AOSIS

Allan Anderson's African Pentecostalism theology and the 'othering'

CrossMark
click for updates

Author:
Selaelo T. Kgatla[1]

Affiliation:
[1]Research Institute for Theology and Religion, Faculty of Humanities, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa

Corresponding author:
Selaelo Kgatla,
kgatla@mweb.co.za

Allan Heaton Anderson is one of the few white South Africans who succeeded in getting out of the entrapment of racial prejudices when it came to the written history of African-initiated churches. He became aware of the fact that an authentic theology can only be examined within context, and thus his theological analysis of African independent churches (AICs) reflects his status in the margins. Anderson not only conducted research among the poor and the downtrodden, where he challenged assumptions made by his white contemporaries, but he also identified with the 'othering', those who were powerless and marginalised – contributing immensely to African theology of inclusivity. This article comprised three sections: firstly, it traced Anderson's journey within and his contribution to the theology of African Pentecostalism; secondly, it explored the notion of typology of AICs using the lens of 'othering'; and thirdly, it concluded with recent trends in neo-Pentecostalism. Following the philosophical axiom of critical theory, the article was involved in dialogue with Anderson, interrogated European missionary typologies of African-initiated churches and, finally, critiqued the convergence of 'progressive Pentecostals' and 'globalisation' in shaping a new mission paradigm.

Contribution: This article paid closer attention to intersectionality of historiography and hybrid theological subjects such as practical theology and African theology. The contribution of interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary research by white African scholars on African theology was appraised. The article further appreciated the contribution by a white theologian who had mastered African epistemology of being and living by critiquing the theory of paternalistic 'othering'.

Keywords: Pentecostalism; African-initiated churches; typology; Messianism; othering; prejudices; syncretism; theory.

Introduction and background

This article was intended to be part of the Special Collection in honour of Allan Heaton Anderson's missiological contribution to the study of African-initiated churches in Africa on the occasion of his 70th birthday. The article missed its submission deadline then, and hence it is published here as independent original research. The author knew and studied missiology with Anderson at the University of South Africa and graduated with him in 1992. Their friendship continued until Allan Anderson moved to England and joined Selly Oak Colleges as director of the Centre for New Religious Movements in 1995. In this article, the author uses the concepts of African-initiated churches and African Pentecostals interchangeably. The discussion and differences or similarities of the categories need another article. The purpose of this article is to delineate the contribution of Allan Anderson to African Christianity.

Prof. Allan Heaton Anderson was born and bred into a family with a huge pietistic background in Pentecostalism, fully oriented to missionary work among black people in Africa. From his youth and through his academic upbringing, Anderson was a devout Pentecostal believer who proposed to spend his life in pursuit of the evangelisation of black people, commonly described by the European missionaries as 'pagans' and under-developed (Hassan 2015:193–199). He made his personal profession of faith in 1958 in a Shona village in the Lomagundi district of Zimbabwe (Anderson 1993:1) before immigrating to South Africa with his parents. From 1971, Anderson became actively involved in African Pentecostal churches when he was a theological student at the Bethel Bible College (Anderson 1993:2), a white-only Pentecostal theological college in South Africa. As white students, they were assigned the responsibility of conducting

'missionary' work in the black townships adjacent to white suburbs as part of their ministerial formation. Accordingly, mission was understood as a movement from the white 'Christianised' church to black communities who were 'black', 'backward', 'nonwhite' and 'heathen'. In South Africa, this practice was reinforced by the colonial missionary understanding of racial separate development of apartheid South Africa (Warneck 1897), which played a significant role in the defining moments of Anderson's life.

After completing his theological studies, Anderson was assigned the duty of iterant missionary of the Apostolic Faith Church, and he was to evangelise the entire area from the Cape province to Malawi. It was during these missionary expeditions that he became fully exposed to the injustices and contradictions of the Apostolic Faith Mission. The latter claimed to be 'Spirit-filled' and guided by the Spirit in its work (Anderson 1993:2) and yet supported the racial separation policy of apartheid (Anderson 2000:57). As he rubbed shoulders with the African believers among whom he worked, Anderson came to the decision in 1983 to leave the Apostolic Faith Mission Church and to join the white Hatfield Baptist Church. Still, he could not find a spiritual home until he completely broke ranks with white churches and joined the 'Independent African Pentecostal Churches'. He first joined Elim Tabernacle Church and then Praise Tabernacle in Soshanguve under the leadership of the 'limping'[1] Victor Mokgotlhoa (1993:1). It was from his encounter with the African independent churches (AICs) that Anderson's convictions to work with AICs deepened (Anderson 1993:2), and his experience and extensive research evolved. More than 225 research monographs including books, academic articles published in accredited journals and regular papers were produced. Prof. Maimela describes Anderson's (1993) research as from an inside perspective (pp. 1–2), although he himself would not readily accept such accolades. Prof. Jacques Theron (1992), who served as a project leader for Anderson's research, alludes to the fact that Anderson was well equipped to do research on African Pentecostals. He was an insider who studied the phenomenon from within. Many of the people he interviewed were closely acquainted with him, and he was attending the same church as they were; he was then, a 'participant observer'. In the early days of his research he had to cross the Rubicon of white prejudices and become the part of the 'Other' in order to practise theology from the margins.

