



Understanding ministerial accountability in the New Pentecostal Prophetic churches



Authors:

Sello E. Letswalo¹ 
Marilyn Naidoo¹ 

Affiliations:

¹Department of Philosophy, Practical and Systematic Theology, College of Human Science, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa

Corresponding author:

Marilyn Naidoo,
naidom2@unisa.ac.za

Dates:

Received: 15 Aug. 2024

Accepted: 11 Oct. 2024

Published: 11 Dec. 2024

How to cite this article:

Letswalo, S.E. & Naidoo, M., 2024, 'Understanding ministerial accountability in the New Pentecostal Prophetic churches', *HTS Theologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 80(1), a10161. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v80i1.10161>

Copyright:

© 2024. The Authors.
Licensee: AOSIS. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution License.

Within churches, congregational health and well-being require not only efficient church leadership, but also prudent church management. Good leadership structures influence governance and ministry tasks, and the awareness of accountability is a vital concept within organisations. It shapes the entire managerial progression influencing values, objectives and practices. This article reports on a study to establish the understanding of ministerial accountability in the New Prophetic Pentecostal churches. Findings reveal a unique understanding of leaders' personal accountability, communal and cultural ministry practices and public accountability towards the broader community. This article speaks to the normative task of the Church and creates a new reflection on ministerial accountability and ethical practices as well as implications for congregational development broadly.

Contribution: This article highlights findings on how New Prophetic Pentecostal churches understand the concept of ministerial accountability with limited literature on the topic. Gaining insight into the African cultural heritage and values when examining the neo-Pentecostal perspective will enhance the understanding regarding their beliefs and principles.

Keywords: ministerial accountability; New Prophetic Pentecostal churches; church leadership; African culture; ethical church practice; CRL.

Introduction

The subject of ministerial accountability is not a core focus for prophetic Pentecostal ministers; however, it is becoming too critical to ignore, as it shapes and reflects the leadership style and even determines organisational growth. The goal of ministerial accountability is to promote balance and reliable leadership within the church. Accountability as a key concept can be understood as the requirement of accounting for one's activities (Joannides 2012:245). Ministerial ethics:

... is simply the manifestation of ethical behaviour in the conduct and life of a Christian leader to set a good example through interpersonal behaviour, ethical action and living out ethical standards; that is, walking the talk. (Kaguara 2018:13)

Leaders need to model a moral life, and ministerial accountability usually takes place through good governance and church administration structures. God has entrusted Christians to be accountable and manage the resources, mission and preparation for service by delivering programmes, to fulfil the church's tasks (Kaguara 2018:11). Conversely, Trull and Carter (2004:15) point to the 'lack of accountability and clear professional guidelines among pastors, as contributors to their ethical failure'. As spiritual leaders, pastors hold a position of authority above all else and because of their position they may forego or lack supervision in the ministry.

The New Prophetic Pentecostal Churches (NPPC) are newly established Pentecostal churches that have experienced phenomenal growth, known as the 'third wave' in church growth, and have increased in size and popularity since the 1970s and 1980s and became well-liked in Africa in the 1990s (Kroesbergen 2017:6). There are some well-known leaders who are popular in the public domain through electronic and social media, like Shepherd Bushiri of Enlightened Christian Gathering Church (ECG) and Paseka Motsoeneng of Incredible Happening Ministry (IHM) (Matsobane 2023:2). These churches are usually led by a 'prophet' or 'apostle' who believes that they use God's power to help people in their churches who are struggling, mainly with spiritual problems that manifest as disease, bad luck, etc. and require guidance. Their emphasis is on the Holy Spirit being present in their work and they believe that they are guided, controlled and led by the Holy Spirit. According to Kgatle (2020):

Read online:



Scan this QR code with your smart phone or mobile device to read online.

... the NPCs [*New Prophetic Churches*] are churches that have retained the fundamental teachings of Pentecostalism like the baptism in the Holy Spirit and speaking in tongues but have peculiar practices like one-on-one prophesy, one-on-one deliverance and consultation, where members pay a certain fee, miracle money, prophetic titles, with some prophets claiming superiority over biblical prophets and amongst the NPCCs in South Africa. (pp. 3–4)

These churches, in contrast to traditional Pentecostals, employ anointing products such as spiritual candles, anointing oils and water in addition to their prayers (Kgatle 2023:2). The usage of anointed artefacts became commonplace in the prophetic, and as a result, the adherents have a deep faith in these customs. The NPPC believes in their African culture mixed with Christian beliefs which plays a huge role in influencing their ministry practices and traditions because they synthesise both African culture and Christianity. Some practices of prophetic ministry are duplicates of African Tradition Religion though they are not the same group. Important to note here as Anderson (2013:157) states: ‘terms like “neo-Pentecostals” and “neo-charismatics” have been used to refer to these newer churches, but it is becoming increasingly difficult to distinguish between the different forms of Pentecostalism today’.

