

ALIENATION AND AFFIRMATION: THE HUMANISTIC VISION OF BESSIE HEAD

Brighton Uledi-Kamanga

Cecil Abrahams has accurately noted that Bessie Head's artistic imagination, like that of other South African exiles, is dominated by her experience of **apartheid** (1). Although most of her works are set in Botswana, where she lived in exile from 1964 to her death in early 1986, they all reflect the author's continual analysis of the psychological ramifications of racial and ethnic prejudice. In these works Head successfully demonstrates that any form of segregation based on ethnicity or race causes indelible human alienation and estrangement because people are conditioned to seeing themselves first and foremost as members of particular racial and ethnic groups and view themselves as human beings last. Furthermore, their mutual perceptions are severely warped and distorted by prejudice, which is invariably accompanied by oppression. Head also shows that this form of oppression dehumanizes both victim and oppressor: the victim's self-image is undermined, causing him to lose a sense of his own worth as a human being, and the oppressor's ability to exercise moral judgement is impaired. The inevitable antagonism which ensues between oppressed and oppressor makes it impossible for them both to recognize and appreciate each other's humanity. In a superb demonstration of faith in man's value and potential capacity for goodness the author presents her fictional characters as regaining their senses of humanity and that of others through affirmative interaction with people regardless of race and ethnicity.

The aims of this paper are essentially twofold: firstly, to discuss what Bessie Head has called her "universal thesis on racialism", namely that racial prejudice dehumanizes people (2), and secondly, to appraise the humanistic (3) solution she offers to the problem of racism. I will also discuss the contention that this solution is unrealistic and impracticable in South Africa, the context of her fiction.

In an interview with Lee Nichols of Voice of America, Head pointed out that in her second novel **Maru** she deliberately used the theme of black against black, not white against black in order to lend universality to her "examination

of racial prejudices" in general (4). Margaret Cadmore, in that novel, is a character whose sense of self-worth has been fractured by ethnic prejudice perpetrated on her by the Batswana. Margaret is a Masarwa ("Bushman") orphan who is adopted by white missionaries after she has lost her mother at birth. Her benefactors give her a "European" upbringing, and when she is old enough they send her to school. After completing school, the orphan girl is sent to a teachers' college. Upon completing her course with distinction she is posted to teach at a village school, where the idea of a Masarwa teacher is unimaginable as the Masarwa are regarded as an inferior people. For some time Margaret is mistaken by both fellowteachers and pupils for a "coloured". Later, when she voluntarily discloses her true identity, she is humiliated by her own pupils and ostracized by all except Dikeledi, a fellow-teacher who is also the daughter of a local chief. Throughout the novel, the young woman evinces a deep sense of personal worthlessness which is repaired when Maru, Dikeledi's brother and heir to his father's throne, elopes with her, giving up the chieftainship in favour of a happy married life with Margaret away from her racist persecutors.

Margaret's dislocated sense of self-worth is first manifested when she falls in love with Moleka, a Motswana local administrator. Although she believes that he loves her too, she tells herself that "He will never approach me, because I am a Masarwa" (5). Head comments that this kind of resigned self-devaluation "was something her whole way of life had prepared her for. Love and happiness had always been a little bit far away from life as other people lived it" (p. 94). In spite of her Western upbringing, "There was no one in later life who did not hesitate to tell [Margaret] that she was a Bushman, mixed breed, half breed, low breed or bastard" (pp. 15-16). Consequently, she began to wonder about herself and her place in society: "It was when she started going to the mission school that she slowly became aware that something was wrong with her relationship to the world. She was the kind of child who was slightly pinched under the seat, and next to whom no one wanted to sit" (p. 17). Inevitably, this physical abuse and isolation indicated other people's rejection of her as a fellow human being. In the course of time she stoically resigned herself to the demeaning status of a social reject. As Head puts it: "The young girl had no confusion of heart, only the experience of being permanently unwanted by society in general". (p. 94)

Margaret sees Dikeledi as a young woman who enjoys a place in society which is the exact opposite of hers. As the daughter of a chief, Dikeledi belongs to the ruling aristocracy and has respectability and power. Ironically, both of them are in love with the same man without knowing of their rivalry. To compound the irony, Margaret derives some peace of mind from the mere belief that Moleka loves her too, whereas his promiscuity is a source of constant emotional turmoil to his real lover, Dikeledi. When the chief's daughter cries over her tribulations in Margaret's presence, the latter cannot understand it at all. What could possibly make a lady who seemingly has everything in society cry?