The misunderstanding and abuse of the term 'mission' within the white church and political massacres, such as Sharpeville 1960, and the subsequent persistence of the white church in supporting apartheid ideology made him leave the white church for good (Anderson 2000:2). White Charismatic and Pentecostal indifference to the worsening sociopolitical situation for black people and the white notion that black South Africans would eventually move to white churches for 'blessings' caused him immense frustration (Anderson 2000:4). The inaccurate white conceptualisation of mission as

a 'flight' from the liberation struggle (communism[2]) and a 'fight' for self-preservation (Kgatla 1988:29) left an indelible mark on his consciousness (Anderson 2000:4).

This article explores the work of Allan Anderson, following Karl Marx's axiom: 'The philosophers have only interpreted the world, in various ways; the point is to change it'. Utilising a critical theory method, it explores the hidden intentions of 'Othering' in European missionary consciousness in the description of AICs in dialogue with Allan Anderson's theology.

Methodological considerations

This article is based on desktop research and qualitative research anchored in the Africana critical theory of explanation. Critical theory, a Marxist-inspired movement in social and political philosophy, originally associated with the Frankfurt School, is employed in this work. Magnus Bassey (2007) argues that Africana critical theory is the philosophical discourse that critiques domination and affirms the empowerment of black people in the world. This theory is predicated on the liberation of all black people in the world from being construed as backward and inferior Magnus Bassey (2007). The Africana critical theory is based on response in faith to the realities of black people, as they struggle for freedom, for justice, for wholeness and well-being (Abraham Rm 4:13).

Africana critical theory is premised upon concerns of freedom, responsibility, independence in thought and liberation from all social structural oppressions. It raises existential questions of liberation and identity without external influences and expressing African epistemology (Kgatla 2022). It is in this context that Rabaka (2002) argues that Africana critical theory is a theory that confronts, contradicts and corrects domination in the present and offers alternatives for liberation in the future. It is for these reasons that Africana critical theorists protest on behalf of their people as a whole rather than on behalf of the individuals (Bassey 2007). The Eurocentric naming, description and portrayal of black people that are informed by the right of conquest, domination, coloniality and hegemony are debunked for what they are.

Believing that science, like other forms of knowledge, has been used as an instrument of oppression, Africana critical theorists caution against a blind faith in scientific progress, arguing that scientific knowledge must not be pursued as an end in itself without reference to the goal of human emancipation[3]. Africana critical theory affirms that African people have their own way of conceptualising, interpreting and apprehending reality within the context of the African situation. The idea of an African epistemology is based on African people's understanding of the concepts of knowledge,

---

1.Victor Mokgotlhoa was a former student at Setotolwane High School, from where he matriculated and was commonly known as 'the limping one'.

2.At the time of apartheid rule, anything that resisted white rule and interest was called communism.

3.Critical Theory, viewed n.d., http://uregina.ca/~gingrich/ m900.htm.

truth and rationality (Udefi 2014) without mediation by Western categories of knowing. African people are complete people, capable of thinking through issues and coming to tangible conclusions without external assistance before the colonial authorities put their foot on the African continent. With the arrival of Western missionaries and the colonial period, African knowledge systems were disregarded, overridden, pushed into silence (Spewak 2017:423–440; Wray 2010:181–184) and regarded as unscientific and delusory.

The concept of othering

The analysis is based on the concepts of 'Othering and self-fulfilling conspiracy' or 'self-justification' by early European missionaries in their explanation of factors that caused and led to the emergence of the AIC. 'Othering' is a phenomenon in which some individuals or groups are defined and labelled as not fitting within the norms of a social group. It is an effect that influences how people perceive and treat those who are viewed as being part of the in-group versus those who are seen as being part of the out-group (Zevallos 2019).

Armed with Western epistemologies of prejudices against the 'Other' and culture that tended to see life in terms of binary oppositions, such as: white or black, cause or effect, presence or absence, progress or lack of progress, civilised verses uncivilised, dependence verses independence and superior or inferior (Derrida 1989:1), the 20th century and earlier missionaries saw the African worldview as having little chance of positive consideration (Hassan 2015:193–199). Because of the existence of this binary, gripping Western arrogance and sense of superiority, and perceiving civilising the 'Other' as its moral duty, the 'Other' had often no say in their self-development and religion (Nkomazana & Setume 2016) unless they stood up for their rights. Invariably, Eurocentric development approaches were structured around the idea of erasing ways of life and introducing social regulations without a full understanding of the local African context (Ferguson 1990:22). African theology was thus subjected to this misnomer and regarded merely as ephemeral (Diara & Onah 2014), and it was believed that it would one day evaporate like (the) morning mist. The third and last part of the article bewilders the emergence of neoliberalism with its principles of globalisation that defend and legitimise the same Western interests, but this time with the use of religion wrapped in the language of development (Kohn & Reddy 2017).

