliability of Instrument

To ascertain that the instrument is reliable, test-re-test method was adopted in which 15 copies of the questionnaire were distributed to ten staff from the sample size in order to check and ensure that no irrelevant question was included. The data obtained from the respondents were subjected to reliability test using Spearman's rank correlation technique and the result gave a value $r^1=0.85$ indicating that the instrument is reliable.

3.7 Method of Data Analysis

The overall data collected will be presented in tables corresponding values expressed in percentages. Hypotheses 1 and 2 were tested using Product Moment Correlation technique while hypotheses 3

and 4 were tested using simple regression approach. All the hypotheses were tested at 5% level of significance.

4. Data Presentation and Analysis

4.1 Data Analysis

Research Question One:

To what extent do staff development and training affect workers efficiency in teaching hospitals in Enugu State?

Table 4.1: Responses on the extent staff development and training affect workers efficiency at the teaching hospitals

S/N	Responses	Very Great Extent		Great Extent		Undecided		Little Extent		Very Little Extent		Total	
		F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%
1.	Initiating subsequent training for staff after employment raises their prospects in the job	104	32.5	96	30.0	66	20.6	34	10.6	20	6.3	320	100
2.	Organizing or making staff attend seminars and conferences expose them to latest development in their field	159	49.7	119	37.2	11	3.4	15	4.7	16	5.0	320	100
3.	Encouraging or making medical personnel attend workshops and other similar functions keep them in tune with prevailing best medical practices	103	32.2	149	46.6	28	8.8	22	6.9	18	5.6	320	100
4.	Refresher courses sharpen staff medical skills	117	36.6	74	23.1	34	10.6	58	18.1	37	11.6	320	100
5.	Making provisions for medical excursion to centres with sophisticated facilities and experienced/renowned personnel significantly broadens staff's horizon and their efficiency	101	31.6	82	25.6	36	11.3	61	19.1	40	12.5	320	100

Source: Field Survey, 2023

Table 4.1 shows that in all items 1-5, greater majority of the respondents to a great extent accepted staff development and training positively affect staff efficiency.

Research Question Two:

To what extent does provision of working tools affect patients' satisfaction in teaching hospitals in Enugu State?

Table 4.2: Responses on the extent provision of working tools affect patients' satisfaction at the teaching hospitals

S/N	Responses	Very Great Extent		Great Extent		Undecided		Little Extent		Very Little Extent		Total	
		F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%
6.	The supply of adequate hospital bed makes the admitted patients comfortable	103	32.2	82	25.6	36	11.3	56	17.5	43	13.4	320	100

7.	Provision of medical facilities like stethoscope, BP and sugar level testers, thermometers and other simple tools enable doctors conduct quick diagnoses for patients	104	32.5	96	30.0	66	20.6	34	10.6	20	6.3	320	100
8.	Adequate supply of laboratory specimen and apparatus aids quick determination of patients' illnesses	102	31.9	85	26.6	34	10.6	53	16.6	46	14.4	320	100
9.	Supply of record books, pens and other stationeries aid the work of administrative staff for timely admission of patients	148	46.3	112	35.0	12	3.8	26	8.1	22	6.9	320	100
10.	Acquisition and maintenance of ambulance and emergency wards improves the hospital's readiness to handle patients with emergency cases	146	45.6	109	34.1	14	4.4	28	8.8	23	7.2	320	100

Source: Field Survey, 2023

From Table 4.2 it can be seen that majority of the respondents agreed that to a great extent provision of working tools affect patients' satisfaction.

Research Question 3

To what extent do issuance of honorary award and recognition affect workers attitude to work in teaching hospitals in Enugu State?

Table 4.3: Responses on the extent issuance of honorary award and recognition tools affect patients' satisfaction at the teaching hospitals

S/N	Responses	Very Great Extent		Great Extent		Undecided		Little Extent		Very Little Extent		Total	
		F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%	F	%
11.	Acknowledging doctors/nurses or laboratory staff for job well done encourages them to do more	103	32.2	82	25.6	36	11.3	56	17.5	43	13.4	320	100
12.	Organizing merits awards to recognize workers for special contributions makes them to be more dedicated to their job	104	32.5	96	30.0	66	20.6	34	10.6	20	6.3	320	100
13.	Awarding staff with merit awards at states and national level guarantees their positive attitude towards work	102	31.9	85	26.6	34	10.6	53	16.6	46	14.4	320	100
14.	Using demotion as deterrent and corrective measure discourages any prospective misconduct	148	46.3	112	35.0	12	3.8	26	8.1	22	6.9	320	100
15.	Providing honorary award for deserving staff stimulates non-performing staff to do better	146	45.6	109	34.1	14	4.4	28	8.8	23	7.2	320	100

Source: Field Survey, 2023

From Table 4.3 it can be seen that majority of our respondents agreed that to a great extent, issuance of honorary awards and recognition positively affects patients' satisfaction.

