# Pull Factors in the Political Economy of International Commercial Sex Work in Nigeria

Ifeanyi P. Onyeonoru
Department of Sociology
University of Ibadan
Nigeria
E-mail: ifyonyes@yahoo.com

### Introduction1

Politics today is largely a struggle over how domestic institutional structures should mesh with market fluidity and transnational capital flows. In these struggles over how to define and tinker with domestic arrangements, the question of who might legitimately have sex with whom is critical. It touches on all the hotspots of ethnicity, national origin and class. (Lancaster 2003).

As the year 2003 rolled by, no less than 13,000 Nigerian girls were reported to have been trapped in transit camps in West African countries along the international sex route - in a bid to make their way to Europe. The girls, estimated to be between 14 years and 28 years, are commonly referred to as 'abandoned cargoes', in the local parlance of their host countries. They are victims of sex export syndicates whose agents had lured them from Nigeria with the promise of taking them to 'paradise' in Europe, only to abandon them in foreign lands en route. Young Nigerian girls recruited to service the sex market in Europe, were left crawling the streets of neighbouring countries including the Republic of Benin, Togo, Burkina Faso, Mali and Morocco, the last transit camp. No less than 46 Nigerians were reported to have taken a fatal plunge into the Mediterranean Sea in 2003 alone - in a desperate bid to cross into Spain (New Age, December 31, 2003). At the time of writing (2004), the United States Department of State classified Nigeria as a source, transit and destination country for trafficked women and children (Weekend Vanguard, June 19, 2004).

The internationalisation of commercial sex work became more evident in the 1980s as sex workers from Latin America and the Caribbean, as well as Sub-Saharan Africa, increasingly found their way to Western Europe. Since the fall of the Iron Curtain, the rate of prostitutes migrating abroad from Central and Eastern Europe has increased dramatically — a situation viewed by some scholars as shifts in the social organisation of prostitution from tradition to later modernity (Offe C, 1995;O'Neill, 1994).

In the specific case of Nigeria, in 1999 alone, three batches of deportees arrived in Nigeria from Italy and were paraded as deviants on the Nigerian

Television Authority (NTA) network news. Most of the girls were reported to be below 25 years. Since the majority of the deportees were from Edo State (Benin City in particular), the Federal Government handed over the deportees to the monarch, the Oba of Benin – as part of the strategy for dealing with the problem. Regretting the development, the Oba confirmed receiving a series of complaints from the Inspector General of Police and the Minister of External Affairs and the Edo Cultural Association in Italy about the notoriety of the indigenes in international prostitution, and the negative impact it has had on Nigeria's image abroad.

In February 2000, Saudi Arabian authorities protested to the Federal Government over the influx of Nigerian prostitutes into Saudi Arabia, despite the latter's strict laws against sex trade. Saudi Authorities also gave names and addresses of the prostitutes in Saudi as well as those of their sponsors – an event confirmed by the Foreign Affairs Minister (*National Concord*, February 21, 2000). The Nigerian Television Authority (March 22, 2000) also reported the deportation of Nigerian prostitutes from other countries in Europe such as France and Germany. In June 2003, 19 women and their traffickers were arrested by the Nigeria Police at Idiroko – a border town between Nigeria and the Republic of Benin – as they were being trafficked abroad. The confessions of the girls published by the news media indicated that most of them had Italy as their ultimate destination for commercial sex work. One of them was a married woman (*Sunday Punch*, June 22, 2003).

Although prostitution has always existed in Nigeria like any other country of the world, the current bubble for it, especially its internationalisation, is a product of a response to, and contradiction of, the recent political economy of neo-liberalism in Nigeria. Since the 1980s when the boom in international sex trade became noticeable, and given its reality as one of the means of resolving the threat to livelihood, the traditional stigma associated with prostitution began to wear off—raising social value questions of its own. Given this survival drive, the traffickees are sexually and economically exploited by the male dominant brokers right from the time of departure to the 'probation' period on the West African Coast and in Europe. They are subjected to unprotected sex with brokers and clients, notwithstanding its high-risk implications for sexually transmitted diseases, with particular reference to HIV/AIDS.

