






# Hybrid Sufism for enhancing quality of life: Ethnographic perspective in Indonesia



## Authors:

Suwito Suwito<sup>1</sup>   
 Ida Novianti<sup>2</sup>   
 Suparjo Suparjo<sup>1</sup>   
 Corry A. Widaputri<sup>3</sup>   
 Muhammad 'Azmi Nuha<sup>1</sup> 

## Affiliations:

<sup>1</sup>Department of Islamic Education, Faculty of Islamic Education and Teacher Training, Universitas Islam Negeri (UIN) Prof. K.H. Saifuddin Zuhri, Purwokerto, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>Department of History of Islamic Civilization, Faculty of Islamic Literature and Humanities, Universitas Islam Negeri (UIN) Prof. K.H. Saifuddin Zuhri, Purwokerto, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>Department of English Literature, Universitas Islam Negeri (UIN) Sunan Gunung Djati, Bandung, Indonesia

## Corresponding author:

Suwito Suwito,  
suwitons@gmail.com

## Dates:

Received: 20 Oct. 2021  
 Accepted: 29 Jan. 2022  
 Published: 30 Mar. 2022

## How to cite this article:

Suwito, S., Novianti, I., Suparjo, S., Widaputri, C.A. & Nuha, M.A., 2022, 'Hybrid Sufism for enhancing quality of life: Ethnographic perspective in Indonesia', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 78(4), a7198. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v78i4.7198>

## Read online:



Scan this QR code with your smart phone or mobile device to read online.

Sufism has two main dimensions: vertical (God's pleasure) and horizontal (harmony with nature, society and local wisdom). In reality, many Sufis are considered less concerned about the balancing between vertical and horizontal dimensions. The research explores the concepts and practices of hybrid Sufism undertaken by *Kyais* (religious leaders) and their followers in improving quality of life. Ethnography was used for exploring the mindset and activities of Kyai and his followers. This study involved four *Kyais* in Java and Kalimantan, Indonesia. Research data were obtained through participant observations, in-depth interviews and documentation. The data were analysed by Spadley's ethnographic steps as follows: (1) domain analysis, (2) taxonomy analysis, (3) componential analysis and (4) cultural-thematic analysis. The results showed that hybrid Sufism could improve quality of life. Hybrid Sufism can better appreciate and interpret local wisdom with an attitude of preserving nature and a positive understanding of worldly wealth, increasing the hard work ethos to achieve material-spiritual qualities.

**Contribution:** This article shows that hybrid Sufism encourages the life of Sufis in harmony between vertical and horizontal aspects. This understanding and lifestyle give rise to respect for others, being friendly to the environment and interpreting life and local wisdom.

**Keywords:** hybrid Sufism; quality of life; *tazkiyat al-nafs*; eco-Sufism; *dhikr*.

## Introduction

Previous studies show that many people are still laymen with regard to Sufism. The survey, conducted on 247 respondents between the ages of 18 and 60, showed that 237 (95.6%) respondents had heard of Sufism. Amongst them, 193 respondents (78.9%) had also heard of the term of *Tarekat* (Sufi order). What is surprising, however, is that 219 (88.6%) of the respondents did not understand the content of Sufism. According to the perception of 219 (88.6%) respondents, Sufism deals only with the affairs of the afterlife and formal *dhikr* [remembering God] as vertical aspects. In practical terms, 170 (68.8%) respondents have not been interested in learning and following Sufism teachings. For respondents, Sufism is more suitable for the elderly (Suwito 2020).

In addition, some participants (31%) say that Sufism around them shows that it tends to be ascetic, afterlife oriented (vertical) and less concerned about things that are worldly (horizontal). Sufi performances that have been seen by respondents tend to be far from the truth of Islam. Their clothes and sarongs are less tidy. Sarongs that are used by Sufis are sometimes rumpled, not ironed neatly. Many Sufi activities run long *wirids* [reciting God's name] with economies that are sometimes neglected.

Sufi life is ideally balanced between vertical and horizontal aspects. In addition to being close to God (act right according to him) (Richardson & Rammal 2018), hear Him (Gent & Muhammad 2019), as well as close to nature and society (Yang, Liu & Zhang 2019), it can appreciate local wisdom (Rahiem & Rahim 2021). Sufism emphasises that Muslims should build quality of life and moral formation (Salik 2019). It also glorifies ethical principles (Bhatti et al. 2021).

Sufi life balance that pays attention to two vertical and horizontal aspects is called hybrid Sufism. The most common technique in carrying out vertical elements is *dhikr* under the guidance of the *Shaykh*/Sufi teacher (Kirabaev & Chistyakova 2020). The horizontal aspect is to take care of utilising nature wisely, caring for, interpreting and finding God in the universe, in society and local wisdom. The two aspects will increase the level of *ihsan*/high spiritual level (Hartati 2018).

**Copyright:** © 2022. The Authors. Licensee: AOSIS. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution License.

But in reality, there are some gaps in this article. Firstly, many Sufis ignore the balance between vertical and horizontal dimensions in practice. There are Sufis who attach too much importance to vertical relationships only. He then did 'uzlah' [self-isolation]. Radical self-isolation leads to antisocial and environmental concerns (Chalmers 2017). *Uzlah* is understood as the practice of isolating oneself from society and worldly life with the aim of soul-bending (Baidowi et al. 2021). The *uzlah* techniques are similar to 'self-isolation' or 'self-quarantine' techniques (Baidowi et al. 2021). *Uzlah* can bring awareness and noble nature to Sufis (Rahmat & Yahya 2021).

Secondly, Sufi lifestyles are often burdensome on one side of the dimension. One side is vertical or horizontal. Thirdly, leaning on one dimension will result in the marginalising of another dimension. Too burdensome for the afterlife will result in ignoring the life of the world and vice versa. Fourthly, leaning towards vertical dimensions results in marginalising horizontal dimensions; for example, Sufis who are lazy in seeking sustenance don't appreciate local wisdom, don't fight for worldly success and it doesn't matter if they're people and their people. According to him, the human mind tends to underestimate both others, nature and local wisdom (Machouche, Bensaid & Ahmed 2019). Fifthly, Sufism is often used as an excuse for the failure of worldly life.

