East African Medical Journal Vol. 98 No. 1 January 2021

ADHERENCE TO NATIONAL HEALTHCARE REFERRAL GUIDELINES AND ITS EFFECT ON THE MANAGEMENT OUTCOMES AMONG CHILDREN SEEN AT A TEACHING HOSPITAL IN WESTERN KENYA

Paul Jairus Njanwe, (MBChB, Registrar-Child Health and Paediatrics) Department of Child Health and Paediatrics, School of Medicine, Moi University; Eldoret-Kenya, P. O. Box 4606-30100, Eldoret, Kenya. Irene Marete, (MBChB, MMed, PhD), Department of Child Health and Paediatrics, School of Medicine, Moi University. P.O Box 4606-30100, Eldoret-Kenya. Samuel Ayaya (MBChB, MMed), Professor of Pediatrics and Dermatology, Department of Child Health and Paediatrics, School of Medicine, Moi University, P.O Box 4606-30100, Eldoret-Kenya

Corresponding author: Paul Jairus Njanwe, (MBChB, Registrar, Child Health and Paediatrics) Department of Child Health and Paediatrics, School of Medicine, Moi University; Eldoret, Kenya, P. O. Box 4606-30100, Eldoret-Kenya. E-mail: <a href="mailto:njanwejpwafula@gmail.com">njanwejpwafula@gmail.com</a>.

# ADHERENCE TO NATIONAL HEALTHCARE REFERRAL GUIDELINES AND ITS EFFECT ON THE MANAGEMENT OUTCOMES AMONG CHILDREN SEEN AT A TEACHING HOSPITAL IN WESTERN KENYA

P. J. Njanwe, I. Marete and S. Ayaya

#### **ABSTRACT**

Background: Referral guidelines are meant to ensure coordination and continuity across all levels of healthcare. Poor adherence to these guidelines could result in increased morbidity and mortality among the patients who are denied access to healthcare.

Objective: To determine adherence to the national healthcare referral guidelines and immediate outcomes of children seen at a Moi Teaching and Referral Hospital (MTRH) in Kenya.

Materials and methods: A Cross-sectional study conducted at the Pediatric emergency department of MTRH between February to June 2016 among 422 children aged below 15 years who were recruited systematically. Sociodemographic and clinical data were collected using interviewer administered questionnaires and clinical chart reviews respectively, while checklists were used to collect information from ambulances. Pearson chi-square tests and odds ratios were used to test for association between predictor and outcome variables.

Results: More than half (55.5%) of the 422 children enrolled were male while 51.4% were aged between 5 to 14 years. Hospital referrals accounted for 15.9% (n=67) with the rest being self-referrals and no counter referrals seen. Adherence to transfer guideline requirements was observed in 46.3% (n=31) of the 67 hospital referrals. Lower parental level of education (p=0.025), residing outside the host county (p<0.001) and being older than five years (p=0.015) were significantly associated with hospital referrals. There was a nearly three-time likelihood of

admission (AOR = 2.932; 95% CI: 2.422 - 3.550; p<0.001) among children referred from hospitals compared to self-referrals.

Conclusion: There is low adherence to national healthcare referral guidelines at Moi Teaching and Referral Hospital.

#### INTRODUCTION

The process of transferring patients from lower-level healthcare systems to those with advanced infrastructural and resources is a key element of the health care system globally. In low- and middle-income countries such as Kenya, this is necessitated by lack of adequate technological infrastructural resources as professional skills to handle some debilitating health conditions. Patient referrals especially between various hospitals by healthcare providers acts as a building elevator to facilitate forward and backward management of clients' needs. A functional patient referral system ensures optimal use of healthcare facilities and personnel improving by healthcare communication among all providers involved the in patient's management [1]. In Kenya, the healthcare system is hierarchical from the community health care services, primary health care, county referral services to the national teaching and referral facilities[2]. The higher the level of the facility, the more sophisticated it is in providing diagnostic, therapeutic and rehabilitative services.