Apart from the trauma associated with deportation, the girls are reported to be victims of violent attacks by their local competitors, police raids, rape, limited access to medical care, drug abuse, sexual abuse, torture, murder etc. (Newswatch, July 26 1999; The Economist, February 14, 1998; O'Neil, et. al., 1994; Offe, 1995; Overs and Longo, 1997) These abuses are made worse by their often illegal residence/work status.

This study was guided by the following research question: What are the pull factors associated with the trafficking of Nigerian girls for international commercial sex work and what efforts are being made to eradicate it? The

broad objective of the study was to undertake a critical examination of the pull factors associated with the trafficking of Nigerian girls for international commercial sex work and efforts made by state and non-state actors to eradicate the problem.

The major assumption that guided the study was that international commercial sex work by Nigerian girls/women is primarily motivated by the perception of better socio-economic opportunities in the migrant-receiving countries. I argue from a political economic point of view that the process is basically driven by the emergent neo-liberal economy in Nigeria, and hence, any efforts especially by non-state actors to deal with the issue must be supported by a responsible state policy environment that would make international trafficking for sex trade less attractive.

The research was located in Benin City, Nigeria. The location was chosen because Benin City is widely reported to be a major 'market' for international commercial sex work (Newswatch, July 26, 1999; Sunday Punch, October 28, 2001; The Anchor, July 25, 2001; New Age, December 31, 2003). According to Idia Renaissance Handbook,2 while every black woman in Italy is seen as a potential prostitute, the average Italian who knows nothing about Africa or Nigeria only talks of 'Edo' and 'Benin', which they have come to associate with the African axis of human trafficking, being the home base of about 90 percent of trafficked victims encountered in Italy. The study made use of both primary and secondary data. Primary data consisted of information obtained from 28 key informants selected through a combination of purposive sampling method and the snowball method. The respondents were made up as follows: five opinion leaders, 14 girls (potential migrants) randomly selected from the Idia Renaissance Skill Acquisition Centre in Benin: five parents, two key officials of the Ministry of Women Affairs, and two officials of the Federal Immigration Department at the Murtala Mohammed Airport, Lagos - all purposively selected. As part of the ethical practice the identities of the deported girls were concealed by the Centre. Five of the girls who were judged special cases by virtue of their responses to the interviews were, however, earmarked for further interviews using the life history method. The objective was to tease out more information regarding significant trajectories in the social experiences of the girls that may have been associated with the choice of international sex work. Collection of secondary data involved the critical incident survey technique – information was sourced from agencies that were considered central to the subject of study. These included such public institutions as the Ministry of Women Affairs and Youth Development, the Immigration Department of the Murtala Mohammed International Airport, Lagos, Federal Office of Statistics (FOS) as well as non-governmental organisations like Idia Renaissance and Women Trafficking and Child Labour Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF). Not much useful data were obtained from the public sector institutions.

The pull factors examined in this paper are related to push factors associated with the trafficking of Nigerian girls for international commercial sex work examined by the author elsewhere. The push factors include relative social deprivation, limited access to the labour market due to the high rate of (youth) unemployment, family disorganisation, wider value distortion in the Nigerian society and gender based inequities located in cultural practice of primogeniture in Benin, Edo State, in which inheritance passes to only the first son of the father (often in polygynous relationships). Viewed in this light, the migration of the girls can partly be seen in the light of agency.

### Pull Factors in Girls Trafficking for International Commercial Sex Work Abroad

Perceptions of Opportunities Abroad for Socio-economic Advancement

The pull factors associated with the trafficking of Nigerian girls/women for international commercial sex work relate to perceptions (real and unreal) about chances for socio-economic advancement that are available in the migrant-receiving countries. Typically, migrants come from areas that are much less developed – with higher economic deprivation than the area to which they move because they wish to take advantage of the economic opportunities offered by the latter. The potential migrant would assess the opportunities open to him or her. S/he would have some idea about what s/he could earn at home and what his or her employment chances are in the area of migration, even though information may not be very accurate (Peil, 1977; Shaw, 1975; Stichter, 1985; Milazi 1998). Given the high rate of unemployment in Nigeria (Onyeonoru 2003a), emigration in search of jobs became an issue tied to existence. There was an astronomical increase in registered unemployment within the period 1980-1993 (where data are available) from 16.88 percent in 1980 to 68.58 percent in 1993.