According to Anderson (2000:56), many white Pentecostals in South Africa often assumed that the growth of some brand (especially within Apostolic Faith Mission (AFM) and Assemblies of God) of African Pentecostal Movement was as a result of their labour. But the truth of the matter, Anderson postulates, is that African Pentecostalism has evolved and developed spontaneously among Africans as an authentic African expression of Christianity, especially as the white Pentecostals favoured segregation and emphasised the importance of the existence of two parallel churches (Anderson 2000:85). In this self-gratification, AICs could either be accepted as a fruit of the labour of white Pentecostals or relegated to a false movement when it did not serve their purpose.

In such a context, 'Othering' as white prejudices of African worldview undergirds religious explanation, categorisation and self-justification. Powell and Manendian (2016) define 'Othering' as a term that not only encompasses the many expressions of prejudice on the basis of group identities but also provides a clarifying framework that reveals a set of common processes and conditions that propagate group-based inequality and marginality. 'Othering' as a form of marginality and expressions of prejudice serves as self-justification where tolerance, inclusion and equality are annulled.

The dimensions of 'Othering' include, but are not limited to, religion, sex, race, ethnicity, socio-economic status (class), disability, sexual orientation and skin colour, and they are deeply contextual (Powel & Manendian 2016). This article appreciates Anderson's critique of early white missionaries' typologies of AICs and prejudices as a category of explanation, as discussed in his works. It further goes on to explore early white prejudicial typologies and ends with an exposition of the 'postdevelopment' model as an ideological discourse constructed by the West in pursuit of the recapturing of the African mind through neo-Pentecostalism with globalisation (Regmi 2018:2).

The problem of discourse by white missionaries on the rise and challenges of AICs was, to a certain extent, a result of a 'collision of two cultures' – white and African – within religious, political, cultural, economic and psychological spaces, which could not be managed correctly (Nkomazana & Setume 2016). As things stand, gripping Western coloniality has produced another strain of Pentecostalism driven by globalising hegemony (Bell 2017; Janine 2019), and the integration of politics, religion, economics, culture and everything that matters to the interest of the West for the purpose of control and material gain (Richard 2018:2; Wani 2011:33). The focus of this research is not much on coloniality but on the theological contribution of Anderson to AICs theology.

Anderson's analysis of African independent churches theology

Anderson conducted comprehensive research in debunking the negative analyses of European categorisation of AICs and presented a balanced research description of their theology, as has been indicated earlier. Although he did not delve deeply into white missionaries' prejudices and their disdain of African religion and life, he presented a comprehensive analysis of their intolerance towards AICs. He also presented analyses that restored respect to the AICs and exposed whites' grandstanding. Titles of some of his books, such as *Bazalwane* (Anderson 1992), *Tumelo* (Anderson 1993) and *Moya* (Anderson 1991), are indicative

of the attempt to 'bracket' English titles that may not fully convey the meaning of African titles. *Bazalwane* [blossom brethren] is a Zulu word that denotes deeper Christian relatedness with warm, welcoming connotations. *Tumelo* is a Sotho word for faith that refers to belief as a way of life. It denotes an ontological disposition. *Moya* [spirit] refers to the Holy Spirit when used in AIC context and it signifies power that is above all destructive, malevolent powers, one that comes from God and is spoken about in scriptures. *Moya* designates the Holy Spirit and allows believers to transcend all 'limitations', to enable them to be true Bible followers of God. People of *Moya* have gifts of prophecy, speak in tongues, heal the sick, exorcise demons, experience trances, have visions and dreams and lead a victorious life (Anderson 2000:240; Diara & Onah 2014; Pretorius & Jafta 1997:211; WCC 2019).

The attitude of European missionaries towards African religion(s) should be fully articulated for what they were representing. The missionary assumptions underlying the typologies of AICs are worth explicating for authentic dialogue with Allan Anderson's theology of AIC. His focus was mainly on the dynamics of African Pentecostalism and how sociopolitical, economic and psychological factors impacted its trajectory. He substantially explored the religious hunger that was driving the phenomenon (2000:24–260). Many African scholars concur with Anderson that European religious 'nominalism, neglect of the Holy Spirit in worship liturgy and mission, failure to preach and practice transformational Christian gospel, failure to contextualise the gospel into African sensibilities and worldview' were causes of formation of true African Pentecostalism (Diara & Onah 2014:395–402; Satyavrata 2010:151; Packer 1990; Pretorius & Jafta 1997:211–229; Ugba 2009:92–93). It was out of yearning for a full, liberating and authentic gospel that Pentecostal churches had to break away from historic mainline churches and look for a new home of religious freedom. I now turn to the typology of AICs as a category of 'othering'.