Therefore, this research is relevant. Its purpose is to find answers to how hybrid Sufism concepts and practices help in arranging the balance of vertical and horizontal, social relation, environmental concerns and maintain harmony with local wisdom.

## Literature review

### Hybrid concept in Islam

In language, hybrid means two or more ways. 'That is the product of mixing two or more different things' (Fu et al. 2019). Hybrid is a combination of two energy sources that can power the target object (Harmini & Nurhayati 2018). Hybrid systems usually use two ways/methods on an object (Goranko 2019). The goal is to improve the effectiveness of the goals and performance specified (Garrick et al. 2020).

Studies related to hybrid systems are generally dominated by the study of technology. However, in these two decades, hybrid studies have also entered the domain of lifestyle, organisational management (Kannothra, Manning & Haigh 2018) and financial management (Abdel-Basset et al. 2019). This concept also penetrates the Islamic hybrid with customs or traditions (Saharudin 2019) and also in Sufism (Hermansen 2019; Muttaqin 2012, 2014).

The Qur'an contains studies and teachings on the combination of two energy sources (hybrid). God created everything symmetrically (QS.67:3). Muslim life must be good and balanced, namely the world and the hereafter, vertical and horizontal (QS.2:201; 28:77). A combination of economic resources with reading the seasons *al-syita'* [winter] and

*al-shaif* [summer] is also explained in QS.106:1-4. Life's success is also explained through a hybrid system, that is, the existence of faith (vertical) and charity (horizontal) as in QS.103:1-3. Furthermore, the Qur'an also mentions the characteristics of smart people (*ulul albab*) who can combine the *dhikr* system and think (QS.3:190-191). Objects of thought are also hybrids, namely *afaq* [macro cosmos] and *anfusihiin* [micro cosmos] (QS.41:51).

The hybrid system in the Qur'an as described here is strengthened by the Prophet. That vertical and horizontal energy must be integrated, thus filling each other. The Prophet punished a woman as an inhabitant of hell because it was only a good vertical aspect. The woman was diligent in worship, including night prayers and fasting on her day. However, the horizontal aspect is broken. Every day she gets angry, curses and hurts others (Ahmad:9298). The Prophet also reminded the balance of goodness between the dimensions of the earth (horizontal) and the dimensions of the sky (vertical), '*Irhamu man fi al-adh, yarhamkum man fi al-sama'* [love the inhabitants of the earth, you will surely be loved by the inhabitants of the sky] (Tirmidzi:1847, Baihaqy:11099).

However, the horizontal aspect can patch the vertical aspect that is lacking. It is described by the Prophet as related to prostitutes and thirsty dogs (Bukhari:3074, Ahmad:10212). In addition, the hadith is very popularly related to the vertical dimension, namely the pleasure of Allah hung on the pleasure of parents (horizontal) (Baihaqy:1486). In addition, the Prophet explains that a person has no faith (vertical) until he loves his brother as he loves himself (Bukhari:12; Tirmidzi:2439; Nasa'i:4930, 4931, 4953; Ahmad:13452).

### Hybrid Sufism and quality of life

As the given understanding, the concept of hybrid Sufism is a combination of aspects of *dhikr* and thought [*fikr*]. Both are energies for *wusul* [reach] and close to God. The highest goal of the Sufis [*'Arif*] is the pleasure and *mushahadah* [testify] of *Al-Haqq* [Allah] (Al-Ghazali 1983) and nothing else like *'irfan* [gnosis]. According to Ibn Sina, '*Al-Arif yurid Al-Haqq, la li syai'* [the '*Arif* only want God, not others] (Ibn Sina 1935).

A common Sufi path to reach the highest degree is *dhikr*. *Dhikr* is performed for *tazkiyat nafs* [ego-cleaning] at the *takhalli* [process of draining ugliness], *tahalli* [process of filling/installing] and *tajalli* [the process of manifestation and implementation]. The *salik*, usually joined in a certain order. The process of *takhalli* in the Shadzilyah order, for example, Sufi disciples by doing *wirid* read *istighfar* 100 times after *maghrib* prayer and after *fajr* [dawn] prayer.

*Dhikr* in Sufism is more dominant in the vertical aspect. *Dhikr* if performed to the maximum will lead Sufi disciples to a high level. But in QS. 3:190-191, *Dhikr* alone is not enough and has not been considered a smart person (*ulul albab*). Supported by QS. 41:51, God requires spiritual empowerment through a

hybrid system. It is a combination of *dhikr* and thinking. The object of *dhikr* is only Allah (vertical), while the object of thought [*tafakkur*] is a creature of Allah (horizontal). As the proposition, '*Tafakkaru di khalqillah, wa la tafakkaru fi al-Khaliq*' (think about God's creatures, don't think about God).

In Sufism, as al-Ghazali explained remembering or glancing [*iltifat*] other than Allah smooths the path of satan [*madakhil al-shaithan*] and strengthens the ego. Al-Ghazali explained that the devil has a trunk that always detects the human condition. If he remembers God, he will retreat, but if he remembers anything other than Allah, he will ambush. This is the importance of *dhikr* [vertical aspect] in Allah (Al-Ghazali 1983).

In the context of hybrid Sufism, the process of efficacy will be maximal, if you want and know to combine energy sources, namely tafakkur. According to An-Anshary (d. 481H), Tafakkur is an important aspect in *takhalli* [draining process]. He said, '*... Anna tafakkura talammusu al-bashirati li istidraki al-bughyah*'. [Tafakkur is a way to clear your eyes to achieve your true goals.] The object of *tafakkur* according to him is related to the quality of *tawhid* (*ain al-tawhid*), the secret of the creation of nature (*lathaijal-shun'ah*) and the true meaning of charity deeds (*ma'ani al-ahwal wa al-amal*) (Al-Anshary 1989).

In Ibn Sina's term, *riyadhah* [spiritual training] should be performed hybrid, through the vertical aspect, namely worship as a *dhikr* of Allah and *tafakkur* [understanding the secrets of nature, horizontal aspects]. For him, these two things can tame *nafs ammarah*, the lowest level of nafs. The impact of *tafakkur* can activate the level of *qudrah aqliyah* [intellectual power] in humans. This level of *aqliyah* exceeds the imagination level (*qudrah khayyaliyah*) and the estimation level (*qudrah wahmiyyah*). Beautiful words of wisdom and music can be used as an instrument (*washilah*) for this purpose (draw near to God) (Al-Razi 1935; Ibn Sina 1935).