Anita, an 18 year old girl with Junior Secondary School (JSS) education who could not continue to the senior level for lack of funds, for instance, had this to say:

I got to know that we were going to be fixed in paid employment outside Nigeria, especially in Europe and Benin Republic. Deep inside me I knew anything could happen. We may be raped or forced for sex or engage in prostitution. We were at their mercy. But we were prepared and determined to go out there and succeed.

More than 90 percent of Africans in a recent BBC survey were reported to be proud of their continent. But African's pride in being African rarely extends to confidence in their own countries' government. The levels of confidence in people's own countries calculated from answers to four questions concerning economic prospects including unemployment and the ability of the country to attract foreign investment, saw Nigeria ranking very low — only better than Zambia. While poverty, HIV/AIDS and unemployment were ranked the three

top most important African problems, the BBC survey observed strangely that unemployment was rated a more important issue among Nigerians than HIV/AIDS. The positive views about Africa notwithstanding, a majority would emigrate outside Africa, if given a chance. Very few Africans chose another African country apart from South Africa and 'no one at all wanted to live in Nigeria – Africa's most populous country' (BBC News 2004). This is not surprising, given the information in the Report that only 36 percent of Nigerians in the labour force are in full time work.

Following on the heels of the BBC Report was another, which stated that about 1000 Nigerian deportees arrived the country from Libya within one week in October 2004. The deportees who had taken unconventional routes to enter European countries were reported to have been stranded in Libya for months and even years. Some of the deportees, who had managed to make some savings while there, were not allowed by the Libyan authorities to take their funds and belongings before deportation (*This Day*, October 23 2004).

The economic crisis since the early 1980s (Olukoshi 1989; Bangura 1989) and neo-liberal reforms that emphasise trade liberalisation, a market economy typified by the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) implemented in Nigeria since 1986 (Onimode 1989; Woodward 1992; Onyeonoru 1994; 2003) may well have a strong bearing on the sex trade. This could be observed in the interaction between the harsh economic environment (push factors) precipitated by the economic crisis and the globalisation (pull) variables such as rapid changes in information technology, transformation in the communication industry and the breaking down of physical, social, cultural and political barriers in the international arena (Giddens, 1990; Worsley, 1994; Loxley 1995; Aina 1997; Sawyerr, 1998; Scholfe, 2000; Went, 2000). These were re-inforced by the 'bright lights' perception of potential migrants, to pull sex workers abroad. Frey (1996), therefore, observed that migrants in the 1990s tend to be less constrained in their destinations and more apt to respond to 'pushes' and 'pulls' of the labour market as well as other amenities, which occasionally shift in response to economic cycles and global economic forces.

Hence, the harsh social conditions unleashed by the economic crisis and neo-liberal reforms such as the massive devaluation of the local currency (naira), combined with the slack labour market conditions to generate a push migratory effect on young people. International commercial sex work by aspiring female youths and their traffickers became an integral part of this movement. But beyond survival, the sex trade tended to dramatically improve the social class status of the trafficked girls and their families, given the economic benefits that accrue from the high exchange rates of foreign currency.

Regarding the basic motivation for the sex trade as 'mostly economic', a respondent reflected on the survival implication: 'One thing you must bear in mind is that these girls don't mind the inhuman treatment they face over there

so far as (sic) dollars roll in. They believe in the maltreatment than (sic) staying here in Nigeria'.

In line with the economic thesis, the study conducted by Orubuloye et al, (1994) in Nigeria, located the motivation for commercial sex work in its economic transactional nature. This was corroborated by other studies such as Isiugo-Abanihe and Odiagbe, 1998; Adegbola and Babatola, 1999; Marck, 1999. Hence, 'when support or survival is involved, the woman is regarded as foolish not to offer or accept sexual relations and to accept financial assistance in return' (Orubuloye et. al., 1994:19). The major motivations for prostitution are largely related to the resolve of the young women involved 'to make their way in the world and may be less influenced by the accusation that it is an immoral way of life'. The sex workers in the study considered the trade as a stage in life and an opportunity for a period of intensive saving in order to establish themselves for the rest of their lives and to break the vicious circle of poverty. (Orubuloye et. al. 1994). Similar views were expressed by Caldwell (1991,1998). Estimating the international sex industry turnover at about \$20 billion a year, Overs and Longo (1997) observed that sex workers who target more lucrative markets migrate, often illegally with the assistance of highly organised brokers who make unfair profit by providing transport, the necessary paper work for the journey such as transport, visas, letters of support, accommodation and employment in the country of destination. Typically, brokers recover their expenses by taking the woman's earnings in the migrantreceiving country. In most cases her freedom is limited until the debt is paid and even beyond that. This form of labour contract and debt bondage is illegal but not uncommon.