4.2 Test of Hypotheses

Hypothesis One

Ha:1 Staff development and training have significant effect on workers' efficiency in teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

Data from table 4.1 was used to test this hypothesis

Table 4.4: Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics				
					R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change
1	.383 ^a	.146	.144	1.092	.146	52.861	1	388	.001

a. Predictors: (Constant), item 5

Source: Researcher's Computation using SPSS.

Table 4.5: ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	63.078	1	63.078	52.861	.001 ^b
	Residual	367.531	388	1.193		
	Total	430.609	389			

a. Dependent Variable: item 4

b. Predictors: (Constant), item 5

Source: Researcher's Computation using SPSS.

Interpretation and Decision

The above table presents the summary of F-test analysis. The F-test analysis shows that the calculated p-value of the regression is .001, which is less than 0.05 ($p=0.001 < 0.05$) at 388 degree of freedom. Therefore, we conclude that staff development and training have significant positive effect on workers' efficiency in the two teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

Hypothesis Two

Ha:2 Provision of working tools and equipment have significant effect on patients' satisfaction in teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

Data from table 4.2 was used for this hypothesis

Table 4.5: Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics				
					R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change
1	.438 ^a	.192	.189	1.019	.192	73.107	1	388	.032

a. Predictors: (Constant), item 5

Source: Researcher's Computation using SPSS.

Table 4.7: ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	75.927	1	75.927	73.107	.032 ^b
	Residual	319.882	388	1.039		
	Total	395.809	389			

a. Dependent Variable: item 4

b. Predictors: (Constant), item 5
 Source: Researcher’s Computation using SPSS.

Interpretation and Decision

The above table presents the summary of F-test analysis. The F-test analysis shows that the calculated p-value of the regression is .032, which is less than 0.05 ($P=0.032<0.05$) at 388 degree of freedom. Since the calculated p-value is less than the alpha value, we therefore reject the null hypothesis.

Therefore, we conclude that provision of working tools and equipment has significant positive effect on patients’ satisfaction at the two teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

Hypothesis Three

Ha:3 Issuance of honorary award and recognition have significant effect on workers attitude to work in teaching hospitals in Enugu State.

Data from table 4.3 was used to test this hypothesis

Table 4.4: Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics				
					R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change
1	.385 ^a	.147	.145	1.093	.147	52.861	1	389	.002

a. Predictors: (Constant), item 5
 Source: Researcher’s Computation using SPSS.

Table 4.5: ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	63.078	1	63.078	52.861	.002 ^b
	Residual	367.531	388	1.193		
	Total	430.609	389			

a. Dependent Variable: item 4
 b. Predictors: (Constant), item 5
 Source: Researcher’s Computation using SPSS.

Interpretation and Decision

The above table presents the summary of F-test analysis. The F-test analysis shows that the calculated p-value of the regression is .001, which is less than 0.05 ($p=0.001<0.05$) at 388 degree of freedom. Therefore, we conclude that Issuance of honorary award and recognition have significant positive effect on workers attitude to work in Enugu State teaching hospitals.

4.3 Discussion of Results

Result from test of hypothesis one revealed that Staff development and training have significant positive effect on workers’ efficiency at the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital, Ituku-Ozalla and ESUT teaching hospital, Park lane, Enugu [$r=.978; p\leq 0.05$]. This is in line with the submissions of Mohammad, Indra, and Abu (2013) who found that training and promotion are significant predictors of job performance.

Test of hypothesis two revealed that provision of working tools and equipment have significant positive effect on patients’ satisfaction at the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital, Ituku-Ozalla and ESUT teaching hospital, Park lane, Enugu [$F(95,n=320)=73.107,p<0.05$]. Oleribe, Ezieme, Oladipo, Akinola, Udofia and Taylor-Robinson (2016) reiterated these findings in their submission

when they identified lack of working tools as a major cause of industrial action by health workers in Nigeria.

Hypothesis three showed that issuance of honorary award and recognition have significant positive effect on workers attitude to work at the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital, Ituku/Ozalla and ESUT teaching hospital, Parklane, Enugu [$p=0.032 < 0.05$]. The studies of Oluwakemi (2022), Alabi *et al.*, (2022) and Egwuonwu (2022) corroborated with finding.