In the classical Pentecostal churches like the Full Gospel Church, the Assemblies of God and the Apostolic Faith Mission (AFM), these denominations have a high view of organisational culture (Kgatle 2020:2) and have structures such as the election of leadership; elders, deacons and various church committees that report to a senior leadership structure. Pastors are required to attend theological training to learn about their role as ethical leaders, church leadership and administration.

Within the NPPC movement, it is unclear how their ministers are held accountable for Christian work or ministry. This issue has become a focus since recent media reports of happenings in NPPC churches. In 2015, pastors made congregants eat snakes, drink petroleum and undress publicly claiming that this was part of their worship (Kgatle 2022; Pondani 2019:24). These reports led to a social outcry and the intervention of the CRL Human Rights Commission to investigate practices and advocate for the regulation of these churches (Resane 2017:1). This led to media discussions on the commercialisation of churches (Vorster 2021:2), and lack of solid governance structures and financial stewardship in these churches (CRL 2017:32–33). Thinane (2021:3) alleges that ‘abuse of power and violation of human rights by self-styled spiritual leaders within these churches has proven the realisation of religious freedom to be problematic’.

This article reports on a study to understand the concept of ministerial accountability in the NPPC. Positively, it highlights how African culture is valued in their ministry practices, based on morality and ethical life, providing an enhanced understanding of the contemporary African Pentecostal.

The research project

The focus of this study was to understand the value of ministerial accountability within the NPPC, in South Africa. Several scholars (Banda 2020; Kgatle 2020; Ramantswana 2019:7; Resane 2017) have written about the NPPC prophetic prayers, practices and rituals, the relationship between the behaviour of the church and the Spirit, healing and power but limited research exists on how they remain accountable in Christian work.

Being accountable means making the right choices based on personal, professional, organisational and societal rules and beliefs (Thwala 2020). In African culture, it is believed that you should not harm your family, a person related to you or a stranger unless they are doing something wrong. African culture values the spirit of *Ubuntu*, education on moral life is through African proverbs that support family, leadership, individuals, community and so forth, for example, Resane (2023) states that:

... ‘*more mogolo go betlwa wa taola, wa motho o a ipetla*’, which is very difficult to transliterate, but it means a person is responsible for shaping his or her life. A person chooses his or her path in life. This proverb is powerful advice for the ethics of self-responsibility. (p. 4)

The key concept of accountability used social ethics theory; to understand how leaders behave, and interact with others, based on beliefs, morals and how they influence others in their group. The theoretical framework for this study was Kunhiyop (2008) who writes in *African Christian Ethics* with the emphasis on African Christian ethics. According to Kunhiyop (2008:13) to create a moral system that is both African and Christian, we must first comprehend the ethical rules and beliefs that shape how people in Africa behave morally. Kunhiyop (2008) states:

Social ethics is about how communities decide what is right and wrong, and it focuses on the values and relationships between people rather than just what individuals want. In Africa, people care more about how they treat others as a group than how they act individually. This is because African culture values the community over the individual. (pp. 4–5)

This was a qualitative study that used the practical theological methodology of Osmer’s (2011:2) ‘descriptive-empirical task’. The study was undertaken to examine the practical conduct of elected leaders to comprehend how their accountability manifests in their day-to-day ministerial activities, and to ‘discern of the praxis of God in the local faith community’ (Schoeman 2015:63), as rapidly expanding Pentecostals.

The sample for this study comprises the emerging NPPC with their unique brand of theology and practices. Convenience sampling was used, participants were found through the minister’s fraternal named Sharpening Revival (CRC) and Limpopo Ministers Fraternal Mopani District, which was within proximity to the researcher. The researcher contacted possible participants who agreed to be part of the

study. Ten church leaders, both male and female 'prophets' with a minimum of 5 years ministry experience were interviewed. All participants had the opportunity to reflect on their lived experience of ministry and responded to in-depth interview questions. Ethical guidelines for research were adhered to, and the researcher maintained objectivity and respectful engagement as an outsider to the tradition. The data analysis was completed through ATLAS.ti software and codes and categories led to the development of five major themes.