To ensure proper coordination of the patient referral system, Kenya's Ministry of Health developed National Healthcare Referral Guidelines [3]. Both patients and healthcare providers are expected to adhere to these referral guidelines and ensure safe and proper patient transfer across healthcare facilities. Optimal adherence to these guidelines further ensures that patients receive the full spectrum of care provided by the health system,

regardless of the level at which they physically access health care. The referral guidelines recommend that patients should first seek medical care at primary healthcare facilities except in emergency situations where referral facilities can be accessed directly. In the event of hospital-to-hospital referral, the attending healthcare provider is required to call the receiving facility in advance to ensure availability of the required medical service, legibly fill-out a client referral form in English, indicate previous medical care offered including attaching all the relevant diagnostic test results, especially in emergency referrals. Adherence to transfer process guidelines especially among pediatric patients requires that the patient transferred in an ambulance with a functional supply, first-aid kit, essential medicines and a transfer couch. The patient in the ambulance must also be accompanied by a competent healthcare provider.

Despite all these guidelines in place, adherence to referral and transfer process guidelines by both patients and healthcare providers has been a challenge in many national referral hospitals. This has been exemplified by long queues of patients with medical conditions that could be easily managed at primary healthcare facilities. Parents of pediatric patients living in urban centers near these national referral hospitals often opt to bypass the healthcare hierarchy by self-referring their children.

This study therefore aimed to determine the adherence to National Healthcare Referral Guidelines and document immediate outcomes among children seen at Moi Teaching and Referral Hospital (MTRH) in Eldoret-Kenya. Specifically, it determined the proportion of children seen at MTRH who were referred from other health facilities; described the patterns of referrals; determined the level of adherence to the transfer process guidelines and the immediate management outcomes of children seen.

#### **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

This was a cross-sectional study conducted among pediatric patients attending MTRH's sick child clinic February to June 2016. The hospital is the second largest national government teaching and referral hospital in Kenya with a bed capacity for 800 patients and attends to patients in the greater Western Kenya. The researcher only met the children and their parents at enrollment, while all other information was obtained from medical records. The eligible children were those below 15 years who were not revisiting the sick child clinic for review or follow-up due to the same condition during the study period. Referred children who died on arrival at the sick-child clinic were excluded. The children and further sampled systematically with a sampling interval of 28 until the desired sample size of 422 was achieved.

Patient data was collected using an interviewer administered questionnaire that was divided into six sections: demographic data, referral status, referral process, status of the transferring vehicle or ambulance, referral

documents, and care given at MTRH. If the patient was self-referred, information such as the nearest health facility, and distance from MTRH was collected. Primary data was collected from the parents or guardians of the sick children; while secondary data was obtained from referral notes, referral forms, patient transfer forms and medical charts. All the patients received standard pediatric care as is required by the ethical guidelines and approvals obtained from the Institutional Research and Ethics Committee (IREC) of MTRH and Moi University School of Medicine (Approval # 1516). Other ethical considerations such as parental consent and paediatric assents were obtained prior to data collection as well as participants privacy and confidentiality was ensured by de-identifying patient data and storing their information in password protected databases. Descriptive (frequency, and median mean with corresponding standard proportions, deviations and interquartile ranges) and Inferential (Pearson chi-square and odds ratios at 95% confidence interval) statistical analysis were conducted using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 24.

## **RESULTS**

This study enrolled 422 children with more than half (51.4%; n=217) of them older than 5 years of age. The male to female ratio was 1.2:1 and majority (88.9%; n=375) of the children lived in the hospital's host county of Uasin Gishu in Western Kenya (Table 1).