In this context, Muslim philosophers such as Ibn Sina (d.1031 AD) and At Thusi (d.1274 AD) and great Sufis such as Al-Anshari (d.1089 AD), Al-Ghazali (d.1111 AD), al-Tilimsani (d.1291 AD) combine vertical and horizontal aspects to strengthen the achievement of Allah (close to Allah). This hybrid effect further makes them more prudent and harmonious by understanding the reality of the *kasrah* [plurality] of beings. By *tafakkur*, they have a deep understanding that there is a true *sun'ah* Allah [creation of Allah] and *ahwal wa amal* [deeds and circumstances] of his creatures. This is what causes them to be more tolerant, understand differences and have harmony in the universe.

The concept of hybrid Sufism also include achieving quality of life. They include four indicators: (1) physical health, (2) mental state, (3) good social relations and (4) harmony with nature (environment) (Buccieri et al. 2020). There are three important things in reassessing the quality of life, namely honesty, fairness and grateful (Smedema 2020). In the context of quality of life, studies showed that transcendence,

bipolar paradigm, social support and family support, as well as engaging in activities have a positive effect on the formation of quality of life people or groups of people (Anyayo et al. 2021; Calegaro et al. 2019; Fernández-ávalos et al. 2020; Filipic et al. 2021; Wittenberg et al. 2017; Zhang & Ma 2020).

## Research methods

### Research design, approach and informants

This research used qualitative design (Creswell et al. 2007) and was conducted by ethnographic studies (Spradley & McCurdy 1984, 2012). The study used participant observations and in-depth interviews with selected informants (Gold 1997). The concepts and ideas of the hybrid of Sufism were unearthed, interpreted, related by philosophical concepts and practices in Sufism.

As for the place, setting and informant of this research, it was conducted in the community of Jama'ah Masjid Aolia (JMA) Panggang Gunung Kidul, Yogyakarta with Kiai Ibn Hajar (IH) as the central figure. This research was also conducted at Pesan Trend Ilmu Giri (PTIG) Imogiri Bantul, Yogyakarta dengan Kiai Nasruddin Anshoriy (NA), Pesantren Sufi Haqquna (PSH) Gresik with Kiai Fauzan (FZ) and di Pesantren Al-Ihsan Pontianak (AIP) with one of his caregivers Tuan Guru Rahmatullah (TGR).

This location was chosen because the four have their uniqueness related to the hybrid Sufism practices. They combine vertical and horizontal dimensions in their way. Jama'ah Masjid Aolia and PITG are known to have the concept of ecosufism and harmony towards the universe, while PSH and AIP have horizontal aspects of Sufism related to socio-economic aspects.

### Data collection and analysis technique

As mentioned here, this study is classified as qualitative research with ethnographic patterns. Therefore, the data collection technique used observations of interview participants and in-depth interviews with informants. Data were collected from 2010 to 2019 with live-in and snowballing techniques through each community as a key informant. Researchers directly follow some activities that are considered important both vertically such as *mujahadah* [hard work towards God], recitation, *suluk* [spiritual journey], *manaqib* [Sufi biographical readings], *sewelasan* [Sufism event on the 11th] and horizontal aspects of eco-Sufism activities and socio-economic activities at the research location.

Semi-structured in-depth interviews were conducted to get the deep meaning of the activities and symbols. The results of the interview and participant observation were recorded as ethnographic field notes. The data are then checked (triangulation of data) by checking methods, subjects and content. The collected and verified data were analysed with Spradley ethnographic summary steps, as follows: (1)

domain analysis, (2) taxonomy analysis, (3) componential analysis and finally (4) cultural-thematic analysis (Spradley & McCurdy 1984, 2012).

## Results and discussions

### Hybrid Sufism and environmental awareness

In this section, the authors have described activities related to horizontal aspects of Sufism, that is, in the form of thoughts and practices related to the universe. Of course, this practice as the goal of Sufism is close to Allah. In addition to being close to Allah, this activity of thinking [*tafakkur*] will develop a more conscious environment.

In the horizontal aspect of Sufism, NA always explains the existence of nature. Everything in the universe is always praising God [*tasbih*]. Their *tasbih* [praise of God] can be synergised with human *tasbih*. Therefore, NA together with its *Santri* [kiai's follower] initiated the 'Hutan Santri' [Santri Forest] covering an area of 2 hectares. NA explained:

'In the Quran, all these things are extolling (*tasbih*). They can pray for us. That is if we want and know-how. Therefore, if there is a wedding, the bride-to-be provides 3–5 teak tree seeds as a witness. When you finish the wedding, furthermore, the seeds are planted in their respective yards or in the land of Pesan Trend.' (k1/u1/d1)

In addition to serving as prayer support, the environment is also an economy. After seven years of marriage, the couple may have a 6-year-old child. The teak that has been planted is also 7 years old. There is a teak tree as savings. The tree can be cut down if it's urgent through the system of '*tebang butuh*' with the condition that each logger must plant a minimum of three trees for cutting one tree.

The creation of 'Hutan Santri' [Santri Forest] began with the introduction of environmentally friendly concepts. Nasruddin Anshoriy has always promoted the concept of grace towards nature. He holds the principle, 'Love, loved'. That is, when one treats nature well, then nature will do the same, even more. In this context, NA explained:

'Together with Santri, we planted 10,000 seedlings of *Santalum album* and teak trees. These seeds are grants from the government. I involve them to be the "foster father" of the tree. When the tree is 3 years old, leaves, flowers, and seeds can be sold. After the tree is 10–15 years old, they can cut down if the emergency with "*tebang butuh*." The price is about 15 million or more.' (k1/u1/d2)

Horizontal dimensions in Sufism, IH involves Santri for eco-healing by making things green. Seven hectares of kars land is planted and managed into the teak forest. In this context, IH explained:

'Formerly, bukit next to this mosque looks like a mountain of stone. Black carst stone. The dry season is always dry. There's no water. Assisted by the Santri and Jamaah, the stone karts are pounded with *dhikr*. *Alhamdulillah*, By the power of God, It is now a green forest. Water sources are beginning to appear, even if they are small.' (k2/u1/d1)