Ethical considerations

Ethical clearance to conduct this study was obtained from University of South Africa, College of Human Sciences Research Ethics Review Committee NHREC Registration #: Rec-240816-052, CREC Reference #: 59854006_CREC_CHS_2022.

Findings and discussions

The themes presented are grouped in three main dimensions: the personal, the communal and the public. Thus, themes were grouped on the NPPC leaders' role and understanding of accountability, communal accountability towards church members and finally public accountability in the community.

Leaders' accountability

Findings revealed that the church leaders in the NPPC see themselves as autonomous in their leadership as they are led by the Holy Spirit in their prophetic spiritual practices. They do not necessarily support traditional accountability and governance structures, such as committees and a chain of leadership as they prefer to be open to the leading of the Holy Spirit rather than have fixed rules. Leaders operate independently, detached from their congregations, in various activities including decision-making. In the prophetic, the prophet's idea is the most important and only one (Banda 2020:5):

'It is the Spirit of God that strengthens us to be accountable for things in the flesh, remember we are in the season of the Holy Spirit, after this season there is nothing else that is why we call it the last times, we know that is the Holy Spirit that enables us.' (Respondent leader 3, L133)

'There is no structure or board; in prophetic ministry, we do not follow the board because there are people in the church who join us but do not worship God rather they are sent by the kingdom of the darkness to come and destroy the church, they come so that they can see the secret things which the church is doing and afterwards they will fight against your ministry like what the philistines have done to Samson in the Bible.' (Respondent leader 5, L60)

'There is no way in the prophetic ministry that I can put the board or people above me. The only person above me is my spiritual father; he is the one to hold me accountable if there is something that went wrong.' (Respondent leader 3, L201)

The leaders understood that they can serve God better without oppression by other leaders avoiding

any form of spiritual subjugation under the leadership and denominational frameworks of others. According to Dube (2020:1) several prophets in South Africa are unchallengeable; they prefer not being managed by any religious authority. They are not financially, religiously or ethically responsible to any Christian group or organisation (Degbe 2014:264). This conduct leads to conflicts and power struggles (Matshobane & Masango 2018:3) that result in church splits and a proliferation of churches in the movement.

In the sampled group, church leaders were not formally trained and none is required to become a minister because they believe that they are completely guided by the Holy Spirit in their ministry work. In other NPPC churches, some leaders receive the most basic instruction from unlicensed Bible colleges (Kgatle 2022:7). Adebomi and Omotosho (2022:4) allege that many church leaders take on their duties without much experience or training in how to lead. Kgatle suggests that if a prophet has a sound system, a tent and the ability to speak in English, starting a church can be done without any formal training (Kgatle 2022:3). Prophetic leaders understood the biblical text of Acts 4:13 which states:

When they saw the courage of Peter and John and realized that they were unschooled, ordinary men, they were astonished, and they took note that these men had been with Jesus.

They are suspicious of ministers who are formally trained; however, the idea of apprenticeship is valued. Yet leaders do feel 'called' to the ministry which infers a sense of responsibility and duty and a reason to account for their activities related to that calling.

The findings revealed that the NPPC movement places great importance on the guidance of a Spiritual Father figure in teaching. Spiritual Father mentorship refers to being led, supervised, guided and taught by someone who is spiritually mature and knowledgeable about spiritual matters. This type of training does not differ from the training of the traditional healers which involves rituals. However, numerous unqualified spiritual father figures have misguided several young ministers, highlighting the necessity of denominational mentorship to guide emerging prophets (Pondani 2019:110).

When a group of people bow to a Spiritual Father and create a network, they are referred to as their sons (Kgatle 2023). A spiritual parent helps believers connect with other family-like relationships based on faith. They create generational links that bind believers together (Dube 2018:5). This means that the Spiritual Father is important in bringing the Christian family together during difficult times to boost the family's faith and to increase church membership (Ramabulana 2018). However, as Kgatle states, a shortcoming is that spiritual fathers tend to focus attention on their financially secure offspring (Kgatle 2023). The conclusion can be drawn that formal training does not constitute an essential requirement for leadership in prophetic ministry. If the spiritual father lacks theological training, so do the sons (Pondani 2019:108).