Margaret's resignation to the circumstances of her own life is so complete that even the love-sick Dikeledi notices the unfulfilling tranquillity it enables her to enjoy: "I wish I was like you, Margaret... You look as though you could live like this for ever. You look as though you don't want anyone or anything except this library, the painting you are doing now and your school work. I feel so restless. Sometimes I could just rush out of this village, forever" (p. 114). Margaret's response confirms the unfulfilling nature of her tranquillity and reflects her impaired sense of her own worth as a human being. She abstains from disclosing the secret source of her peace of mind, fearing that it might arouse ethnic contempt in her upper-class colleague: "Any other woman would have said: 'I am peaceful because Moleka loves me.' But then she was not any other woman. She was a Masarwa. She thought Dikeledi would reply: 'Don't be silly. Moleka can't possibly love you. You are a Masarwa and he's ...'" (p. 114). Therefore she just says: "I am peaceful because I have nothing and I want nothing". (p. 114)

Ultimately, her isolated existence and social rejection reduce her significance in the village to the level of obscurity. Living in her isolated little house at the hill-top Margaret watches the rhythm of village life as an outsider:

In the distance a village proceeded with its own life but she knew not what it was - who married, who died, who gave birth to children... She was not a part of it and belonged nowhere. In fact, so quiet and insignificant were her movements that the people of Dilepe

village almost forgot that there was such a thing as a Masarwa teacher. Now and then she caught their eye on her way to the shops or to school. They would laugh a bit, turn to each other and say: "There goes the friend of Mistress Dikeledi." She had no life outside those words. (p. 93)

This kind of social rejection and isolation makes it impossible for Margaret to know and understand the Batswana as fellow human beings. And because experience has taught her to expect only the worst from people in relation to herself, social contact almost always makes the young woman defensive: "If anyone approached [her], she slowly raised her hand as if to ward off a blow. Sometimes she winced, but the raised hand was always there as though she expected only blows from people" (p. 71). It is this lost sense of other people's humanity that inhibits the development and free expression of her own personality. She is forced to project an attenuated self-image which is not true to her inner vitality and human worth. According to Dikeledi's perceptive observation: "There was something else funny about [Margaret]. She was a shadow behind which lived another personality of great vigour and vitality. She raised her hand to hide this second image from sight, but the two constantly tripped up each other". (p. 71)

Another important example of Margaret's conditioned fear of people and society is seen when she first enters the world as an independent working woman. On the day she goes to Dilepe for her teaching appointment she is uncertain about how to respond to the generosity of heart shown by the truck driver who gives her a ride to the village. He offers to drive her right up to the school itself, and at a restaurant he insists that the waiters give her top quality service. Noticing her unease with him and his manner, the driver reassuringly tells her: "You must not be so afraid of the world, Mistress ... People can't harm you" (p. 22). Commenting on Margaret's overwhelmed reaction to these kind words, the author writes: "There it shot out again, one single abrupt tear from one eye. Was that really true? Did many people behave like him, so spontaneous in their kindness? They ate in silence" (p. 22). The young woman's doubts are proved correct when she is later abused at school after she discloses her ethnic identity to the principal.

As soon as she boldly tells him that she is a Masarwa, she becomes a thing, "it", to him. The principal behaves irrationally towards her. In shocked confusion, he cannot wait to inform the education supervisor of his horrifying discovery:

The whole day he fretted. School closed just past noon. The office of the education supervisor was a stone's throw from the school. Usually they sat chatting over three or four cups of tea. Today, the list of beginners seemed endless. He kept noting out of the corner of his eye that the Masarwa (she was no longer a human being) seemed to be extraordinarily friendly with Dikeledi, who in his eyes was royalty of royalty. Should he warn Dikeledi that she was ... talking to "it"? "It" surely had all the appearance of a Coloured. (p. 40)

When the principal finally manages to see the education supervisor and tells him about what he calls "some chicanery", he refers to Margaret in an objectified manner, thereby negating her humanity: "I have a Masarwa on my staff" (p. 41). The supervisor, in predictable shock, swiftly checks the application list for the woman's identity. To his chagrin: "There was no requirement for a person to define his tribe or race." Choking with anger, he complains: "They are going to blame me ... I only look at qualifications. She was top of the class the whole way through. How the hell did she get in? God, Pete, this is a mess" (p. 41). The principal's (Pete's) inability to see Margaret as a fellow human being is so complete that he cannot even understand her voluntary disclosure of her true ethnic identity. And when he arranges for public humiliation of Margaret at the hands of her own pupils, he merely crowns his own concomitant debasement.