In addition, IH invited and involved Santri in *tadabbur* [think about] nature. In the horizontal context of Sufism, Nature is a verse (proof, sign) of the existence of Al-Haqq (Allah). According to IH:

'Nature is a golden bridge to reach God. Nature is science. Nature is also a creature like us. To hurt nature is to hurt his creator. An example of hurting nature is harvesting young mangoes. It causes the "pain" of the mango tree. It's like a woman who still has to breastfeed her baby. Then, suddenly she and her baby were separated. The woman and the baby will be sick.' (k2/u1/d2)

According to FZ, in the horizontal aspect of the hybrid Sufism, nature is made by God as a means of human happiness and perfection. In this context FZ, explains:

'World is for the happiness and perfection of man. However, if in the world he is miserable, then he has something wrong with him. In this world, Humans should be better. This world is jewelry. Don't have the slightest intention to ruin the world, Because the consequences will come back to the culprit.' (k3/u1/d2)

It is also stated by TGR that: 'Humans are microcosmos. They reflect macro cosmos' (k4/u1/d1).

Based on their interviews, if their opinions were associated with the horizontal aspect of Sufism, NA and IH strongly promote and practice environmental care with a Sufi approach. This is in line with the concept of ecosufism (Ahmad 2019; Suwito 2010) and associated with environmental mitigation (Ahmad 2019; Febriani 2018; Imamah 2017; Rofiq 2019; Suwito 2010). Meanwhile, NA, IH, FZ and TGR believe there is a reciprocal law. If you do good to nature, nature and God will return well and vice versa. This is in line with Emoto and 'Backster Effect' (Suwito 2010). Nasruddin Anshoriy, IH, FZ and TGR believe in compound success. One's success involves the other and by God's permission. The success of a person eating one spoon of rice is because it is supported by wind, water, air, soil, wind-moving angels, powder-carrying animals, farmers, grass cleaners, carriers, grain dryers, grinders, cookers and so on (Al-Ghazali 1983). This awareness of metacognitive can be achieved by horizontal aspects of Sufism (hybrid Sufism). Al-Ghazali often reminds Muslims not to get caught up in the orientation of the world. To him, the world is just a tool, not a purpose in life (Al-Anshary 1989).

### Hybrid Sufism and social care

In addition to *dhikr* and *mujahadah* routine Tuesday Pon, which is vertical, NA installed his *Jamaah* [congregation] mindset with an understanding of the worldview (horizontal aspect). Related to this worldview, NA explained that the world is the capital of the hereafter. Without the world, human is not perfect. In this context, NA explained:

'... if we are in a good world, then God willing in the hereafter we will be good. Our connection with God is also good. That's for the believer. Prostrate during prayer is a vertical aspect, it can



also mean horizontal. Prostration means devotion to others.' (k1/u2/d1)

Next, NA explained:

'A Sufi should have a caring nature for all beings. Allah has the name al-Rahman and as-Salam and others. We must be as good as we can. There is a greeting ritual by looking to the left right, when we end the prayer, that's what it means to be, we're asked to care about each other.' (k1/u2/d2)

Then, this world's pangan inspired NA related to the establishment of *Baitul Mal wa Tamwil* (BMT). '*Talang Emas*' (Golden Gutter) as opposed to loan shark activity in the village. This activity suffocates farmers since the growing season. Loan sharks give capital to farmers for planting activities, consequently farmers must sell the harvest to them. With this pattern, commodity prices are controlled by loan sharks. With the establishment of BMT, farmers gradually switched to BMT. Farmers were assisted by BMT in the procurement of seedlings. When harvesting, farmers are free to sell their crops. The price of grain that is all per kilo grams Rp. 500 can be sold three times Rp. 1500.

Meanwhile, Kyai IH has always stressed that the Sufi goal is Allah. He said, '*Dalan marang Allah, iku seakehe mahluk*' [the Sufi purpose is the pleasure of Allah. The way to God is as much as His creature.] (k2/u2/d1). However, humans often stray from God. They walk not towards God, but Satan. '*Kita kedah peduli niki, peduli dateng tauhid mereka*' [we should care about this, care about their *tawhid*.] (k2/u2/d2).

Horizontal aspects in hybrid Sufism practiced by IH, he fights shamans who cooperate with the devil. The shamans attract followers with the lure of free treatment. According to IH:

'It's very dangerous, man. The shamans transact through free medical activities. Transactions with demons are done by shamans subtly. The patient didn't understand anything. He was caught up in the shaman's activities. If the treatment is paid, it's okay. Any disease, including cancer, is treated immediately. In *tawhid*, this is very dangerous.' (k2/u2/d3)

This is a form of social-spiritual care. Ibn Hajar always fought shamans who mislead the public. Many shamans ended up bowing and claiming defeat, as experienced by BSR. For spiritual strengthening and the care of the creed, IH advised his Santri and Jamaah to read the prayer [*wirid*] '*Pedang Tauhid*' [Sword of *Tawhid*]. According to IH, 'This is one of my duties. I am entrusted by God to take care of the two worlds, human and *jinn*. I have to help save people's faith' (k2/u2/d4).

The horizontal aspect associated with Sufi social care is preventing any form of disobedience, such as theft, corruption, infidelity and others. The most distinctive and unique Sufism-based social care activities carried out by Kiai Fauzan (FZ) installed the *Nur* [Light] of Muhammad and beared the pain of Santri and Jamaah. He said:

'A bright heart is the capital of life. With a clear heart, man can distinguish right from wrong. On the contrary, a dark heart is a distant cause with God and cause imperiousness, infidelity, corruption, and other bad deeds.' (k3/u2/d1)

In addition, to tend on installing a light on the heart, FZ claims to be a 'sick insurer' (especially his Jamaah), mainly when the angel Izrail will take his life the Jamaah. That's as he said, 'I was entrusted by Allah to "bear the pain" of the Jama'at when he met his death' (k3/u2/d2).

Meanwhile, the horizontal dimension of Sufism carried out by TGR is to serve the community with education. With his family, he founded and managed education with the institution '*Al-Ihsan*'. The institution houses poor children and underprivileged orphans. He said 'education is an important means in all aspects of life. Especially the Qur'an's education and skills. Children should get Quranic education and skills from an early age' (k4/u2/d1).