Typography of African independent churches as a problem of 'othering'

From the introduction of the colonial missionary era in Africa, indigenous people were seen as people who could only be developed through European education and religion. African initiatives were snubbed not only as a threat to colonial establishment but also as a missionary embarrassment because of their otherness in the outcome of missionary work. African independent churches were dismissed as sects or cults[4] and 'flights' from authentic saving religion (Nkomazana & Setume 2016:6). The recognition of the 'Other' as authentic partner could only be seen as defeatism and despair on the part of the invading force and its inability to control the minds of the indigenous people (Kgatla 2018:18),

4. Using the word 'sect' or 'cult' is an easy way to criticise a group, but a poor way to describe one. Schmaltz (2018) maintains that 'cults' are usually associated with beliefs and practices considered to be 'unhealthy'. But what is seen as healthy in one culture may be seen as unhealthy in another culture.

and hence the following categorisation within Messianic churches:

1. Sundkler's Bantu Prophets (Anderson 2000:225) went to the extent of accusing Shembe's followers of viewing their leader as semidivine.
2. Oosthuizen's Post Christianity in Africa offered a scathing attack in his condemnation of the AIC movement (Anderson 2000:225).
3. Sundkler (1961) and Martin referred to Lekganyane as a 'messiah' without empirical evidence (Anderson 2000:227).

European typologies of the AICs were created by white missionaries, anthropologists, historians, sociologists and politicians trying to rationalise their place within the African religious landscape and justify their impact on the continent's religions (Heuser 2020:87; Nkomazana & Setume 2016:1). European missionaries regarded themselves as chosen by God to 'save' Africans from heathenism and superstitious influences (Boesak 2009:72; Warneck 1897). Descriptions of African-initiated formations that resisted Western encroachment were coined to inform their sending countries of African inability or difficulty to accept the 'grand Christian religion'. The reason why Africans were not conforming to their universal civilisation and religion was seen as indicative of inferior culture that needed the Western 'crutches' of accompaniment. These missionaries would also solicit material and psychological support from home churches for their work in foreign lands. The fact of the matter was that Africans were independent people who could decide for themselves for what was right or wrong. Kalu (2000) and Chitando (2005) highlight the need for an academic discipline to employ accurate and value-free terms when describing the phenomenon of religion. This practice has been difficult to maintain in the study of Christianity in Africa by non-African scholars (Cox 1996). Naming a phenomenon may prejudice the issues by saying too much or fail to state what is being shown by the phenomenon itself (Chitando 2005).

Why European missionary typology should be interrogated

Much has been written on the encounter between European missionaries and African traditional religions and the subsequent emergence of AICs. The latter, which was a reaction to empirical Christian and colonial imposition, was dismissed as 'sects', 'nativistic', 'messianic', 'separatist churches', 'syncretistic' and 'breakaway groups' (Anderson 2003; Diara & Onah 2014; Hassan 2015). The categorisation has since been moderated over the years without inclusively embracing the other as equal and true churches of God. The acceptance of the title AIC could be an influence of modernity 'humorous' statement captured in *Urban Dictionary*, that says: 'If you are unable to outdo rivals in some endeavour, you might as well cooperate with them and thereby possibly gain an advantage'.

The African independent churches as protest against foreign religion and expression of African Christianity

Daneel (1999) and Anderson (2002) offer a helpful understanding of the origin, purpose and practices of AICs. They agree with Kalu (2008) that AICs owe their origin to Africa and their religion is an African expression or rejection of foreign imposition (Anderson 1992; Daneel 1999). These churches are full African Christian churches protesting against colonial imposition and liberative movements resisting oppressive rule and poor living conditions. Kealotswe (2014) argues that they are valid expressions of African Christianity. Daneel (1971) gives an elaborate account of how African beliefs and values are incorporated in the theology of the AICs in Zimbabwe. According to both Daneel (1971) and Anderson (1992), the AICs derive their theology from the Old Testament. They interpret the Bible in a literal sense, allegorical sense, moral sense and anagogic sense (Kealotswe 2014:227-242).

Good health, prosperity and wholeness of being are phenomena that are perennial and of interest to AICs. All that concerns human life and its well-being receive attention from African Christianity[5] (Ajima & Ubana 2018). Anderson (1993) goes further to illustrate the wholeness of African Christianity as expressed through prophecy. While prophecy is sometimes restricted to 'forthtelling' rather than 'foretelling', to exhortation rather than prediction, in African Pentecostalism both aspects are found. The prophets in Pentecostal churches are immensely important. Like diviners in African traditional religions, who have the capacity to function in all roles – e.g. political, military, health, economic, cultural and psychological – prophets in African Pentecostalism have similar roles.

Missionaries and African independent churches

Regardless of the claims that missionaries distanced themselves from colonial regimes and made sacrifices to fight colonialism, it remains evident that they paid allegiance to their colonial masters when it came to their safety and personal interests (Kgatla 2018:7). Pobee and Ostelu (1998) argue that the AICs have not found a place within the ecumenical movement of historic churches because they have been regarded as a 'heathenisation' of Christianity. Even where the AICs are admitted into ecumenical bodies, their leaders are seldom elected to executive positions (1998). The underlying reasons for this situation need critical interrogation.