 Table 1

 Sociodemographic characteristics of Study Participants

Variable	Category	Frequency	Percent
Gender of the child	Male	234	55.5
	Female	188	44.5
Age of the child	<1year	51	12.1
	1 – 5years	154	36.5
	6 -14years	217	51.4
Occupation of parent/guardian	Formally Employed	105	24.9
	Informally Employed	199	47.2
	Unemployed	118	27.9
Monthly Family/household Income	<10000	126	29.9
(in KSh)	10000 - 20000	211	50.0
	21000 - 50000	71	16.8
	51000 - 100000	12	2.8
	>100000	2	0.5
Residence	Uasin Gishu county	375	88.9
	Other counties	47	11.1
Parent/Guardian level of Education	None	4	0.9
	Primary	65	15.4
	Secondary	274	64.9
	Tertiary	79	18.7

More than one-tenth (15.9%; n=67) of the children enrolled were hospital referrals to MTRH, while the rest were self-referrals with no counter-referrals reported. Among the hospital referrals, majority (86.6%; n=58) were from government facilities, followed by those from private hospitals (11.9%; n=8), with the least representation from private clinics at

1.5% (n=1). The major reason for referral was to seek specialized care.

The main referral patterns were the proportion of children referred from hospitals and living near a public hospital, the distance they covered to reach MTRH, their chief complaints and tests done prior to referral (Table 2).

 Table 2

 Summary of Patient Characteristics of Children Referred to MTRH.

Referral Patterns (N=67)	Frequency	Percentages	
	(n)	(%)	
Living near a public hospital			
County Hospital	18	31%	
Health Centers	18	31%	
Distance to MTRH			
>10km	59	88.1%	
<10km	8	11.9%	
Chief Complaint			
Fever	32	47.7%	
Trauma	4	6%	
Abdominal Mass	3	4.5%	
Swelling	3	4.5%	
Cough	22	32.8%	
Others		1.5 %	
Tests done:			
СВС	40	68.8%	
Other Tests	27	31.2%	
Reason for Referral			
Specialized care	53	79.1%	
Lack of Equipment	5	7.5%	
Investigations	2	3%	
Further management	7	10.4%	
Referral Diagnosis			
Pneumonia	9	13.4%	
Anemia	6	8.9%	
Malaria	3	4.5	
Meningitis	3	4.5	

When a test of association was conducted, it was determined that children whose parents or guardians had secondary education or less, lived outside Uasin Gishu county were more than five (5) years of age were more likely to be referred from healthcare facilities. These relationships were statistically significant (Table 3).

 Table 3

 Association between Sociodemographic Characteristics and Facility Referral

Characteristic	AOR (95% CI)	p-value
Level of Education (Parent/Guardian): ≤ Secondary Tertiary	<b>1.146 (1.046 – 1.256)</b> 0.435 (0.198 – 0.960)	0.025
County of Residence Uasin Gishu Other Counties	0.461 (0.353 – 0.601) 19.604 (10.256 -37.476)	<0.001
Pediatric Age Group ≤ 5 years > 5 years	0.713 (0.526 – 0.968) 1.372 (1.091 – 1.727)	0.015

When adherence to transfer guidelines was assessed, four aspects (Calling prior to referral, having a Referral Document, being transferred by an ambulance and the patient being accompanied by a healthcare worker) were scored. Lack of adherence to any of the steps was scored as zero while partial adherence was defined as compliance to one of the four transfer guidelines. Total adherence was when the child's transfer

adhered to all the four aspects (score=4). When this technique was adopted, 14.9% (10) of the children referred were transferred without adhering to any of the four transfer guidelines, while nearly half (46.3%; n=31) of all hospital referrals had total adherence. More than four-fifths of the children referred from other health facilities came to MTRH with a referral document, all the ambulances had oxygen supply that was intact (Table 4).

**Table 4** *Adherence to Transfer Guidelines among Facility Referrals (N=67)* 

REFERRAL GUIDELINE	YES	NO
	n(%)	n(%)
Calling prior to Referral	32 (47.8%)	35 (52.2%)
Referral Document	56 (83.6%)	11 (16.4%)
Referral form:	31 (55.4%)	
Referral note:	25 (44.6%)	
Transfer by an Ambulance	43 (64.2%)	24 (35.8%)
Oxygen supply:	43 (100%)	
Oxygen supply intact:	43 (100%)	
Equipment functional:	40 (93%)	3 (7%)
Essential Medicines:	38 (88.4%)	5 (11.6%)
First Aid Kit:	40 (93%)	3 (7%)
Transfer Couch:	42 (97.7%)	1 (2.3%)
Patient Accompanied	46 (68.7%)	21 (31.3%)
Clinical officer:	6 (13%)	
Enrolled Community Nursing:	11 (23.9%)	
Registered Nurse:	28 (60.9%)	

Nursing student	1 (2.2%)	
-----------------	----------	--

Majority of the hospital referrals were admitted while nearly two-thirds of the selfreferrals were treated and discharged (Table 5).