5. Findings, Conclusion and Recommendations

5.1 Summary of Findings

1. Staff development and training have significant positive effect on workers' efficiency at the University of Nigeria Teaching Hospital and ESUT teaching hospital, Enugu.
2. Provision of working tools and equipment has significant positive effect on patients' satisfaction at the Enugu State Teaching Hospitals.
3. Honorary award and recognition have significant positive effect on workers attitude to work at the two Teaching Hospitals in Enugu State.

5.2 Conclusion

The study has established that all the components of non-financial incentives - staff development and training, working tools and equipment and recognition have significant positive effect on the different respective performance indicators (particularly on workers' efficiency and patients' satisfaction) in the teaching hospitals in Enugu State. It is therefore the submission of this study that non-financial incentives are as important as financial incentives in driving overall performance in teaching hospitals.

5.3 Recommendations

- 1 It is expected that teaching hospitals would have staff training and development programmes considering what they are – “teaching hospitals”. There is therefore the need for these hospitals to make provision for Professional Development Programmes (PDP) for in-house staff at affordable rates and across all fields in the medical profession.
- 2 Modern innovative working tools in the medical profession should be acquired to help staff members update their on-the-job skills. Such equipment further boost patients' confidence on the quality of healthcare services rendered in these teaching hospitals.
- 3 Medical staff and other personnel that have shown competence and commitment to duty should be promptly recognized.

References

- Alabi O.A., Olonade Z.O., Omotoye O.O. & Odebode A.S. (2022). Non-Financial Rewards and Employee Performance in Money Deposit Banks in Lagos State, Nigeria. *ABUAD Journal of Social and Management Sciences*. 3(2), 58-77
- Eboh, E. F., (2013). *Management theory: models for decision making*. Computer Villa Publishers Ltd.
- Egwuonwu J. R. (2023). The influence of favouritism as non financial incentives on employee performance. Retrieved from <https://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:umu:diva-205615>
- Eze, C. A. (2020). *The role of reward management in organizational performance (a study of University of Nigeria Nsukka)*. In Partial Fulfilment of the Requirement for the Award of

- Mohammad A.M., Indra S. and Abu A.B. (2021). Relationship between Motivational Factors and Job Performance of Employees in Malaysian Service Industry. *Asian Social Science*, 9, 301.
- Nnadi I. (2010). Relationship between motivational factors and job performance of employees in Nigerian Service Industry. *Canadian Journal of Science and Education*. 5(3)
- Oleribe O.O., Udofia, D., Oladipo, O., Ishola, T.A. and Taylor-Robinson, S.D. (2018). Healthcare workers' industrial action in Nigeria: a cross-sectional survey of Nigerian physicians. *Human Resources for Health*, 16:54
- Oleribe, O.O., Ezieme, I.P., Oladipo, O. Akinola, E.P., Udofia D., and Taylor-Robinson S.D. (2016). Industrial action by healthcare workers in Nigeria in 2013–2015: an inquiry into causes, consequences and control—a cross-sectional descriptive study. *Human Resources for Health*, 14:46
- Oluwakemi F. (2022). *The effect of non-financial incentives on employees' performance in an organization: A Case study of Lagos State Internal Revenue Service*. Thesis – Bachelor's Degree Programme Social Sciences, Business And Administration, Sovania
- Oluwakemi F. (2022). The effect of non-financial incentives on employees' performance in an organization - A Case study of Lagos State Internal Revenue Service. https://www.theseus.fi/bitstream/handle/10024/785773/Folarin_Oluwakemi.pdf;jsessionid=C3402299700B33B655280BF01BCC445B?sequence=2
- Orga, C. C., Mbah, P. C., & Chijioke, E. (2018). Investigating the Effect of Non –Financial Rewards on Staff Productivity in Shoprite Company, Enugu. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*. 8(9), 950–964
- Syukra, A., (2020). The Relationship between training, compensation and employment promotion with labor productivity employees in public health centre (Puskesmas) of Bukittinggi–West Sumatera, Indonesia. *Global Journal of Biology, Agriculture and Health Sciences* 3(2).44-48
- Uzochukwu, B.S., Onwujekwe, O.E. & Ezumah N. (2014). The District Health System in Enugu State, Development and Implementation Nigeria: An Analysis of Policy. *African Journal of Health Economics*. 3 (1), 1-14.