This explanation shows that all *mahdhah* [clear] worship according to NA, IH and FZ has horizontal dimensions. In the context of Sufism, true happiness will arise if one can practice worship, which further gives rise to religious ethics consistently (Omar et al. 2021). The prostration called NA here can be implemented in the frame of loyalty and social services (Ahmad 2019; Suwito 2010). Through Sufism, social care and compassion are easily installed and implemented (Khan et al. 2020). In addition, Sufis are agents and saviors of *tawhid* society (Al-Anshary 1989). This is different from the *Malamatiyah madhab* [sect], which has a different pattern in responding to the life of the world (Torabi, Dastranj & Vahdani 2014).

### Hybrid Sufism: Harmony life

Living in harmonious, friendly and balanced relationships is the desire of every creature. Sufism, theoretically and practically, can lead to this kind of life. In the implementation of hybrid Sufism, efforts to live harmoniously were carried out and initiated by NA. He said:

'We at Pesan Trend Ilmu Giri have implemented life harmony by holding an Interfaith Youth Camp on March 16–19, 2017. Activities are filled with interfaith dialogue. The purpose of dialogue is to know each other and be brothers. The basis of this activity is none other than the belief that the origin of all beings comes from the One, God. Diversity must be managed and harmonized.' (k1/u3/d1)

In addition, other practices in Giri Science related to living harmony as an implementation of hybrid Sufism delivered NA, he said:

'Before pandemic, we have a commemoration of *Malem Selikuran* (the 21st night of *hijriyah*) every year. In this way, a parade was held by several young people. They bring *rujak* (Javanese salad), *tumpeng panca warna* (coloured cone-shaped rice), *ambengan* (holy rice), *kembang* (flower), *ingkung* (whole chicken meat), and *gunungan* (mountain-shaped crops). The food at this event is holy rice, glutinous, compote, and *apem* (Javanese snack). It's all a symbol of harmony.' (k1/u3/d2)

In line with NA, IH said that living harmoniously requires dialogue. According to IH, compassion becomes a prerequisite of harmonious living. In this context, IH explained:

'Not only with humans, we must be harmonious, but, harmonious also with all beings. These include jinn, angels, plants and particles such as soil, rocks, and water. Also, there are creatures in the parallel world who need our love as well.' (k2/u3/d1)

Implementation of harmonious living by IH is indicated by leadership style and pattern in the management of Jamaah. According to him, in his life history, he was angry with his Santri and Jamaah only three times. In every activity, he always showed affection and a face *sumpringah* [cheerful]. In serving the Santri and Jamaah, he said:

'The service must be good, if it can be satisfactory. There are three parties that must be served well, namely (1) internal, (2) external, and (3) eternal. Who's internal? They are santri and kyai. Who is external, yes, they are other parties like the government and others, who is eternal? Yes, it is Allah, the Messenger of Allah, our guardian angel (*mu' aqqibat*). All three should be well served. Especially God, that he might be good for us.' (k2/u3/d2)

In line with FZ. He explained that the cause of harmony is pleasure (*ridha*). In this context, FZ explained:

'The basis of harmony is pleasure or willingness. Someone is willing to be with a different friend. There's nothing in the world. Try to find out which one can be the same. Conjoined twins are different. Therefore, it must always be harmonious.' (k3/u3/d1)

Unlike TGR, he said that the difference is a strength. He explained, that the difference in right and left wings cause birds to fly. TGR said:

'Birds can fly because of harmony. It can fly using two different wings. He wouldn't be able to fly with just one wing. Damaging one of these elements is the same as damaging the balance function. This will lead to an apocalypse. Floods, landslides, and other disasters are the cause of disharmony.' (k4/u3/d1)

From the given description, the opinions of NA, IH, FZ and TGR are in line with the importance of *tafakkur* activities (Mat Akhir & Sabjan 2015; Vicini 2017). Contemplation of God's verses on earth is an important session in life. Results of *tafakkur* can be used to open insights. Thinking with horse glasses will give birth to fanaticism. Blind fanatics on one particular *madhhab* (*asabiyah*) become *hijab* [spiritual barrier] (Salim 2013). Aggressive nature will be provoked from these fanatics [*asabiyah*] and further decrease the quality of the heart. The view of unity in diversity or *al-wahdah fi al-kasrah* [unity in abundance] can enrich Sufis into agents of mercy. This opinion is by the concept of *wahdat* [the Onest] of Ibn Arabi. Sufism is one kind of strategy to counter radicalism (Ahmad et al. 2021; Anshori, Prasojo & Muhtifah 2021).

### Hybrid Sufism: Local wisdom accommodation

Related to the practice and appreciation of local wisdom, NA held an earth alms ceremony (*Sedekah Bumi*). Nasruddin Anshori involves Jamaah and youths around

*Pesantren* [boarding school]. They did a *selamatan* and paraded the *gunungan*. This *gunungan* contains rice *tumpeng* and local produce of *palawija*. In the context of Sufism NA explained:

'From this earth, God has blessed many. The earth is god-sufficient to meet our needs. A thanksgiving event like this is considered *musyrik*? Indeed, this event is the inheritance of our ancestors. This event is good to remind us to always be grateful. At this event we bring produce such as: rice, corn, long beans, pumpkin, siyem, and others. This is all as a reminder and to resuscitate us to always be grateful and accept with sincerity God's gift.' (k1/u4/d1)

At the event, NA often displays traditional arts such as *gejug lesung*, *ledhek* and puppet stage. In the context of Sufism, NA explained:

'*Gejug Lesung* is a symbol of togetherness. While *Ledhek* is one of the arts that teach the lesson that God is blessed with all his creation. This nature is the *tajalli* (manifestation) or *madzhar* (locus) of Allah. We can learn from these manifestations.' (k1/u4/d2)

Different from IH, He did *da'wah* using *dangdut* [Indonesian popular music], *pencak silat* [Indonesian martial] and puppet performance. It was carried out during the inauguration of the Aolia Mosque in his village. According to him, this is a form of appreciation for local wisdom and the implementation of hybrid Sufism. This is explained by IH as follows:

'People love *dangdut* music. Therefore, I gave according to his liking. My goal is to get them to come to the mosque. In pentas *pencak silat*, the one who fights is me. I fought against my wife. Haha... The third night was a full night's puppet stage.' (k2/u4/d1)