Pentecostal prophets consider themselves as super-spiritual authorities and that they are uniquely anointed by God and that they obtain spiritual status that proves that they are closer to God than all believers (Magezi & Banda 2017:2). This means that the leaders can do whatever they want, and they do not like being held accountable to any person. Thwala (2020:28) states 'most of the time leaders of these churches show arrogance when interrogated about inexplicable actions committed, which changed the church affairs in South Africa in particular'. People frequently abuse their leadership authority in resource management where there are no rules governing leadership accountability (White & Pondani 2022:2).

Communal dimensions of accountability

Church leaders were asked in interviews for their understandings of accountability towards their church members. These leaders responded highlighting the nature of prophet ministry which involves a communal dimension towards accountability. They believed that it promotes the values of respect and protection for each member of the church not only from the leader but also from each other. It means close friendship, sharing common cultural values, a common faith, customs and ways of living together. Ultimately, the leader shows them how to act and have a common understanding towards faith and practices within the Church. It was revealed that church members of the prophetic usually do not ask their leaders to be responsible for their actions because they see them as their Spiritual Fathers and questioning the behaviour of a father as a child can be seen as disrespectful culturally:

'We teach good life and good behaviour in the church, and we obey the community rules. If the community demands your cooperation and a person is undermining them, they might decide to chase the person out of the community.' (Respondent leader 2, L268)

'To sort those who make mistakes in front of people we rebuke them in front of people, but some make light mistakes we hold them accountable separately and correct them but if they do not listen then they need to step down and no longer participate in the church.' (Respondent leader 6, L11)

'I am dealing with deliverance, healing, and prophecy that is my responsibility above all I am a watchman.' (Respondent leader 7, L125)

'I started to have dreams about things that are going to happen, daily dreams about dangers that are coming, and I saw open visions by this. I mean seeing things not completely asleep, I began to dream about myself ministering in the congregation and most of the time I will be prophesying.' (Respondent leader 5, L5)

'I am a prophet who moves through the instructions of God like there was a time where I was instructed to wash people's feet but afterwards the other pastors were not happy about what I did for they knew that after washing people feet they become yours, but to me, it was only a revelation from God because He wanted to heal people and in that process, some people when they enter their yard God will destroy all the charms around their homes and deliverance will happen.' (Respondent leader 10, L199)

Through prophetic rituals and practices followers receive 'services' to be able to deal with satanic forces and they can live peacefully and freely. It has been perceived that some individuals who claim to be prophets or pastors gain supernatural powers to exert control over their church members (Quayesi-Amakye 2015:66). However, in interviews, church leaders shared that they are committed to helping people, in line with the current problems facing society. It was reported that leaders visit people at home and provide charitable services when needed and are involved in various ways of service as listed further in the text.

Preference to prayer ministry

In the NPPC, the prayer ministry is used in different ways; this is uniquely done and includes fighting against spiritual forces by engaging in warfare and being committed to prayer. Many different types of prayers are offered, praying while fasting, praying on a mountain, praying for deliverance, praying all night, anointing oil prayer and anointing water prayer. Being accountable towards members involves the collective understanding of the methods of prayers that are conducted considering human dignity, privacy and morality. According to leaders, there should be no form of religious abuse by leaders and questionable prayer methods which might raise concerns leading to disunity.

Personalised understanding of the Holy Spirit

Personalised understanding of the Holy Spirit means that each person has a unique way of understanding and interpreting messages about the Holy Spirit based on their connection with God within the spiritual levels in the prophetic ministry. The question is how do they all come together and find a common meaning and understanding about how the Holy Spirit works? Will the Holy Spirit bring them spiritually together automatically? In John 16:13, the primary focus about the Holy Spirit in this scripture is to guide believers into all truth; it is very crucial to understand the Holy Spirit theology. If people have different understandings and interpretations about the Holy Spirit, there is a need to determine who is responsible for ensuring everyone follows the rules. The NPPC's leaders take charge of addressing concerns. In this case, accountability becomes crucial to organise and control everything, making sure that everyone is held responsible for their actions.

Unique deliverance and healing ministry

In the NPPC, leaders consider the ministry of deliverance and healing to be a highly effective practical tool for liberating individuals from spiritual afflictions, physical and mental issues that have been passed down through their families for many years (Kgatle 2022:2). Although a believer cannot be possessed by a demon, he can be oppressed in soul or body unless the evil influence is broken through prayer and deliverance (Asamoah 2016:1651). Being delivered means being freed from spiritual suffering or attacks from demons, while healing means getting better from a physical illness.