 Table 5

 Management outcomes of pediatric patients referred to MTRH (N=422)

	Referral Pattern		Total
	Self-Referral	Hospital-Referral	
Admitted to The Ward	106 (29.9%)	59 (88.1%)	165 (39.1%)
Death	1 (0.3%)	1 (1.5%)	2 (0.5%)
Referred to Specialized Clinic	25 (7%)	2 (3%)	27 (6.4%)
Discharged Home	223 (62.8%)	5 (7.4%)	228 (54%)
Total	355 (100%)	67 (100%)	422 (100%)

Paediatric patients who were referred from hospitals were nearly three times (AOR = 2.932; 95% CI: 2.422, 3.550) more likely to be admitted to the wards than those who were self-referrals (Table 6).

 Table 6

 Association between Referral Status and Admission

OUTCOME	Adjusted Odds Ratio		p-value
	Hospital referral (95% CI)	Self-Referred (95% CI)	
Admission	2.932 (2.422 -3.550)	0.210 (0.118 – 0.374)	<0.001

#### **DISCUSSION**

## Proportion of Hospital Referrals

Previous studies have demonstrated that low proportions of children are often referred to tertiary national and teaching hospitals from lower-level medical facilities [4–6]. In this study, 15.9% of the children seen at MTRH were hospital referrals as required by the national healthcare referral guidelines. This reported proportion of hospital referrals in Kenya among pediatric patients is less than a third of that reported in Canada at 45.5% [7]. Studies have also compared the proportion of referrals in the United States of America

(USA) and the United Kingdom (UK) among mixed populations of children and adults (0-64 years) with varying proportions. In the USA, 30% to 36.8% of patients were referred from medical facilities [8] compared to only 13.9% in the UK [9]. This difference is attributed to the lower proportion of pediatric specialists in the UK in comparison to the United States of America [8,10].

The finding of this study on the proportion of hospital referrals differs from other published studies conducted within the East African region. In a study conducted at Tanzania's Kilombero District Health Care System [11]; out of 5,030 new pediatric cases from

government and second level health facilities, 28 (0.6%) were referred for specialized care. This extremely low proportion of referrals in Tanzania was attributed to the fact that acutely ill children are not often brought to the health facilities. Furthermore, health facility staff do not identify children who need referral and only refer those with socioeconomic support to travel to the referral healthcare facilities. Due to similarity in the socioeconomic status of the parents of pediatric patients from both Kenya and Tanzania, this could explain the consistency with the low proportions of hospital referrals for pediatric patients in Western Kenya.

## Patterns of referrals

This study assessed living near a public hospital, distance to the referral facility, the chief complaint of the pediatric patient, tests done prior to referral, reasons given for referral and the final diagnosis as patterns of pediatric patient referral. Nearly two-thirds (62%) of those referred lived near a public hospital which was four times higher than the 15.7% reported in South Africa [12]. Majority of the children referred from other healthcare facilities had to travel more than 10 kilometers to seek care. Living far away from national referral hospital increased likelihood of the child being referred from a different medical facility compared to those living near the referral hospital who were selfreferred.

The most common symptom in 47.8% of the pediatric patients referred from other healthcare facilities presented with a fever, which differs from the 17.2% of those seen in a Hong Kong referral hospital with wheezing as the chief complaint [13]. This difference could be attributed to socioeconomic and environmental differences in Kenya and Hong Kong. Whereas Kenya has more cases

of infections reported in children and presenting as fever [14], wheezing could be common in Hong Kong due to a high prevalence of asthma.