Underlying prejudices behind European typologies

Nearly all early missionaries' labels of AICs were 'Othering', self-justifying, condescending and unreconciliatory. The AICs were called 'sects', 'nativists', 'messianic', and 'syncretic', as discussed below:

- **'Sects'** denotes a group of people who are separated from an established church and who have half-truths in their religious beliefs (typically regarded as heretical). The term denotes the arrogance and self-justification of the beholder. African independent churches were regarded as breakaways that ran away from missionary religious truth. They were literally mocked as religious lunatics drifting away from saving grace.

- **Nativism** is a 'xenophobic nationalism'. It is 'an ideology that wants congruence of state and nation – the political and the cultural unit protecting the interests of native-born or established inhabitants against those of invading force' force'[6]. It is a policy that wants one state for every nation and one nation for every state. It perceives all non-natives, especially colonising forces, as threatening. Nativism is most appealing during periods when people feel that the harmony between their values and their nation is disappearing. To blame AIC for closing ranks to protect itself from dominance is not candid. The onus remained on the missionaries to witness empowering, liberating and bond-forming messages.

- **Messianic movements** were accused of building their identity around a messianic leader who served both as a compensation for frustrated social and political aspirations and as an agent of socialisation (Pobee & Ositelu (1998). In an environment where people are dispossessed of their land, are forced to accept foreign religious values and are reduced to serve as 'hewers of wood and drawers of water', it is understandable to rally around a messianic leader for liberation, especially if such a leader is anointed by God for their liberation.

- **Syncretistic** once had negative connotation and suggested underlying mockery of AIC. However, contemporary scholars (Baker, Jennings & Nelson 2006; Hughes 1988; Thomas 2002) have shown that syncretism as a concept has positive value in the functions of religions. Religious syncretism as a fusion of diverse religious beliefs and practices has positive functions. Instances of religious syncretism denote a religious dualistic system that incorporates elements from different religions. Even Christianity is a fusion of Hellenistic Greek and Near Eastern cultures that were affected by the conquest by powerful empires, forming a constellation of a variety of religious views (Louth 2020)

Pentecostalism, globalisation and sustainable development

Pentecostalism has spread across the world and has, in some instances, been infiltrated by the colonial and imperial forces that it tried to resist in its earlier stages. The African Pentecostalism that was vibrant and focused on addressing African spiritual dilemmas and needs has, in some cases, metamorphosised to such an extent that it

now speaks the language of the neocolonialist (Kgatla 2018:12). I should, however, hasten to concede – and concur with Anderson in doing so – that there is absolutely no uniformity among the movements (Anderson 2020:121). In that regard, Anderson (2020) divides the phenomenon into four broad and overlapping groups (Anderson 2020:121): Classical, Pentecostals, Independent Pentecostal Churches, and 'Charismatics and Independent Charismatic Megachurches'. It would be a misrepresentation of Anderson's Pentecostal Theology of Pentecostalism on global impact if it were not unpacked in relation to globalism and development. Anderson maintains that the spread of Pentecostalism has occurred in such a way that it has affected every denomination worldwide, resulting in conglomerations of diverse religious movements (Anderson 2020). The resultant effect is that there are many different movements that scholars accept as Pentecostalism. It in this respect that Anderson (2020) refers to Pentecostalism and Pentecostals as well as the different types of AICs. They are essentially grassroots movements appealing to the disadvantaged and underprivileged. Their expansion and influence in sub-Saharan Africa have changed the religious demographics, establishing a global presence (Venter 1998).

Another essential theological observation that Anderson (2020) makes about Pentecostal movement theology to the poor countries is their theological articulation that promotes hope in the presence of hopelessness, faith in the world of despair and determination in the midst of suffering through their beliefs in the immanence of God. Because God is ever-present and near, Pentecostals believe as a consequence that God wants all people to have liberating spiritual presence that brings social well-being and physical prosperity for all (Anderson 2020). The Pentecostal movement is mainly the religion of the poor and downtrodden. Pentecostalism across the world, and particularly in sub-Saharan Africa, has been involved in issues that aimed at the betterment and emancipation of the lives of their societies, as they believe in the involvement of God in every aspect of their lives to make them well and get involved in his mission.

Pentecostalism: A new wind

Anderson (2002) identifies another brand of Pentecostalism, which he calls the Newer Pentecostal and Charismatic Churches, that replaces old categories such as 'African independent churches' and 'African indigenous churches' with 'African-initiated churches'. Accordingly, it is difficult, if not impossible, to put AICs into types and categories. According to Anderson, it is also becoming difficult to define 'Pentecostal' precisely, and if one persists with a narrow perception, one will miss the whole picture. The Western category of the colonial definition failed to recognise the great variety of the Pentecostal movement. It is under this backdrop that Anderson (2002) argues for an inclusive understanding of the Pentecostal and Charismatic movement as concerned primarily with the experience of the working of the Holy Spirit and practice of spiritual gifts.

Kalu (2008) maintains the same understanding of African Pentecostalism as does Anderson. African Pentecostalism, according to Kalu (2008), did not originate from external change agents and networks but from an indigenous worldview. African Pentecostalism should be considered an African religion that flows from African roots and addresses African existential realities (Kalu 2008). Accordingly, local continuity takes precedence over foreign origins and global flows. These movements propose that their spirituality is the greatest feasible form of Christianity for postmodern, post-Western and postcolonial.