The gospel is seen as a strong way to handle problems like bad luck, curses, health issues and magic (Kgatle 2023).

Predictions over dreams and visions

In this tradition, dreams and visions are considered meaningful for foreseeing what will happen to people now and in the future. They are special and important in Christians' lives in the prophetic ministry, so it is important to figure out what they mean. The meaning can change depending on the situation, and they can be connected to worries or problems if people are unsure, scared, confused or dealing with a problematic situation. In this regard, it is also believed that 'many dreams are prophetic' (Goodman 2006:13). It is recorded in the Bible that Joseph used to dream, and his brothers hated him and when they saw him, they said, 'Here comes the dreamer' in Gen. 32:19. This means that people connect their dreams to what will happen in their future, believing that dreams can predict future events and cannot be disregarded. It is also written in the Bible that in a dream or vision during the night, when people are in deep sleep or dozing off in bed, God opens their ears and gives them important teachings found in Job 33:15–16.

In summary, accountability in a communal setting reveals that strong leadership is an important value for everyone, respecting each other in the relationships between leaders and their followers. It is the leadership style that focuses on the interest of other people in a communal setting and is not self-centred leadership, while in this tradition, church members have little to say about leadership, finances and decision making and unusual suspicious practices.

Community accountability

Church leaders were asked for their understandings of accountability towards the broader community. It was interesting to note that they related many unsavoury incidents and perceived 'attacks towards them' from the community:

'I think I have so many cases but one of them happened yesterday, I was in court where they said our church is making noise and our church is making people fight for no reason I had to stand there and show the skill of leadership and by the answer because some community members said no, this is stories, it never happens.' (Respondent leader 1, L121)

'This is what happened in 2020 I had to account for a case of allegations of rape and I was married, I went to prison for a day and the following day I was released because you see when God calls you, he also defend you and nobody will defeat the truth. The truth will always be the truth and God's justice prevail.' (Respondent leader 9, L209)

This highlights that the NPPC's understanding of doctrine and cultural privileges towards the community allows them to act in particular ways that may be perceived as unethical, abusive and criminal if there is no individual to account to. In interviews, church leaders recounted ministry experiences requiring them to show up in court, whether it was a community court or a legal one. Bushiri's supporters in

Pretoria mocked court proceedings, portraying them as a struggle with God. Kgatle (2020:4) alleges that the NPPC disregards the rule of law; for example, prophet Shepherd Bushiri and his wife escaped the trial because they fled South Africa. Other behavioural traits of the so-called toxic leadership include deliberately deceiving followers with falsehoods and inefficiencies because of misdiagnosing problems and not implementing solutions to identify problems (Burns 2017:40).

Neo-prophetic groupings are being scrutinised in their communities because of poor management (White & Pondani 2022). The leader's unique ways of leadership are alleged to be provocative. This impacts society, resulting in legal actions against leaders for criminal behaviour that cannot be linked with cultural influence. Mokhoathi and Rembe (2017:8) call on religious organisations to be a good example to society, including law enforcement and other civil agencies. Churches are not using their freedom to practice their religion while also considering their legal, ethical and community duties (CRL Rights Commission 2017:34).

Implications for pastoral practice

This study alerts one to the importance of accountability in Christian ministry and the responsibility towards church members and the broader community. A strong and mature leadership group that can hold leaders accountable when necessary is one of the ways that a functioning organisation can measure its capacity to lead effectively. Questions may be asked of the moral conduct of leaders. The CRL Rights Commission in South Africa reported on church practices in this tradition which they felt were problematic. These include not being able to run and manage churches well, using churches to make money illegally, making illegal advertisements, taking advantage of poor people by asking them for money or gifts, preachers pretending to be doctors and discussing people's health and moving money in and out of the country disregarding financial regulations (CRL Report 2017:2, 32–33). As the prophetic practices are claimed to be influenced by the Holy Spirit it means practices should be aligned with the attribute of God and not cause harm, and if not aligned to this, then practices remain in doubt and may be questioned. Banda (2021:9) argues 'Instead of thriving on unusual dramatic religious experientialism, NPPC should be challenged to realise that sound religious faith is ethical'.