Most (79.1%) of the children in this study were referred to MTRH for specialized care while in Hong Kong most of the children were referred due to growth problems. This is because in Kenya, there is an insufficiency of medical infrastructure and specialists in many public hospitals in the counties [3]. This necessitates referral to the national hospitals such as MTRH for specialized care. On arrival at the receiving referral hospital, the children were diagnosed with anemia (15.6%) and pneumonia (10.4%). The proportion pneumonia diagnosis reported in this study was lower than that reported at an advanced pediatric emergency care in Vietnam [4], where 23.7% of the children were diagnosed with pneumonia.

Adherence to transfer process guidelines.

This study reports that nearly half (46.3%; children n=31) of the referred transferred in total adherence to all the steps in the transfer guidelines. The steps of interest were the referring facility was required to call the receiving facility prior to referral; having a referral document (either a referral form or a referral note); referral by an ambulance (that has essential medicines, first aid kit, transfer couch and an oxygen supply that is both intact and functional); and the patient should be accompanied (by either a clinical officer or a registered nurse). Majority of the children (83%) either had a referral form or referral note as a referral document. This contrasts findings from Saudi Arabia [15] where all the children referred from primary care to hospitals had a referral document. disparity could be attributed to poor communication channels between referring and receiving facilities in Kenya.

Punjab-India pre-referral In [16],documentation was also found to inadequate and lower than those reported here at 3.7%. The proportions of children who were transferred by an ambulance (64.2%) and those who were accompanied (68.7%) was close to those reported in Vietnam [4] at 49.6% respectively. and government ambulance transfer rate of 85.5% from public hospitals was reported in India [16]. Furthermore, in this study, 87% of the children transferred in an ambulance were accompanied by a nurse compared to 25.1% in Vietnam [4]. Although no child in the current study was accompanied by a medical officer, 7.6% of those in Vietnam were [4]. This difference could be attributed to the variance in the proportional distribution of human resources for health in the two countries.

#### Management outcomes

More than one third (39.1%) of all the study participants enrolled - irrespective of their referral status - were admitted. This finding was consistent with that of a study in Saudi Arabia which reported admission as a management outcome in 39.3% of the children referred for care. However, the admission rate of this study was four-times higher than reported in Vietnam [4]. An extremely low proportion (0.5%) of the referred children in this study died compared to that in Afghanistan at 3% [17]. Furthermore, nearly all (88%) of the children referred from hospitals in contrast with lower proportions in Saudi Arabia [15] where less than half of the referrals were treated and discharged. This may imply that most of the referred patients at the MTRH sick child clinic were sicker and many required emergency inpatient management.

# CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study determined that less than a quarter of pediatric patients at a national referral hospital in Western Kenya were hospital referrals with the majority being self-referrals. Less than half of all the referrals adhered to transfer process guidelines among hospital referrals. Nearly all the hospital referrals were admitted for further management with approximately three-time likelihood admission compared to self-referred children who were mostly treated and discharged. There is need for reduction in the proportion of self-referrals to national referral hospitals through targeted improvement on adherence to national healthcare referral guidelines. Most of the children seeking care at the national referral hospital should be encouraged to visit primary and secondary level healthcare facilities to reduce on selfreferrals. Referring health-facilities should be encouraged to totally comply with the recommended transfer processes. Because this study did not determine the perceptions of the parents or guardians and reasons for selfreferring their children; further qualitative studies determining reasons for self-referrals and lack of adherence to transfer guidelines should be conducted.