As it was argued earlier that Pentecostals represent a wider complex spectrum of many 'colours', it should further be highlighted here that the Western form of Pentecostalism has salient negative influences on African Pentecostals. The new Pentecostalism is called 'Progressive Pentecostalism' because its approach is more encompassing within development-oriented ministries (Anderson 2020:130; ed. Freeman 2012:2; Myers 2015:115). Kakwata (2017:6) states that Progressive Pentecostalism as a movement does not separate religion from development but promotes a new and different conception of development. The new conceptualisation, which is also called a third approach to development, emphasises the betterment of humanity, especially for the poor (ed. Freeman 2012:9). Accordingly, the new stance taken by Progressive Pentecostalism favours imperialism and the elite of globalising capitalism and unquenchable consumerism. It does not fight against unjust social structures (Freeman 2012:9); rather, it sees the problem of underdevelopment, poverty and suffering in the Global South as the work of the devil (ed. Freeman 2012:2) but not the unjust systems of the elite.

While early Pentecostal groups conceived the radical transformation of Christianity on the African continent and intended to reform European Christianity to address African problems (Anderson 2000), the Progressive Pentecostalism groups have placed emphasis on the mundane, especially on consumerism and acquisition of wealth and health (Ugba 2009:92) without explicitly fighting social structural sins created by colonialism. Salvation is both this-worldly and physical, and its evidence has become as much material as spiritual (Ugba 2009:92). Divine healing and deliverance are from God and oppression and poverty are occasioned by the principalities and powers from the space. Prayers for Pentecostals are 'against obstacles'. When they pray, they come against any spirit or power – they break every stronghold of the enemy: 'We bind all powers and declare the power of Jesus'. They become aware of the battleground of the enemy – Satan (Wahrisch-Oblau 2009).

Conclusion

This study is a part of scholarly tributes in recognition of the contribution made by Emeritus Professor of African Pentecostals, Allen Heaton Anderson. It began by tracing his early history as a theological student, where he broke ranks from the Apostolic Faith Mission to join African-initiated

churches, from where he conducted research and published more than 200 academic papers and books. The second section of the study interrogated the process of 'Othering' as attributing negative characteristics to people or groups that European missionaries and colonial authorities differentiated themselves from as they were perceived as not being in line with normative social groups. The stereotypes of 'Othering' are seen in their typologies of African-initiated churches and negative labelling. Pentecostalism, including the African Pentecostalism that started as African resistance to Western dominance, has fallen to the neocolonisation of the mind in the narrative of sustainable development which aims to deliver on its goal for inclusive sustainable development. Pentecostalism and globalisation have become megatrends that claim that there is no alternative to world destiny as driven by Western capitalist materialist consumerism that operates like a missionary crusade. Therefore, urgent scholarly attention should be given to this new phenomenon in order to protect the legacy of early AICs.

Acknowledgements

References

Adedibu, B., 2018, 'The changing faces of African independent churches as development actors across borders', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 74(1), a4740. https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v74i1.4740

Allen, R., 1927, *Missionary methods: St. Paul's or ours?*, viewed 12 November 2020, from https://newchurches.s3.amazonaws.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/essential-church-planting-module-4-missionary-methods.pdf.

Anderson, A., 1991, *Moya: The holy spirit in an African context*, UNISA Press, Pretoria.

Anderson, A., 1992, *Bazalwane: African Pentecostals in South Africa*, UNISA Press, Pretoria.

Anderson, A., 1993, *Tumelo: The faith of African Pentecostals in South Africa*, UNISA Press, Pretoria.

Anderson, A., 2000, *Zion and Pentecost: The spirituality and experience of Pentecostal and Zionist/apostolic churches in South Africa*, UNISA, Pretoria.

Anderson, A., 2003, 'African initiated churches of the spirit and pneumatology', *Word & World* 23(2), 178–186.

Anderson, A., 2020, 'Pentecostalism and social, political, and economic development', *Spiritus: Oru Journal of Theology* 5(1), 121–136.

Anderson, A.H., 2001, *Types and butterflies: African initiated churches and European typologies*, viewed 27 May 2019, from https://journals.sagepub.com

Baker, C.P., Jennings, J.N., Elphick, R. & Davenport, R., 2006, 'Suburban evangelical individualism: Syncretism or contextualization?', *Global Missiology*.

Beerkens, E., 2006, *Globalisation: Definitions and perspectives*, viewed 12 November 2020, from https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/globalisation:-definitions-and-perspectives-by-eric/38c57353e2dc966fa01ed3ccaadb442b9ab569c6.

Bell, M., 2017, *The biggest megachurch on earth and South Korea's 'crisis of evangelism'*, viewed 02 March 2020, from https://www.pri.org/stories/2017-05-01/biggest-megachurch-earth-facing-crisis-evangelism.

Boesak, A.A., & Hansen, L., 2009, 'Theological reflections on empire', in Boesak & Hansen (eds.), *Globalisation: The politics of empire, justice and the life of faith*, pp. 59–72, Sun Press, Stellenbosch.