It would be worthwhile for the NPPC traditions to be part of an educational and religious training affiliation and to be part of the Christian fraternity with other religious bodies for spiritual learning, support, accountability and fellowship in the African Pentecostals movement. In this way, churches are prepared for fruitful ministry in response to the public's existing needs. As a resolution, Pollitt (2015) recommends that:

Bodies like the SACC or the Interfaith Council should speak out about the importance of theological training. University faculties

of theology should be encouraged to engage with the public on these matters. Mainstream churches (and religious bodies) need to be more aggressive in their condemnation of the lunacy. Some churches already insist on lengthy study and preparation for the ministry and do try to regulate those they ordain. These include criminal background checks on prospective clergy, psychological evaluations, and intense pastoral preparation. (p. 1)

Conclusion

This study highlighted the unique way in which the NPPC understands ministerial accountability and discovered various understandings around personal leadership, within the congregation and the broader community. It reveals unique understandings and leadership challenges which have broadly questioned the credibility and accountability within the NPPC. Gaining insight into the African cultural heritage and values when examining the neo-Pentecostal perspective will enhance understanding regarding their beliefs and principles; thus, more research is needed in this regard. This study speaks to the normative task of the Church and creates a new reflection on ministerial accountability and ethical practices as well as implications for congregational development broadly.

Acknowledgements

Competing interests

The authors declare that they have no financial or personal relationship(s) that may have inappropriately influenced them in writing this article.

Authors' contributions

S.E.L. conceptualised and conducted the study investigation, analysis and write-up. M.N. supervised the study and reviewed and edited the article.

Funding information

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

Data availability

Data sharing is not applicable to this article as no new data were created or analysed in this study.

Disclaimer

The views and opinions expressed in this article are those of the author(s) and are the product of professional research. It does not necessarily reflect the official policy or position of any affiliated institution, funder, agency or that of the publisher. The author(s) are responsible for this article's results, findings and content.

References

Adebomi, J.A. & Omotosho, O.J., 2022, 'Efficiency of distinct leadership styles on the productivity of church administration', *Humanus Discourse* 2(4), 1–10.