In her third and stylistically most ambitious novel, **A Question of Power**, Head presents a situation where racial persecution of the heroine, Elizabeth, undermines her sense of self-worth so deeply that she suffers a mental breakdown. Although this novel is set in Botswana, its context is South Africa; it is also a fictionalized account of the author's own life (6). The crucial role the heroine's racial origin

plays in determining her identity emphatically signals its context. Being the offspring of a white woman and a black man, Elizabeth is defined as a "coloured" according to South African law. "Like all other coloured South Africans, Elizabeth is regarded as a queer specimen of humanity who does not belong to either the white or black race" (7). The dehumanizing effect of this obsession with race is best pointed to by Head herself: "In South Africa [Elizabeth] had been rigidly classified coloured. There was no escape from it to the simple joy of being a human being with a personality. There wasn't any escape like that for anyone in South Africa. They were races, not people". (8)

Elizabeth attempts to escape from this confinement by going to Botswana. But the attempt proves to be futile because her view of herself has already been distorted by the **apartheid** ideology of her native land. Having been categorized as a "coloured", she finds it hard to fit in among the "authentic" blacks of Motabeng village, where she settles. The failure to fit in exacerbates her initial sense of being a racial oddity, causing emotional and psychological suffering that culminates in mental breakdown. The process towards that breakdown is marked by a series of hallucinations and nightmares, dominated by visions of evil. Acts of perverse sexuality, committed by a character called Dan, are the most recurrent form of evil she sees. Head makes it clear that these sexual horrors stem from the heroine's stigmatized identity. "Since coloured people are the product of procreative relationships between whites and blacks in a racist South African society where sexual relationships between whites and blacks are outlawed, the progeny of such sexual encounters carry a life-long stigma of illegitimacy" (9). It is this "stigma of illegitimacy" that transforms itself into the nightmares of perverse sexuality, and tortures her mind; hence her repeatedly expressed view of herself as a "half-breed" (p. 104), "a mixed breed" (p. 147), and not "genuinely African" (p. 159). By virtue of this view, Elizabeth sees herself not only as a racial impurity, but as an inferior. In addition, her sensitivity to the fact that she does not speak any indigenous African language makes her feel more estranged from the villagers around her. It also accentuates her helpless sense of personal inadequacy:

It wasn't my fault ... I am not a tribal
African. If I had been, I would have

known the exact truth about Sello, whether he was good or bad. There aren't any secrets among tribal Africans. I was shut out from the everyday affairs of this world. Dan knew and traded on my ignorance. He did more. He struck me such terrible blows, the pain made me lose my mind. (p. 145)

Not surprisingly, Dan keeps reminding the young woman of her racial complex. In one of Elizabeth's hallucinations he turns on a record inside her mind which keeps saying: "Dog, filth, the Africans will eat you to death. Dog, filth, the Africans will eat you to death". (p. 46)

During his sexual exploits, in which the heroine does not participate, Dan keeps telling her that she is sexually inadequate because she is a "coloured". For example, he says that Miss Sewing Machine, one of his grotesque women, "can go with a man the whole night and feel no ill-effects the next day, provided you stimulate her properly" (p. 127). He adds: "You are inferior as a Coloured. You haven't got what that girl has got" (p. 127). Effectually, Dan's persistent racial persecution of Elizabeth not only makes her feel inadequate, but leads her to view herself as a social reject, which is reminiscent of Margaret's reaction in **Maru**.