In addition to the given practices, IH also deconstructed myths about Kanjeng Ratu Kidul (KRK). This KRK myth is very famous in Java. Ibn Hajar and his congregation believe in the existence of the figure. However, they are recognised as good figures. Kanjeng Ratu Kidul is one part of santri IH. Almost seven years of KRK images are played on the wall of the IH living room. In this context, IH explained:

'You can believe, or not. The evidents don't exist. In my opinion, KRK is a female *wali*. In the sea of *kidul* [Indian Ocean], there are nine kingdom of jinn rulers. Eight of them are already Muslims, already *shahada*. Only the jinn that has not been Muslimah, namely Roro Kidul. He is the devil, who is difficult to accept Islam. Eight KRK don't like the offerings (*sesaji*). They don't like to be worshipped. Who still likes the *sesaji* is Roro Kidul. The one who still likes to give offerings (*sesaji*), he is friends with Roro Kidul. People are not my friends. Are you happy to be my friend, or are you nice to be a friend of Roro Kidul?, Please...' (k2/u4/d2)

Ibn Hajar practices are different from FZ. At his boarding, FZ held a unique local wisdom activity. This activity is related to the horizontal aspect of Sufism. This activity was called '*Pembacaan Shalawat Tajril Fulus*' [Shalawat Money Flowing]. According to FZ, among the intentions of this activity is for Allah to flow sustenance (including) money with a torrent of blessings. Kiai Fauzan explained:

'Sufis may have a lot of money. He may have a nice car. He may have a new car. If necessary, every three years Sufis may have a new car. Which one do you have, have a car that is often damaged or new? If your car is damaged, you also think about repairing it, and finally you can forget Allah.' (k3/u4/d1)

The blessing of this activity, the sustenance of pilgrims is most abundant. This is evident from the infaq recorded in the WA Jamaah Haqquna Group under pseudonyms ranging from 1 to 25 million every month per person. This indicates that the activities of reading Shalawat Tajril Fulus bring the blessing of abundant sustenance to *jamaah*.

Tuan Guru Rahmatullah accommodates local wisdom carried out by the community in Pontianak. Among them, *slamatan Talak Bala'* [pray of reject misfortune] activities are accommodated by him. There are things to avoid, which is to feed the ghosts. As TGR explained:

'Traditions such as *slamatan*, with yellow, red, black, and eggs and roast chicken, which is done with the intention of *talak bala'* it's okay. Once again, we must avoid the intention of feeding ghosts.' (k4/u4/d1)

Practices and affirmations related to local wisdom conducted by NA, IH, FZ and TGR are still following *tawhid*. *Tawhid* is the essence of the teachings of the Prophets (prophetic mission) (Alkouatli 2018; Roqib 2011; Sahin 2018). Sufism often uses cultural approaches to *da'wah* activities (Subiyantoro, Kristiani & Wijaya 2020). Sunan Kalijaga preached peacefully without conflict with tradition. Sunan Kalijaga performs *da'wah* gradually through a cultural approach. He used puppets and cultural symbols.

Puppets are used as a fascination and become a medium of learning and *da'wah* (Waston 2018). In line with Sunan Kalijaga, Sunan Kudus used a *sad'u dzariah* [risk management] for *da'wah* approach. He avoided conflict with the community (Mundakir & Hidayat 2020). Sunan Kudus used wisdom in the creation of the minaret of *al-Aqsa Kudus* Mosque. This tower looks like a Hindu temple. In addition, he prohibited the slaughter of cows that were then considered sacred by the majority of Hindu people. This is the intelligence of Sunan Kudus in his *da'wah*. In this context, local wisdom that is in line with *tawhid* is categorised as *bid'ah* hasanah or good innovation (Basyir 2019).

## Conclusion

Hybrid Sufism can improve quality of life. Sufis can appreciate and interpret local wisdom with an attitude of maintaining and preserving nature, ability to respond to the richness of the world and a hard work ethic to increase material and spiritual capacities. Appreciation of local culture and wisdom is the key to harmony between vertical and horizontal dimensions. Sufism accommodates local culture as a transformation of cultural values and strategies. Activities of maintaining, innovation, improvement of the environment will provide benefits to creatures. Worldly wealth can be a fort of religion. Hard work can strengthen capacity, including

material and mental capacities. With hybrid Sufism, life becomes more balanced between aspects of the world and the hereafter, more friendly care about the environment, wiser with the local culture and can increase self-capacity, both material and spiritual. The implication of this study is to solidify the hybrid theory of Sufism. During this time, the existing hybrid Sufism has only studied local wisdom on the horizontal aspect of Sufism. Meanwhile, this research has contributed to further develop this theory. Hybrid Sufism can be productive through economic aspects, social relations, concern for the environment and harmony with local wisdom.

## Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank UIN Prof. K.H. Saifuddin Zuhri for providing support for this journal submission fund and Dr. Jumintono who has given advice on this article.

## Competing interests

The authors declare that they have no financial or personal relationships that may have inappropriately influenced them in writing this article.

## Authors' contributions

S. Suwito, I.N., S. Suparjo, C.A.W. and M.A.N. contributed to the design and implementation of the research, to the analysis of the results and to the writing of the manuscript.

## Ethical considerations

This article followed all ethical standards for research without direct contact with human or animal subjects.

## Funding information

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

## Data availability

Data sharing is not applicable to this article as no new data were created or analysed in this study.

## Disclaimer

The views and opinions expressed in this article are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the official policy or position of any affiliated agency of the authors.