- Anderson, A.H., 2013, *An introduction to Pentecostalism: Global Charismatic Christianity*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Asamoah, M.K., 2016, 'Leveraging the deliverance phenomenon: Penteco/charismatic vista', *Journal of Religion and Health* 55, 1642–1664. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-016-0209-8>
- Banda, C., 2020, 'Unsafe spaces? An ecclesiological evaluation and response to recent controversial practices in some South African neo-Pentecostal churches', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 41(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v41i1.2108>
- Banda, C., 2021, 'Whatever happened to God's holiness? The holiness of God and the theological authenticity of the South African neo-Pentecostal prophetic activities', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 42(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v42i1.2323>
- Burns, W.A., 2017, 'A descriptive literature review of harmful leadership styles: Definitions, commonalities, measurements, negative impacts, and ways to improve these harmful leadership styles', *Creighton Journal of Interdisciplinary Leadership* 3(1), 33–52. <https://doi.org/10.17062/cjil.v3i1.53>
- CRL Rights Commission, 2017, *Report on hearings on the commercialisation of religion and abuse of people's belief systems*, viewed 16 May 2023, from <https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/25278/>.
- Degbe, S.K., 2014, "'Generational Curses" and the "Four Horns": Illustrating the shape of the primal worldview in contemporary African Pentecostal-Charismatic spirituality', *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 23(2), 246–265. <https://doi.org/10.1163/17455251-02301007>
- Dube, B., 2020, "'Go and prophesy in your own land": Foreign prophets and populism in South Africa. Evoking the need of Jonathanic theology for peaceful resolution of difference', *Religions* 11(1), 42. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel11010042>
- Dube, Z., 2018, 'Patriarchy reinvented? "Spiritual parenting within African Pentecostalism in Zimbabwe"', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 39(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v39i1.1777>
- Goodman, E., 2006, *The dream code: 91 dreams Secrets revealed, plus 111 prayer 'Bullets' to manifest your success dreams-and cancel the bad and the ugly!* Strathmore University: International and Pan-American, Nairobi.
- Joannides, V., 2012, 'Accountability and the problematics of accountability', *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 23(3), 244–257. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpa.2011.12.008>
- Kaguara, K.T., 2018, *The influence of Christian leadership on the ethical practices of Christian professionals: A case study of Citam Thika Road Church*, Pan Africa Christian University, Nairobi.
- Kgatle, M.S., 2020, 'New paradigms of pneumatological ecclesiology brought about by new prophetic churches within South African Pentecostalism', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 41(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v41i1.2053>
- Kgatle, M.S., 2022, "'Go deeper papa, prophesy, do something": The popularity and commercialisation of prophetic deliverance in African Pentecostalism', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 43(1), 2480. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v43i1.2480>
- Kgatle, M.S., 2023, 'Spiritual fathering in Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity in Southern and Western Africa: Toward an inclusive model', *The International Journal of Religion and Spirituality in Society* 13(1), 143–152. <https://doi.org/10.18848/2154-8633/CGP/v13i01/143-152>
- Kroesbergen, H., 2017, *Neo-Pentecostalism in Southern Africa-some critical reflections*, Christian Literature Fund, Wellington.
- Kunhiyop, S.W., 2008, *African Christian ethics*, Hippo Books, London.
- Magezi, V. & Banda, C., 2017, 'Competing with Christ? A critical Christological analysis of the reliance on Pentecostal prophets in Zimbabwe', *In die Skriflig* 51(2), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ids.v51i2.2273>
- Matshobane, M. & Masango, M.J., 2018, 'Understanding power struggles in the Pentecostal church government', *HTS: Theological Studies* 74(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v74i1.4949>
- Mokhoathi, J. & Rembe, N.S., 2017, 'Religious liberties and the constitution of South Africa: A call for religious accountability', *Scriptura: Journal for Contextual Hermeneutics in Southern Africa* 116(1), 1–10.
- Osmer, R.R., 2011, 'Practical theology: A current international perspective', *HTS: Theological Studies* 67(2), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v67i2.1058>
- Pollitt, R., 2015, 'Religion: We don't need no regulation', *Daily Maverick*, viewed 16 May 2023, from <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-08-14-religion-we-dont-need-no-regulation/>.
- Pondani, S., 2019, "'Prophets of Doom": The phenomenon of healing and power dynamics in Neo-Pentecostal African churches', unpublished doctoral dissertation, Stellenbosch University, viewed 16 May 2023, from <https://scholar.sun.ac.za/items/40358726-9f13-4e69-97f8-abb20c82006>.
- Quayesi-Amakye, R.D.J., 2015, 'Prophetic practices in contemporary Pentecostalism in Ghana', *Canadian Journal of Pentecostal-Charismatic Christianity* 6(1), 43–69.
- Ramantswana, H., 2019, 'Prophets praying for, or preying on people's faith: A reflection on prophetic ministry in the South African context', *In die Skriflig* 53(4), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ids.v53i4.2495>
- Ramabulana, M.S., 2018, *Church Mafia captured by secret powers: An untold African narrative*, Freedom Publishers, Johannesburg.
- Resane, K.T., 2017, 'And they will make you eat grass like oxen (Daniel 4:24): Reflections on recent practices in some New Charismatic Churches', *Pharos Journal of Theology* 98(1), 1–17.
- Resane, K.T., 2023, 'The decolonising of theology through African proverbs', *In die Skriflig* 57(1), a2995. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ids.v57i1.2995>
- Schoeman, W.J., 2015, Exploring the practical theological study of congregations', *Acta Theologica* 22, 64–84. <https://doi.org/10.4314/actat.v21i1.65>
- Thwala, T.C., 2020, 'The accountability of spiritual leaders in mushrooming independent churches: A pastoral response', unpublished PhD, University of Pretoria, South Africa, viewed 16 May 2023, from <https://repository.up.ac.za/handle/2263/82449>.

Trull, J.E. & Carter, J.E., 2004, *Ministerial ethics: Moral formation for church leaders*, Baker Books, Grand Rapids, MI.

Thinane, J.S., 2021, 'Misuse of religious titles by self-proclaimed spiritual leaders: Prophets, apostles, and popes in South Africa', *Pharos Journal of Theology* 102, 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.46222/pharosjot.102.035>

Vorster, N., 2021, 'Defining harm: The harm principle and religious rights in South Africa', *Verbum et ecclesia* 42(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v42i1.2210>

White, P. & Pondani, S., 2022, 'Church-franchise: Missional innovation for church planting and leadership mentorship in neo-Pentecostal and neo-Prophetic Churches in Africa', *Religions* 13(8), 698. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13080698>