Since poverty is a major factor in the prostitutes' existence and downfall (Finnegan 1979), sex workers from developing countries where poverty is endemic often migrate to work in places where conditions are below the accepted standards in the migrant receiving country—as part of the coping strategies against economic hardship (Afolayan, 1998; The World Bank 1996, 1998; UNDP 1996, 1998; The Economist, February 14, 1998).

The health implications of commercial sex work have always been a major concern for studies in the area of commercial sex work. Bindman (1997), for instance, observed:

The lack of international and local protection renders sex workers vulnerable to exploitation in the workplace, and to harassment or violence at the hands of employers, law enforcement officials, clients and the public. The need for worker protection, including occupational health and safety provisions, is of particular relevance in the current context of HIV/AIDS. Sex workers without rights in their place of work are uniquely vulnerable to infection with HIV and other sexually transmitted diseases, as they routinely lack the information, materials or authority to protect themselves and their clients.

Debt bonding and perhaps limited knowledge about sexual health are contributory factors that make migrant sex workers more vulnerable to clients'

demands for unprotected sex. A study by Vanwesenbeeck (1997) for instance, documented the powerlessness of prostitutes in negotiating heterosexual encounters and the use of condoms, especially among young migrant prostitutes in the Netherlands. A potential migrant at the Skill Acquisition Centre, Benin, who indicated her interest to join a trafficker whenever she had the opportunity, underplayed the health implication of commercial sex work with particular reference to HIV/AIDS as follows:

People dey die for Nigeria anyhow now! You fit commot for road now motor go knock you n. Even the AIDS wey dem dey talk, no be only when you sleep with man you go get am. You fit go saloon to barb your hair them give you AIDS for there. The people wey dey carry AIDS for say dem sleep with man them no sabi do. Me I go make sure say them use condom. And me sef I fit use woman condom. Them say that one good.<sup>5</sup>

Onyeonoru (2001) similarly reported the case of a deportee who justified her sex work abroad on the grounds that she was not doing anything basically different from what she was used to doing with her boy friends in Nigeria, the only distinction being that her sex service abroad fetched her dollars – with just a little more stress.

The moral economy derivative for female adolescents' behaviour and their social development as relating to commercial sex business is indicated in the observation of Oppong (1995:36) who reflected on the immense spatial, social, and familial dislocation of social groups so entailed:

Instead of being enmeshed in lifelong systems of morality binding transactions of kinsmen and affinity, ensuring group solidarity, and some measures of security across the generations for young and old, individuals are forced more and more to rely upon precarious forms of livelihood in strange environments. They are drawn to engage in forms of short term, unprotected, deregulated, opportunistic, economic, and sexual behaviour, which are entailed, by such forms of survival, and associated lifestyles, and constraints when institutions and frameworks promoting and regulating employment and procreation are lacking or in their infancy.

Both productive and reproductive behaviour and relationships are thereby being stripped of their moral, long term, responsible contractual framework and being recast in daily, nightly or hourly rated modes of operation, with the implicit exploitation and adverse effects on the dignity of labour, and individual security (Oppong 1993).

# Foreign Exchange Earning Potential

The most prominent of the perceived opportunities in the destination countries are foreign exchange earnings (which relate to both push and pull factors) and socially enhanced status that now accompany those successful in the sex trade. The importance of foreign exchange earning as a pull factor is brought home profoundly by the accounts of the aforementioned girls arrested at the Nigerian border with the Republic of Benin as they were being trafficked. All the girls attributed their motivation to travel abroad, especially to Italy, to perceived

opportunities for 'dollar' jobs out there. The following are the accounts of some of the girls (*The Punch*, June 23, 2003).

Florence, a 19-year-old girl who only attended primary school:

I was told that there were jobs outside Nigeria and want to work and earn hard currencies. I know it was going to be difficult, but I was determined. Yes, I know prostitution could come in any form.