## References

- Abdel-Basset, M., Mohamed, R., Zaied, A.E.N.H. & Smarandache, F., 2019, 'A hybrid plithogenic decision-making approach with quality function deployment for selecting', *Symmetry* 11(903), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.3390/sym11070903>
- Ahmad, M., 2019, 'Three sufi communities guarding the earth: A case study of mitigation and adaptation to climate change in Indonesia', *Al-Jami'ah* 57(2), 359–396. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2019.572.359-396>
- Ahmad, M., Aziz, A., Afad, M.N., Muniroh, S.T. & Qodim, H., 2021, 'The Sufi order against religious radicalism in indonesia', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 77(4), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i4.6417>



- Al-Anshary, A.I.A., 1989, *Manazil al-Sairin ila al-Haq al-Mubin*, Dar al-Turk li al-Nasyr, Tunisia.
- Al-Ghazali, A.H., 1983, *Ihya' Ulum al-Din*, TP, Kediri.
- Al-Razi, Q.D.M.M., 1935, *Syarah Al-Isyarat wa Tanbihat*, 2nd edn., Al-Quddus, Al-Nasyr wa al-Balaghah, Qumm.
- Alkoutli, C., 2018, 'Pedagogies in becoming Muslim: Contemporary insights from Islamic traditions on teaching, learning, and developing', *Religions* 9(11), 367. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9110367>
- Anshori, M.A., Prasajo, Z.H. & Muhtifah, L., 2021, 'Contribution of Sufism to the development of moderate Islam in Nusantara', *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 19(1), 40–48. <https://doi.org/10.24035/IJIT.19.2021.194>
- Anayo, L., Ashaba, S., Kaggwa, M.M., Maling, S. & Nakimuli-Mpungu, E., 2021, 'Health-related quality of life among patients with bipolar disorder in rural southwestern Uganda: A hospital based cross sectional study', *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes* 19(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12955-021-01729-5>
- Baidowi, A., Salehudin, A., Mustaqim, A., Qudsy, S.Z. & Hak, N., 2021, 'Theology of health of Quranic Pesantren in the time of COVID-19', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 77(4), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i4.6452>
- Baswir, K., 2019, 'The "acculturative islam" as a type of home-grown Islamic tradition religion and local culture in Bali', *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 13(2), 326–349. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2019.13.2.326-349>
- Bhatti, O.K., Bhatti, O., Öztürk, A., Maham, R. & Farooq, W., 2021, 'Examining Islamic piety at workplace via an artificial neural network', *Cogent Psychology* 8(1), 1907038. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311908.2021.1907038>
- Bucciari, K., Oudshoorn, A., Schiff, J.W., Pauly, B., Schiff, R. & Gaetz, S., 2020, 'Quality of life and mental well-being: A gendered analysis of persons experiencing homelessness in Canada', *Community Mental Health Journal* 56(8), 1496–1503. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10597-020-00596-6>
- Calegari, V.C., Canova Mosele, P.H., Lorenzi Negretto, B., Zatti, C., Miralha da Cunha, A.B. & Machado Freitas, L.H., 2019, 'The role of personality in posttraumatic stress disorder, trait resilience, and quality of life in people exposed to the Kiss nightclub fire', *PLoS One* 14(7), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0220472>
- Chalmers, I., 2017, 'Countering violent extremism in Indonesia: Bringing back the Jihadists', *Asian Studies Review* 41(3), 331–351. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2017.1323848>
- Creswell, J.W., Hanson, W.E., Clark, V.L.P. & Morales, A., 2007, 'Qualitative research designs: Selection and implementation', *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35(2), 236–264. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000006287390>
- Febriani, N.A., 2018, 'Ekosufisme Berwawasan gender Dalam Al-Qur'an', *Musawa Jurnal Studi Gender dan Islam* 16(1), 127. <https://doi.org/10.14421/musawa.2017.161.127-152>
- Fernández-ávalos, M.I., Pérez-Marfil, M.N., Ferrer-Cascales, R., Cruz-Quintana, F., Clement-Carbonell, V. & Fernández-Alcántara, M., 2020, 'Quality of life and concerns in parent caregivers of adult children diagnosed with intellectual disability: A qualitative study', *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 17(22), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17228690>
- Filipic, T., Sember, V., Pajek, M. & Jerman, J., 2021, 'Quality of life and physical activity of persons with spinal cord injury', *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 18(17). <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18179148>
- Fu, X., Zhang, Q., Wang, C. & Tang, J., 2019, 'Torque coordination control of hybrid electric vehicles based on hybrid dynamical system theory', *Electronics (Switzerland)* 8(6), 712. <https://doi.org/10.3390/electronics8060712>
- Garrick, R., Natan, A., Gould, T. & Kronik, L., 2020, 'Exact generalized Kohn-Sham theory for hybrid functionals', *Physical Review X* 10(2), 21040. <https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevX.10.021040>
- Gent, B. & Muhammad, A., 2019, 'Memorising and reciting a text without understanding its meaning: A multi-faceted consideration of this practice with particular reference to the Qur'an', *Religions* 10(7), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel10070425>
- Gold, R.L., 1997, 'The ethnographic method in sociology', *Qualitative Inquiry* 3(4), 388–402. <https://doi.org/10.1177/107780049700300402>
- Goranko, V., 2019, 'Hybrid deduction-refutation systems', *Axioms* 8(4), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.3390/axioms8040118>
- Hardini, H. & Nurhayati, T., 2018, 'Pemodelan Sistem Pembangkit Hybrid Energi Solar Dan Angin', *Elektrika* 10(2), 28. <https://doi.org/10.26623/elektrika.v10i2.1167>
- Hartati, S., 2018, 'Tazkiyatun nafs as an effort to reduce premarital sexual behavior of adolescents', *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal* 1(1), 33–44. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v1i1.207>
- Hermansen, M., 2019, '6 Beyond west meets east: Space and simultaneity in post-millennial Western Sufi autobiographical writings 149', in J. Malik & S. Zarrabi-Zadeh (eds.), *Sufism East and West*, pp. 149–179, Brill, Leiden.
- Ibn Sina, A.A.-H.I.A., 1935, *Al-Isyarat wa al-Tanbihat*, Al-Quddus, Al-Nasyr wa al-Balaghah, Qumm.
- Imamah, F.M., 2017, 'Menghadapi Kapitalisme: Pendekatan Eco-Sufisme Dalam Gerakan Environmentalisme Islam Indonesia', *Kontemplasi: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Ushuluddin* 5(1), 109–135. <https://doi.org/10.21274/kontem.2017.5.1.109-135>