The rejection Elizabeth was to experience in later life began as soon as she was born. In the tearful words of her foster-mother:

It's such a sad story ... It caused so much trouble and [your mother's] family was frightened by the behaviour of the grandmother [who insisted on seeing you]. My husband worked on the child welfare committee, and your case came up again and again. First they received you from the mental hospital and sent you to a nursing-home. A day later you were returned because you did not look white. They sent you to a Boer family. A week later you were returned. The women on the committee said: "What can we do with this child? Its mother is white." My husband came

home that night and asked me to take
you. I agreed. (p. 17)

Significantly, Elizabeth first learns of her unfortunate origin from a heartless and prejudiced principal of the mission school where she was sent at the age of thirteen: "We have a full docket on you. You must be very careful. Your mother was insane. If you're not careful you'll get insane just like your mother. Your mother was a white woman. They had to lock her up, as she was having a child by the stable boy who was a native" (p. 16) (10). This sense of deliberate victimization only emphasizes the young woman's self-image as an outcast. The irrationality of the principal's treatment of Elizabeth shows how prejudice degrades the perpetrator as well as the victim. In the young girl's eyes, the woman, because of her mindless cruelty, ceases to be a fellow human being and becomes an agent of suffering; an object of fear and hatred. In her nightmares, Dan, the persecutor, is more of an apparition of evil than a man. In the final analysis, Elizabeth is exiled not only from her land of birth but, like Margaret of **Maru**, from the community of men at large.

While Margaret's humanity is ultimately affirmed by Maru's marriage to her, Elizabeth in part regains her sense of self-worth through a gradual process of adaptation and assimilation into her new society. The author shows that in order for the heroine to attain personal affirmation she has to engage in productive interaction with other people and acknowledge human connection with them. When Elizabeth first arrives in Motabeng, not only does she see herself as a misfit among the African villagers, but she also refuses to be associated with them. As a coloured, she has been trained by South African society not to see herself in kinship with black Africans. When she is admitted to a mental hospital following her breakdown, she screams at one of the attendants: "I'm not an African. Don't you see? I never want to be an African. You bloody well, damn well leave me alone" (p. 181). Yet what finally restores her to health is her eventual integration into the village community. Through association with a peasant woman, Kenosi, as they work together in a co-operative garden, Elizabeth learns to accept not only the African people but herself as well. While the production of their own vegetables gives Elizabeth and the other woman a shared sense of accomplishment, her association with Kenosi opens the heroine's eyes to the affirmative influence of ordinary human connection. Above

all she realizes that the connection had always been there, only she had chosen to deny it: "She had fallen from the very beginning into the warm embrace of the brotherhood of man, because when people wanted everyone to be ordinary it was just another way of saying man loved man". (p. 206)

In Head's first novel, **When Rain Clouds Gather**, it is also his South African background that causes the hero, Makhaya, to feel estranged from people in general. Unlike Elizabeth, Makhaya is an "authentic" black with a part-urban and part-tribal upbringing. But like her, he goes to Botswana not only to seek political refuge but to achieve personal reintegration as well. As he escapes from his native land, Makhaya is described as a man suffering from internal turmoil: "the inner part of him was a jumble of chaotic discord" (p. 7) (11). The sources of this turmoil are both political and social. He was once imprisoned on political charges. That experience coupled with the degradation of the black man's life in the Republic has led him to lose faith in the concept of human goodness. Utterly disillusioned, he wishes to distance himself from both people and politics. He expresses this wish to the man who gives him shelter at the border: "I just want to step on free ground. I don't care about people. I don't care about anything, not even the white man. I want to feel what it is like to live in a free country and then maybe some of the evils in my life will correct themselves" (p. 10). Dinorego, the kindly old man who first meets Makhaya in Botswana and gives him accommodation, notices the young man's spiritual anguish but cannot understand its origin:

There were things in Makhaya he would never understand because his own environment was one full of innocence. The terrors of rape, murder, and bloodshed in a city slum, which was Makhaya's background, were quite unknown to Dinorego, but he felt in Makhaya's attitude and utterances a horror of life, and it was as though he was trying to flee this horror and replace it with innocence, trust, and respect. (p. 98)

Like Elizabeth, Makhaya ultimately rediscovers himself and human fellowship through productive interaction with

the land and its people. Shortly after his arrival in Golema Mmidi village, he becomes an assistant to Gilbert, an English agricultural instructor who is also in search of personal fulfilment. Makhaya assists in the promotion of modern methods of farming and water conservation in the village. Through this involvement he learns of the hardships endured by the Batswana and develops an empathetic connection with them. The severe drought which causes the deaths of many cattle marks the turning point in his attitude towards the people and their environment. The sight of death and devastation on the day he accompanies Gilbert and Paulina, a village woman who has fallen in love with him, to the cattle posts to look for Paulina's son cements his identification with the Batswana:

From that day Makhaya was to become peculiarly Motswana in his outlook. Coming from a country of green hills and fresh bubbling streams, he was from that day to treasure every green shoot that sprang in this dry place, and he would fear to waste even a drop of water. Paulina was the only one who was not deeply perturbed by what she saw. She had lived through times like this before, when the bush was bare and the plowing season delayed indefinitely. (p. 160)

A central part of Makhaya's identification with the Batswana is his eventual marriage to Paulina. Appropriately, he begins to appreciate the value of his love for Paulina in particular and of human fellowship in general on the very day he witnesses the devastation caused by drought in the bush. After they find the skeletal remains of a little boy, Makhaya and Paulina only derive courage and strength from each other. Sending Paulina off with Gilbert back to the village, the young man waits at the post for the police to come and examine the dead boy's remains. In the subsequent period of solitude he takes stock of his life and attitudes. In the author's words:

Makhaya was left alone with the vultures. Surrounded by tragedy and seated in the shade of a ramshackle mud hut in the Botswana bush, he began to see

himself. In retrospect he seemed a small-minded man. All his life he had wanted some kind of Utopia, and he had rejected in his mind and heart a world full of ailments and faults. He had run and run away from it all, but now the time had come when he could run and hide no longer and would have to turn round and face all that he had run away from. Loving one woman had brought him to this realization: that it was only people who could bring the real rewards of living, that it was only people who give love and happiness. (p. 163)

Makhaya and Elizabeth regain faith in human goodness not only through affirmative interaction with the Batswana, but also through contact with well-meaning and sincere white people from different parts of the world. We noted Gilbert, the British agricultural instructor in **When Rain Clouds Gather**, whose generosity and encouragement initially motivated Makhaya to settle in Golema Mmidi. In **A Question of Power** there are Eugene, a white South African who has run away from the political problems of his homeland, and Tom Gunner, an American aid worker. Each of these help the local villagers run a co-operative garden. It is Eugene who advises Elizabeth to participate in the co-operative work. Soon Elizabeth and Tom become close friends and share long confidential conversations. Through their respective personal contacts, Elizabeth and Makhaya learn to appreciate the humanity of their white associates. In the early stages both of them operate on the assumption that all white people are inhuman and cruel. By way of artistic consummation of Head's vision of non-racial human oneness, the white "characters integrate into Botswana society and are accepted by the masses as participants in their struggle" (12) for economic advancement.

When looked at in the context of the realities of present-day South Africa, this humanistic vision lies vulnerable to the charge of practical inadequacy. For the kind of human fellowship that prevails between the whites and non-whites in Botswana is not possible in the white-ruled Republic. As Nadine Gordimer, one of South Africa's leading novelists, has observed, every aspect of human life in South Africa

is rigidly regulated by what she terms "the politics of race" (13). And in her own fiction Gordimer makes it clear that the only road towards human reconciliation in her country is the abolition of **apartheid**. Since Bessie Head does not directly feature South Africa in her fiction, she does not present any political solution to the problem. But it is clear in her work that she regards human freedom as an absolute prerequisite for any form of affirmative interaction between people in any society. In a number of interviews she has acknowledged the political freedom people enjoy in Botswana. Although she criticizes ethnic prejudice in the country, she recognizes the crucial difference that it is not part of official government policy in the way that racial discrimination is in South Africa.

However, Bessie Head may also be accused of escapism for not addressing the problems of her native land directly and proposing a political solution to them. But whether or not it is a creative writer's duty to grapple with and propose solutions to political problems is a question that probably lies beyond the scope of this essay. Head herself has admitted the fact that her humanistic vision lacks political utility, and added that all she has done in her works is offer "a view of a grander world, of a world that's much grander than the one we've had already" (14). By so doing she has at least fulfilled Aristotle's conception of the function of art and the artist: namely to present a picture of reality, not as it is, but as it might be. From the Aristotelian perspective it can perhaps be argued that artists are by definition idealists, be they radical, liberal or conservative. Maybe to expect art to have an immediate utilitarian function is in itself to be idealistic.