# Blessing 19, with secondary school education and no job:

This is the last resort. I am aware that we could engage in prostitution but what do I do? Even in Nigeria here, virtually every young girl has been turned into sex object. Even housewives now engage in extramarital affairs to keep body and soul together. All these things are not good in a country that wants progress, but what do we do? Do we fold our arms and expect 'Manna' from heaven? The situation is so bad in Nigeria.

#### Endurance 22 years:

It is common thing for ladies to travel outside the country in my area. So, I arranged to travel with the next batch. I was promised a good job outside Nigeria. I want to stay anywhere outside Nigeria earning hard currencies. I would be careful not to engage in any illegitimate thing. Prostitution? Well, it depends...

The foregoing indicates that an understanding of the pattern of trafficking for sex work in Nigeria is inextricably related to an understanding of the political economy not just of unemployment but more broadly of the new inequality characteristic of free market societies. Commercial sex work should, therefore, be viewed within the context of the challenges, contradictions and frustrations associated with global capitalism, rather than the deviance model with which it is often associated. Viewed thus, one of the most significant aspects of contemporary heterosexual commercial sex work is that women are grappling with their disadvantaged social position in the context of capitalist development. Recruitment to the rank of prostitute is often wrongly characterised as only concerning a small group of deviant women. Sex work is however, generated by women's relative poverty given that for large numbers sex is their most saleable commodity. Involvement in it does bring comparatively substantial financial returns. (Mcleod, 1982)

The decline of social responsibility assumed by the Keynesian State – which for much of the twentieth century served to blunt the degradations and ravages of the market place – implies an increase in social responsibility somewhere else – in the civic arena. Invariably, this 'somewhere else' is the heteronormative nuclear family (Lancaster 2003). This decline in social responsibility associated with the 'rolling back of the state' implicit in the adoption of neo-liberalism as a dominant organising doctrine has put enormous pressure on individuals and groups in African society. Put otherwise, the relationship between the 'miniaturised view of citizenship', its emphasis on personal morality, its struggles over gender roles and its obsession over sex and

'economic downsizing', have direct linkages with the question of political economy:

Like recto to verso, regulation of the libidinal economy is only the other side of deregulation of the wider political economy. Seen in this light, the downsized and personalized view of citizenship, with its obsession over sex, is not so much a 'distraction' from issues of a political-economic order as it is another way into those questions. (Lancaster 2003:338).

Members of the extended families that are typical of Africa respond to such a pressure in varied ways some of which may not be normative, and therefore, adverse to the moral economy (Durkheim 1951;Onyeonoru 2002). This applies to commercial sex work, which in many countries has not acquired the morality, legality or dignity accorded other types labour, its economic potential notwithstanding (Abraham 1997). When the question of survival comes to the fore, however, issues of morality tend to be relegated to the background.

Mr. Ben, a respondent in this study, expressed concern about the tendency for Benin girls to sacrifice long-term benefits of socially developing womanhood for what he termed 'short-term gains' derivable from the sex trade. His view re-inforces the contradictions associated with neo-liberal economic development in Nigeria: 'One thing I keep asking them is why must you continue in this business? And one thing they keep replying is that without it there will be no development in Benin'.

The researcher was shown some houses in Benin said to be owned by international sex workers. A particular one bore the inscription 'Good Mother'. This was said to be a tribute to the mother who contributed immensely to the success of the daughter's sex work abroad by regularly sending charms to her in Italy—all in the bid to enable the family 'get up'. The most glaring indication of socio-economic advancement associated with the return migrants who earn 'dollars' abroad include their ability to acquire such properties as modern houses, state of the arts cars and buses. *Notes 2*: 9 puts it mildly when it observed as follows:

One of the social consequences of trafficking in women has been a visible increase in income to the families of the girls involved. This has in many ways cushioned the affected from the harsh economic realities of the vast majority and has made trafficking in women very attractive to both sponsors and young girls. Another area of the social consequences is the ability on the part of the trafficked girls to acquire goods such as colour television sets, videocassette recorder, video CDs, mini-buses etc. These goods are either shipped directly home to be placed under the custody of their parents or siblings or in the alternative cash is sent home for the gradual purchase of these items.

The average active sex worker returnee migrant tends to 'live big' – to wear expensive clothing and to drive an expensive car. Prior to the era of cell phones in Nigeria (before 1999) it was common to identify such girls in public telephone booths where they spent a long time making trunk calls in Italian.