Boesak, A.A., Hansen, L. & Van der Westhuizen, C., 2009, 'Power and insecurity: The politics of globalisation and its consequences', in Boesak & Hansen (eds.), *Globalisation: The politics of empire, justice and the life of faith*, Sun Press, Stellenbosch.

Bulhan, H.A., 2015, 'Stages of colonialism in Africa: From occupation of land to occupation of being', *Journal of Social Political Psychology* 3(1), 239–256. https://doi.org/10.5964/jspp.v3i1.143

Chilenje, V., 2014, 'The challenge of the prosperity gospel for reformed/Presbyterian churches in the twenty-first century', in Kroersbergen, W. (ed.), *In search of health and wealth: The prosperity gospel in African, reformed perspective*, pp. 3–18, Wipf and Stock, Eugene, OR.

Chitando, A., 2005, *Naming the phenomena: The challenge of African independent churches*, University of Zimbabwe, Harare.

Cox, J.L., 1996, *The classification 'primal religions' as a non-empirical Christian theological construct*, University of Edinburgh, University Press, Edinburgh, Scotland.

Critical theory sociology 319 march 2 & 9 2000, viewed 10 February 2021, from http://uregina.ca/~gingrich/m900.htm.

Daneel, M.L., 1971, *Old and new in Southern Shona independent churches*, vol. 11, The Hague and Paris, Mouton, Cambridge University Press.

Daneel, M.L., 1999, *African initiated churches in Southern Africa: Protest movements of mission churches?* University of Cambridge, Faculty of Divinity, Position paper number 114, Edinburgh, Scotland.

Derrida, J., 1986, *Internet encyclopedia of philosophy: Deconstruction*, viewed 20 November 2020, from https://iep.utm.edu/derrida/#:~:text=jacques.

Diara, B.C.D. & Onah, N.G., 2014, 'The phenomenal growth of Pentecostalism in the contemporary Nigerian society: A challenge to mainline churches', *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5(6), 395–402. https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2014.v5n6p395

Elphick, R., 2012, *Reconsiderations in Southern African history*, University of Virginia Press, Charlottesville, VA.

Ferguson, J., 1990, *The anti-politics machine: Development, depoliticization, and bureaucratic power in Lesotho*, University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, MN.

Freeman, D. (ed.), 2012, *Pentecostalism and development*, Palgrave Macmillan, London.

Fyke, J., 2013, 'Euphemisms and ethics: A language-centered analysis of Penn state's sexual abuse scandal', *Journal of Business Ethics* 122, 551–569. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-013-1777-0

Hassan, L., 2015, 'Attitudes of Christian missionaries towards African traditional religious beliefs in east Africa during the British colonial rule in African history of culture', *African Journal of History and Culture* 7(10), 193–199.

Heuser, A., 2020, 'Afolayan, Adeshina, Olajumoke, Yacob-Haliso and Toyin Falola (eds.) Pentecostalism and politics in Africa: African histories and modernities', *Pentecostudies: An Interdisciplinary Journal for Research on the Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements* 19(2), 216–218. https://doi.org/10.1558/pent.42278

Holland, C.P., 2011, 'The impact of globalisation and information technology on the strategy and profitability of the banking industry', *Proceedings of the Thirtieth Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* 3, 418–427. https://doi.org/10.1109/hicss.1997.661663

Hughes, D.A., 1988, 'Syncretism', in S. Ferguson & D. Wright (eds.), *New dictionary of theology*, p. 670, Intervarsity Press, Downers Grove, IL.

Kakwata, F., 2017, 'The progressive Pentecostal conception of development within African context of poverty', *Stellenbosch Theological Journal* 3(1), 159–183. https://doi.org/10.17570/stj.2017.v3n1.a08

Kalu, O.U., 2000, 'Ancestral spirituality and society in Africa', in J.K. Olupona (ed.), *African spirituality: Forms, meanings and expressions*, pp. 54–84, The Crossroad Publishing Company, New York, NY.

Kalu, O., 2008, *African Pentecostalism. An introduction*, Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Kealotswe, O., 2014, 'The nature and character of the African Independent churches (AICs) in the 21 century: Their theological and social agenda', *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae* 40(2), 227–242.

Kgatla, S.T., 1988, 'Dutch reformed church mission in the Northern Transvaal 1865–1965', Unpublished Master's dissertation, UNISA.

Kgatla, S.T., 2018, '"And no one pours new wine into an old wineskin": Change must first occur internally before it can be exported to the "other"', Unpublished paper read at Berlin conference of religion and development, Berlin, June 18 2016.

Kgatla, S.T., 2022, 'Exorcism/envy/witchcraft', in Weyel, Grab, Lartey & Wepener (eds.), *International handbook of practical theology*.

Kroesbergen, W, Studebaker, M. & Togarasei, L., 2014, 'African gospreneurship: Assessing the possible contribution of the gospel of prosperity to entrepreneurship in light of Jesus's teaching on earthly possessions', in Kroesbergen (ed.), *In search of health and wealth: The prosperity gospel in African, reformed perspective*, pp. 110–121, Wipf and Stock, Eugene, OR.