- Kannothra, C.G., Manning, S. & Haigh, N., 2018, 'How hybrids manage growth and social-business tensions in global supply chains: The case of impact sourcing', *Journal of Business Ethics* 148(2), 271–290. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-017-3585-4>
- Khan, I., Elius, M., Mohd Nor, M.R., Bin Mohd Yusoff, Y.Z., Noordin, M. & Mansor, F., et al., 2020, 'A critical appraisal of interreligious dialogue in Islam', *SAGE Open* 10(4). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020970560>
- Kirabae, N. & Chistyakova, O., 2020, 'Knowing God in Eastern Christianity and Islamic tradition: A comparative study', *Religions* 11(12), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel11120675>
- Machouche, S., Bensaïd, B. & Ahmed, Z., 2019, 'Crossroads between Islamic spirituality and the instruction of science', *Kemanusiaan* 26(Suppl 1), 23–45. <https://doi.org/10.21315/kajh2019.26.s1.2>
- Mat Akhir, N.S. & Sabjan, M.A., 2015, 'Tafakkur as the spiritual mechanism for environment conservation', *Journal of Religious & Theological Information* 14(1–2), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10477845.2015.1035195>
- Mundakir, M. & Hidayat, A., 2020, 'Islamic Shari'a configuration of Buka Luwur tradition in Kudus', *Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies* 8(1), 201–225. <https://doi.org/10.21043/QJIS.V8I1.7999>
- Muttaqin, A., 2012, 'From piety to efficacy: Hybrid Sufism in a secular landscape', *RIMA: Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs* 46(2), 25–46.
- Muttaqin, A., 2014, 'From occultism to hybrid Sufism: The transformation of an Islamic-hybrid spiritual group in contemporary Indonesia', *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 4(1), 81–104. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v4i1.81-104>
- Omar, M.N., Long, A.S., Mahmood, A.R. & Ab Rahman, Z.B., 2021, 'Islamic notion of happiness (Al-Sa'ada): An analysis of Miskawayh's thought', *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 19(1), 49–57. <https://doi.org/10.24035/IJIT.19.2021.195>
- Rahiem, M.D.H. & Rahim, H., 2021, 'The Sultan and the soup: A Javanese cultural response to Covid-19', *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies* 8(1), 43–65. <https://doi.org/10.29333/ejecs/602>
- Rahmat, M. & Yahya, M.W., 2021, 'How to improve the honesty of students in Indonesia? Sufism-based Islamic education model as an alternative', *International Journal of Education and Practice* 9(1), 80–92. <https://doi.org/10.18488/ijournal.61.2021.91.80.92>
- Richardson, C. & Rammal, H.G., 2018, 'Religious belief and international business negotiations: Does faith influence negotiator behaviour?', *International Business Review* 27(2), 401–409. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ibusrev.2017.09.007>
- Rofiq, A.Z., 2019, 'Penanggulangan Sampah Non Organik (Plastik) dalam Perspektif Eko-Sufisme', *An-Nahdlah* 6(1), 84–94.
- Roqib, M., 2011, *Prophetic education: Kontekstualisasi Filsafat dan Budaya Profetik dalam Pendidikan*, STAIN Press, Buku Litera, Purwokerto.
- Saharudin, S., 2019, 'The symbols and myths of rice in Sasak's culture: A portrait of hybrid Islam in Lombok1', *Al-Jami'ah* 57(2), 425–458. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2019.572.425-458>
- Sahin, A., 2018, 'Critical issues in Islamic education studies: Rethinking Islamic and western liberal secular values of education', *Religions* 9(11), 335. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9110335>
- Salik, M., 2019, 'Conserving moderate Islam in Indonesia: An analysis of Muwafiq's speech on online media', *Journal of Indonesian Islam* 13(2), 373–394. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2019.13.2.373-394>
- Salim, A., 2013, 'Javanese Religion, Islam or Syncretism: Comparing Woodward's Islam in Java and Beatty's Varieties of Javanese Religion', *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 3(2), 223–266. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v3i2.223-266>
- Smedema, S.M., 2020, 'An analysis of the relationship of character strengths and quality of life in persons with multiple sclerosis', *Quality of Life Research* 29(5), 1259–1270. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11136-019-02397-1>
- Spradley, J.P. & McCurdy, D.W., 1984, 'Culture and the contemporary world', in C. Campanella, D. Musslewhite & N. Conforti (eds.), *Conformity and conflict: Readings in cultural anthropology*, pp. 1–13, Pearson, Hoboken, NJ.
- Spradley, J.P. & McCurdy, D.W., 2012, *Conformity and conflict: Readings in cultural anthropology*, Jill Potash, North Fort Myers.
- Subiyantoro, S., Kristiani, K. & Wijaya, Y.S., 2020, 'Javanese cultural paradoxism: A visual semiotics study on wayang purwa characters of satria and raseksa figures', *Harmonia: Journal of Arts Research and Education* 20(1), 19–28. <https://doi.org/10.15294/harmonia.v20i1.23838>
- Suwito, N.S., 2010, 'Eko-Sufisme Studi tentang Usaha Pelestarian Lingkungan pada Jama'ah Mujahadah Ilmu Giri dan Jama'ah Aqliyah Jogyakarta', in A. Wachid BS (ed.), *Disertasi di Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta*, Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah, Jakarta.
- Suwito, S., 2020, *Model Tazkiyat Al-Nafs dalam Tradisi Sufisme*, 1st edn., ed. Mawi Albar, Rizquna, Purwokerto.
- Torabi, M., Dastranj, M. & Vahdani, M.H., 2014, 'A brief review of Fatiyan, Malamatiyeh and Qalanariyeh, similarities and differences', *Advances in Environmental Biology* 8(13), 1372–1382.
- Vicini, F., 2017, 'Thinking through the heart: Islam, reflection and the search for transcendence', *Culture and Religion* 18(2), 110–128. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14755610.2017.1326958>
- Waston, W., 2018, 'Building peace through mystic philosophy: Study on the role of Sunan Kalijaga in Java', *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* 8(2), 281–308. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v8i2.281-308>
- Wittenberg, E., Borneman, T., Koczwas, M., Del Ferraro, C. & Ferrell, B., 2017, 'Cancer communication and family caregiver quality of life', *Behavioral Sciences* 7(1), 12. <https://doi.org/10.3390/bs7010012>
- Yang, J., Liu, K. & Zhang, Y., 2019, 'Happiness inequality in China', *Journal of Happiness Studies* 20(8), 2747–2771. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10902-018-0067-z>
- Zhang, Y. & Ma, Z., 2020, 'Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on mental health and quality of life among local residents in Liaoning province, China: A cross-sectional study', *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 17(7), 2381. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17072381>