Trafficking for sex trade is not limited to girls of lower social status. Angela, a Nigerian graduate of English from the University of Benin, informed a Nigerian reporter in Mali about her experience in Tangier where no less than 4,000 girls were camped. According to her:

I decided to retrace my steps because Tangier is a deadly trap. It takes a few hours by boat to cross into Spain, yet some Nigerians have spent six years trying to do so. At night it becomes so alluring because you can see the lights of Europe, but the Spanish Navy would not think twice before sinking your boat or turning it back to Morocco. Many Nigerians have perished trying to sneak into Spain, in make shift rafts and this year alone about 46 Nigerian men and women, are known to have drowned (New Age, December, 31, 2003).

The significance of the above narrations that relate to foreign exchange earning as a pull factor in international commercial sex work can be grasped by considering the fact that the exchange rate of the local currency to a unit of the dollar rose astronomically between 1980 and 1993 – from 0.5 to 22.1. Currency devaluation was one of the neo-liberal economic conditionalities imposed on Nigeria by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) (and the World Bank) as a basis for negotiating the country's external debt since the 1980s. The official implementation of the reforms, which took off in 1986 under the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) was to become the albatross of the Nigerian economy (see Onyeonoru 2003b for details). Second, the consumer price index tended to regularly respond to the rise in the exchange rate of the naira to the dollar - recording an increase from 2.0 in 1980 when the dollar exchanged for 0.5 naira, to 36.9 in 1993 when the official dollar exchange rate rose to 22.1 and 56.8 for the parallel market. By 2002, when the official exchange rate soared to 129.6 the consumer price index rose to 236.1. The foregoing represents a massive rise of more than 259 fold for the official exchange rate and more than 118 fold increase in the consumer price index in the period 1980-2002.

The official exchange rate, for instance, rose annually from 0.6 in the period 1975-84 to 9.8 in 1985-94 and by 1995 and beyond it escalated to 64.2. The consumer price index similarly rose sharply from 17.7 to 28.9 annually before sloping to 15.6 in the corresponding period. The association between the currency devaluation and the state of human development in Nigeria suggests that the devaluation of the local currency, when not accompanied by a corresponding rise in income (both at the macro and micro levels) generates a high inflationary trend, high cost of living and poverty. This assertion can be given credence when viewed against the backdrop of Nigerian public sector wages<sup>7</sup> that continued to lag behind the devaluation rate and consumer price index.

According to the 1997 Human Development Report (HDR), Nigeria's human poverty index (HPI) was as high as 40.5 while the country took the 54th position among 77 developing countries ranked according to three key variables of human poverty – longevity, knowledge and a decent living standard (UNDP 1997). This HPI performance can be regarded as being very poor when compared with other developing countries in and outside Africa.

Nigeria's situation improved little under its 'democracy' as the country in 2003 was ranked 152 of the 175 countries assessed in terms of their performance in the human development index (HDI). Nigeria's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita for 2001 was a mere US\$ 850, compared to US \$3,850 for developing countries and US\$ 2,230 for low-income countries. The figure for Nigeria was also well below US\$ 1,831 for Sub-Saharan Africa and US\$1,186 for low human development countries where Nigeria was located (UNDP 2003).

The deteriorating human conditions in Nigeria becomes more glaring when compared with less endowed economies in the same West African sub-region. Ghana's HDI ranking in 2003 was 129 compared to Nigeria's 175. The GDP per capita for Ghana far outstripped its Nigerian counterpart at US\$ 2,250 for the corresponding period. An equally disturbing aspect of the poverty in Nigeria is the level of inequality. In the 1996-97 period (where data are available) the poorest 10 percent of the population had only a 1.6 percent share of the country's income or consumption with the share of the poorest 20 percent being a meager 4.4 percent. On the other hand, the richest 10 percent enjoyed 40.8 percent of income or consumption while the share of the richest 20 percent was 55.7 percent of income or consumption. The level of inequality is reflected in a high coefficient index of 50.6 for Nigeria compared with 39.6 for Ghana (UNDP 2003).

The high exchange rate of the dollar to the naira drew attention to the potential of foreign exchange earnings as a viable coping strategy within the context of the economic crisis and neo-liberal economic reforms and triggered off an international emigration wave that is remarkable in Nigerian history. It also transformed the sex trade from a predominantly local trade to an international one (Onyeonoru 2001).