Kohn, M. & Reddy, K., 2017, *Colonialism*, viewed 19 November 2020, from https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2017/entries/colonialism.

Louth, A., 2020, 'The strengths and weaknesses of Durkheim's methodology for the study and teaching of religion'.

Miller, J.D., 2014, 'Alternative realities myths, lies, truths, and half-truths', *The Lincoln Humanities Journal* 6, 21–45.

Mohler, A., 2009, *Why moralism is not the gospel – And why many Christians think it is*, viewed 21 May 2018, from https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/article/why-moralism-is-not-the-gospel-and-why-so-many-christians-think-it-is/.

Moss, T., 2009, *Where does Africa fit in the globalization puzzle?*, viewed 01 December 2020, from https://insights.som.yale.edu/insights/where-does-africa-fit-in-the-globalization-puzzle.

Myers, B.L., 2015, *Progressive Pentecostalism, development, and Christian development NGOs: A challenge and an opportunity*, viewed 24 May 2019, from http://www.internationalbulletin.org/issues/2015-03/2015-03-115-myers.

Nativism, viewed 10 February 2021, from https://www2.vobs.at/ludescher/ludescher/lacquisition/nativist/nativist theory.htm.

Nkomazana, F. & Setume, S.D., 2016, 'Missionary colonial mentality and the expansion of Christianity in Bechuanaland protectorate, 1800 to 1900', *Study of Religion* 29(2), 29–55.

Packer, J.I., 1990, *Pentecostalism 'reinvented': The charismatic renewal in Harold B. Smith Pentecostals from the inside out*, Victor Books, Wheaton, IL.

Pobee, J.S. & Ositelu, I.I., 1998, *African initiatives in Christianity. The growth, gifts and diversities of indigenous African churches. A challenge to the ecumenical movement*, WCC, Geneva.

Powell, J.A. & Manendian, S., 2016, *The problem of othering: Towards inclusiveness and belonging in*, viewed 20 December 2021, from https://www.otheringandbelonging.org/the-problem-of-othering.

Pretorius, H. & Jafta, L., 1997, '"A branch spring out": African initiated churches', in Elphick & Davenport (eds.), *Christianity in South Africa: A political, social & cultural history*, pp.151–154, J Currey, Surrey.

Rabaka, R., 2002, 'Malcolm x and/as critical theory: Philosophy, radical politics, and the African American search for social justice', *Journal of Black Studies* 33(2), 145–165. https://doi.org/10.1177/002193402237222

Regmi, K.D., 2018, 'Foundational models of development, underlying assumptions and critiques', *Social change* 48(3), 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1177/0049085718781688

Satyavrata, I., 2010, 'J. Philip Hogan's spirit-led vision and the globalisation of Pentecostal missions in the twenty-first century', in Studebaker (ed.), *Pentecostalism and globalisation: The impact of globalisation on Pentecostal theology and ministry*, pp. 151–154, Pickwick Publications, Eugene, OR.

Smith, J., 1860, *Saving souls*, viewed 11 March 2021, from https://www.gracegems.org/smith3/saving_souls.htm.

Spewak, D.C., 2017, 'Understanding assertion to understand silencing: Finding an account of assertion that explains silencing arising from testimonial injustice', *Episteme* 14(4), 423–440. https://doi.org/10.1017/epi.2016.12

Sundkler, B.G.M., 1961, *Bantu prophets in South Africa*, Routledge, London.

Theron, J., 1992, *Pentecostalism project, a foreword to Bazalwane*, University of South Africa, Pretoria.

Udefi, A., 2014, 'The rationale for an African epistemology: A critical examination of Igbo views on knowledge, belief, and justification', *Canadian Social Science* 10, 108–117.

Ugba, A., 2009, *Shades of belonging: African Pentecostals in twenty-first century Ireland*, Africa World Press, Trenton.

Van Rimsum, H.J., 2001, *Slaves of definition*, Shaker, Maastricht.

Venter, D., 1998, 'Globalisation and the emergence of African initiated churches', *Missionalia* 26(3), 412–438.

Wahrisch-Oblau, C., 2009, *The missionary self-perception of Pentecostal charismatic church leaders from the global south*, Brill, Leiden.

Wariboko, N., 2018, 'African Pentecostal politics philosophy: New directions in the study of Pentecostalism and politics', in Afolayan, Yacob-Haliso & Falola (eds.), *Pentecostalism and politics in Africa*, pp. 385–396, Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

Warneck, D.G., 1897, *Evangelische Missionslehre. Ein missionstheorethischer Versuch, (Dritte Abteilung: Der Betrieb de Sendung)*, Berthes, Gotha.

Wray, K.B., 2010, 'Introduction: Collective knowledge and science', *Episteme* 7, 181–184. https://doi.org/10.3366/epi.2010.0201

Zevallos, Z., 2019, *What is otherness? The other sociologist: Analysis of difference*, viewed 12 September 2022, from https://othersociologist.com/otherness-resources.