Head's humanism is decidedly liberal in its philosophical orientation, and liberalism has been attacked and dismissed in South Africa by both white and black radicals. What Alan Paton said in defence of his own liberalism could be quoted with reference to Bessie Head. According to Paton, liberals and liberalism cannot be assessed in terms of their political success or failure because the values they represent, namely love, justice and mercy, transcend politics. "One does not uphold [these values] in order to be successful but because it has to be done ... Liberalism is more than politics. It is humanity, tolerance, and love of justice. South Africa has no future without them, least of all white South Africa". (15)

NOTES

1. Cecil A. Abrahams, "The Tyranny of Place: The Context of Bessie Head's Fiction", **World Literature Written in English**, Vol. 17, No. 1 (April, 1978), p. 22.
2. Quoted in Lee Nichols, interviewer and editor, **Conversations with African Writers** (Washington, D.C.: Voice of America, 1981), pp. 51-52.
3. I am using the term humanism in the general "liberal" sense of belief in human value and potential capacity for goodness, and not in any specific sense, for example, along the lines of Classical humanism, Renaissance Christian humanism, or Zambian political humanism.
4. Quoted in Nichols, **op. cit.**, pp. 51-52.
5. Bessie Head, **Maru** (London: Victor Gollancz, 1971), p. 94. All other references are incorporated in the text.
6. As **A Question of Power** is an autobiographical novel, it is interesting to note Head's own comments on its technical quality and thematic concerns: "In **A Question of Power** the work-out is ... subtle — the whole process of break-down and destruction is outlined there. A person in the grip of such a process has very little to say. I felt that I had overcome that tendency in me to moral preachiness. The question is left so open. There is a line that forms the title of the book — if the things of the soul are really a question of power then anyone in possession of power of the spirit could be Lucifer. That is, I might in my essence then symbolize Satan. I'd lost, in **A Question of Power**, the certainty of my own goodness. The novel was written under pressure. I was alarmed. If you feel that you have moved into another world where no human decencies are observed and basically you are a normal, decent human being, there is this high alarm. The book was written with that high alarm." Quoted in Jean Marquard, "Bessie Head: Exile and Community in Southern Africa", **London Magazine**, Vol. 18, No. 9 (December, 1978), p. 53.
7. Abrahams, **op. cit.**, p. 25.

8. Bessie Head, *A Question of Power* (London: Heinemann, 1974), p. 44. All other references are incorporated in the text.
9. Abrahams, *op. cit.*, p. 24. The law prohibiting sex across races is reported to have recently been scrapped by the Pretoria government.
10. The circumstances of Head's own birth are similar to those of Elizabeth's. In a 1978 interview conducted by Jean Marquard, the author candidly told of her mixed-race origin and the horrors it inevitably invoked. Just like her fictional self-portrait, she was born of a white woman in a South African mental hospital. Locating her misfortune within its peculiar environment, Head observed: "I feel that, with a situation like we have in South Africa, there must be a lot of people who have tragic circumstances surrounding their birth. When there are so many artificial barriers set between the races, people being people are going to try to break through those artificial barriers.

"As far as my mother was concerned, she was from a Scottish family but born in South Africa. The family owned race horses which they entered for the Durban July handicap and they kept black men in the stables to groom, exercise and clean the horses. My mother, for some reasons of her own, was attracted to one of the grooms who looked after the race horses and in that way she acquired me. After she had taken up an association with him, her family had her committed. I was initially handed over to a white family for adoption, that is, an Afrikaner Boer family. After a week I was returned since they said the baby appeared to be black and they could not accept a baby like this." Quoted in Marquard, *op. cit.*, p. 49. Marquard adds that Head "was [later] given to coloured foster parents who had charge of her until she was 13. When her foster mother, who was illiterate and very poor, was no longer considered fit to look after the child, she was placed in an Anglican mission orphanage in Durban where she worked for a high school diploma and did her teacher's training course."

11. Bessie Head, **When Rain Clouds Gather** (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1968), p. 7. All other references are incorporated in the text.
12. Abrahams, **op. cit.**, p. 28.
13. Nadine Gordimer, "Literature and Politics in South Africa", **Southern Review**, Vol. VII, No. 3 (November, 1974), pp. 205-206.
14. Quoted in Nichols, **op. cit.**, pp. 55-56.
15. Alan Paton, **Knocking on the Door: Shorter Writings**, selected and edited by Colin Gardner (Cape Town: David Philip, 1975), p. 258.