There are, therefore, certain contradictions in the neo-liberal economic reforms that tend to drive the trafficking for sex work, which have remained neglected by both the Fund and the Bank and most importantly, by policy makers in Nigeria. The basic motivation for currency devaluation by any economic logic is to make exports attractive for foreign trade in order to attain a more favourable terms of trade. Such devaluation, however, may benefit economies that would use their capacity for exports to attain the underlying objective. This is not the case with Nigerian. Crude oil, the country's major export commodity, which accounts for between 95 percent and 99 percent of its total major exports is controlled by a cartel – the Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC), and hence is not free to respond to devaluation.

# Globalisation factors

Contemporary globalisation has been observed to particularly relate to the intersection of presence and absence, the interlacing of social events and social relations 'at a distance' with local contextualities (Giddens 1991). It involves

the intensification of social relations which link distant localities such that local occurrences are shaped by events happening miles away – an expression of global restructuring in modern capitalist relations in recent decades. One of its major impacts derives from the speed provided by communication and information technology (Giddens 1990, 1991, Aina 1997), described as 'the death of distance' (Cairncross 2000).

Certain globalisation factors that contribute to the current trend in girls' trafficking for commercial sex work (Onyeonoru 2003a) are noteworthy. For example, Western Union Money Transfer services are used by the girls in the repatriation of money to Nigeria; courier services through which charms are sent to Italy and other countries; the Global System of Mobile Communication (GSM) that enhances communication between the sex workers and other actors in Nigeria; Internet access (electronic mail) that facilitates easy communication and bridges the distance; and 'Uroupota Hall' at Ring Road, Benin situated close to the Oba's palace in Benin City and managed by palace chiefs for the transmission of information reproduced in Italy by the sex workers, as a medium for the gathering and dissemination of information about home using the above mentioned media. Pa James, one of the key informants in this study, reflected on the significance of the above facilities as follows:

You see, there are so many things that attract and aid these movements, like when you look at Edo or Benin properly, the 'Western Union Money Transfer' and the 'money grant' operated by Union Banks and UBA are all factors for these. People who are into the act use the advantages to send money home. Hitherto, exchange and foreign currency was (sic) sent through central Bank, but now these entire media have made it less cumbersome. UBA uses a whole building for this purpose.

# Availability of Host and Information

The destination choices of migrants are likely to be based on the availability of contacts abroad even more than on the perception of economic opportunities. The new migrant needs a place to stay and assistance in finding a job and getting started (Adepoju 1985, 1998; Leslie 1963; Peil 1976; 1997; Pronk 1993). The hosting people who see them as outsiders competing for the limited economic opportunities available to them are often afraid of immigrant backlash (Massey, 1995), and hence, resist them. This has a remarkable link with the trafficking business in Benin.

Indeed, the 'Italo' phenomenon in Benin can be traced back to the 1970s when Italian construction firms like DUMEZ came to Benin – Benin being strategically located as an access route to the northern, eastern and western parts of Nigeria. The Italians patronised the local prostitutes, made friends with Benin girls and even married some of them whom they took to Italy, and for whose parents they even built houses in Nigeria. This was not such a big deal at that time when a dollar exchanged for less than one naira. With the neo-liberal economic reforms in Nigeria since the 1980s, with particular reference to gross

devaluation of the local currency in the 1990s – earlier indicated, the 'Italo' sex trade became big business. The opportunities for information and hosting had been facilitated for brokers by the Italian connection of the 1970s and this became a medium for 'coping' in the crisis of the 1980s and beyond. This development is particularly important in the light of socio-political factors with regard to keen resource competition related to the fear of domination among the multi-cultural and plural ethnic groups in the Benin axis of Edo State. Hence, while the advantage of the Benin in the 1970s with the Italian connection became utilised to enhance the hosting of trafficked girls in the 1980s and beyond, the foreign exchange earned from the sex work can be viewed as socially reinforcing the Benin supremacy within the competitive ethnic configuration of Edo State and its neighbours (Onyeonoru 2003a).