#### REFERENCES

1. MOH. Human Resources For Health Norms and Standards Guidelines For The Health Sector Required investments for equitable, and adequate capacity to deliver the Kenya Essential Package for Health The Kenya Health Strategic and Investment. Minist Heal Kenya. 2014; 2014–2018. Available: http://www.health.go.ke/wpcontent/uploads/2015/09/16th october WHO Norms and Standarnds Book.pdf

- 2. MOH. KENYA HEALTH SECTOR REFERRAL STRATEGY. Minist Heal Div Emerg Disaster Risk Manag Afya House. 2014.
- 3. Kamau KJ, Osuga BO, Njuguna S. Challenges Facing Implementation Of Referral System For Quality Health Care Services In Kiambu County, Kenya. Heal Syst Policy Res. 2017;04: 1–8. doi:10.21767/2254-9137.100067
- 4. Treleaven E, Pham TN, Le DN, Brooks TN, Le HT, Partridge JC. Referral patterns, delays, and equity in access to advanced paediatric emergency care in Vietnam. Int J Equity Health. 2017;16: 1–11. doi:10.1186/s12939-017-0703-y
- 5. English M, Esamai F, Wasunna A, Were F, Ogutu B, Wamae A, et al. Assessment of inpatient paediatric care in first referral level hospitals in 13 districts in Kenya. Lancet. 2004;363: 1948–1953. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(04)16408-8
- 6. Shabila NP, Al-hadithi TS. Assessment of the Iraqi primary care referral system: reporting a high self-requested referral rate. From Ed. 2012.
- 7. Shadd J, Ryan BL, Maddocks H, Thind A. Patterns of referral in a Canadian primary care electronic health record database: Retrospective cross-sectional analysis. Inform Prim Care. 2011;19: 217–223. doi:10.14236/jhi.v19i4.816
- 8. Bjørndal A, Carling C, Dyrnes JA, Forrest CB, Majeed A, Weiner JP, et al. Comparison of specialty referral rates in the United Kingdom and the United States: retrospective cohort analysis provided technical and administrative support in the United. Prim Care. 2002;325: 370–371.
- 9. Twamley K, Craig F, Kelly P, Hollowell DR, Mendoza P, Bluebond-Langner M. Underlying barriers to referral to paediatric palliative care services: Knowledge and attitudes of health care professionals in a paediatric tertiary care centre in the United Kingdom. J Child Heal Care. 2014;18: 19–30. doi:10.1177/1367493512468363
- 10. Forrest LF, Adams J, White M, Rubin G. Factors associated with timeliness of post-primary care referral, diagnosis and treatment for lung

- cancer: population-based, data-linkage study. Br J Cancer. 2014;111: 1843–1851.
- 11. Font F, Quinto L, Masanja H, Nathan R, Ascaso C, Menendez C, et al. BMC International Health and Human Rights BMC International Health and Human Rights 2002, 2 x Paediatric referrals in rural Tanzania: the Kilombero District Study-a case series. BMC Int Health Hum Rights. 2002.

http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-698X/2/4http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-698X/2/4

- 12. Cluver L, Orkin M. Cumulative risk and AIDS-orphanhood: Interactions of stigma, bullying and poverty on child mental health in South Africa. Soc Sci Med. 2009;69: 1186–1193. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2009.07.033
- 13. So LY. Patterns of referral to the paediatric specialist clinic of a regional hospital: descriptive study. Hong Kong Med J. 2000;6: 24–28.
- 14. Opondo C, Ntoburi S, Wagai J, Wafula J, Wasunna A, Were F, et al. Are hospitals prepared to support newborn survival? an evaluation of eight first-referral level hospitals in Kenya\*. Trop Med Int Heal. 2009;14: 1165–1172. doi:10.1111/j.1365-3156.2009.02358.x
- 15. Jarallah JS. Referral from primary care to hospitals in saudi arabia: 1) quality of referral letters and feedback reports. J Family Community Med. 1998;5: 15–22. Available: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23008585
- 16. Ezhumalai G, Muralidharan J, Bansal A, Nallasamy K, Bharti B. Referrals to a pediatric emergency room of a tertiary care teaching hospital before and after introduction of a referral education module- a qualitative study 2020; 1–13. doi:10.21203/rs.2.20001/v1
- 17. Arwal SH, Aulakh BK, Bumba A, Siddula A. Learning by doing in practice: A roundtable discussion about stakeholder engagement in implementation research. Heal Res Policy Syst. 2017;15. doi:10.1186/s12961-017-0275-8