## ITALO Craze: Poverty, Not Madness

The fevour for ITALO business, though common, is not universal in Benin. Several poor Benin girls conscious of the 'whore stigma' still consider international sex work as an unacceptable panacea to poverty. An interesting event took place during one of the interview sessions involving the researcher and respondents in a Benin family. From the discussions it was easy to deduce that the respondent (and her siblings), condemned the 'Italo' idea from a religious persuasion — referring to it as 'whoredom'. In the course of the interview, however, their mother walked in, listened briefly to the discussion and mistaking the researcher for a trafficker remarked:

My son, help us O! These my children them no dey gree O!. Them no say who dey serve God make im no find way open eye. Me no understand this kind thing O!9

The woman's son who must have been listening to the interview from the inner room walked in instantly, and responded to the mother's comment (with obvious implications for previous disagreement on the matter):

Mama we are not against your going to Italy. If you are sure you are still marketable you can go. We will not mind. But leave us alone. We will not go.

The above relates to the worry expressed in *Notes 2:5* with regard to the involvement of family members in the trafficking business:

It becomes even more difficult to understand and makes little or no sense when husband and parents encourages (sic) their wives and children to enter an apparent lucrative yet dirty business. Some husband and parents not only encourage their wives and children but also facilitate the process. All these (sic) because of the expected booty from the undignifying trade.

Hence, some girls do resist scouts, sponsors or brokers who canvass for patronage. The case of Joan narrated by her cousin (respondent) also confirms this resistance. Joan's father had asked her to join one of his sisters to Italy for prostitution. She refused, and said to her father, 'if you want to depend on the

money that I will make from prostitution to build a house, you will never build'. The event created a severe conflict between the father and her daughter described by the respondent as 'living like cat and dog'.

A related event was also recorded in the Nigerian home video Glamour Girls 11 – in the case of little Laura. She was trafficked by her aunt (so called) in the guise of compensating her mother for her parental contribution to the aunt's upbringing. But when faced with the stark reality of prostitution in Italy, Laura retorted:

Aunty, I've chosen to die here rather than practice prostitution. Is prostitution the school you promised my mother you'll send me to? My parents fed you... you deceived her and lured me to Italy to prostitute for you. Over my dead body.

Laura did pay the ultimate cost. She was shot dead by the aunt's personal security guards on instruction. Many a Laura are still there in Benin holding strongly to their personal convictions against the sex trade.

## Efforts Aimed At Eradicating Girls' Trafficking in Nigeria

The efforts of the Nigerian Government to deal with the trafficking of girls for commercial sex work abroad tend to be limited, involving arrests, detention, interrogation and possible prosecution. As indicated in the introductory section, the deported or arrested girls are sometimes released to their state governors and traditional rulers as part of what may be termed a cultural solution to the crisis. Often the girls and their traffickers are given media publicity, especially through the national television, the Nigerian Television Authority (NTA). This treatment is punitive – to humiliate them and to serve as a deterrent to others. In the light of the prevailing economic difficulties and challenges, these coercive measures have not been successful in stemming the tide of the sex business. As the cases narrated in this study indicate, the girls sound resolved to utilise the international sex trade for socio-economic advancement. Given the circumstances, coercive measures may not be successful. This may explain the recent classification of Nigeria as a source, transit and destination country for trafficked women and children by a United States Department of State Report published in 2004. The Report also indicted the Nigerian security and government personnel for significant complicity in trafficking, and for the noticeable failure in addressing this complicity. (Weekend Vanguard, June 19, 2004). Non-governmental interventions in the area seem to be making some progress. The most prominent of these NGOs are Idia Renaissance based in Benin, and the Women Trafficking and Child Labour Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF) based in Abuja.

Idia Renaissance, the Benin-based NGO, was founded by the wife of the Edo State Governor (1999-2007), Mrs. Eki Igbinedion. Idia Renaissance was the first organised effort in Nigeria to deal with the problem of girls trafficking for

commercial sex work abroad. The objectives of Idia Renaissance include the following:

- The eradication of trafficking in women and girls.
- Increasing positive cultural practices and eradicating harmful traditional practices against women and children.
- Equipping youth with information to guide against drug abuse and trafficking.
- Empowering women and girls to develop their capacity.
- Advocacy and mobilisation of relevant organs for promotion of gender equality.
- Support for all meaningful efforts at promoting indigenous cultural norms and values towards creating a distinct personality for the Edo person.

The main target population of the Renaissance is potential and real prostitutes—those practicing prostitution and those at risk. Girls deported or arrested in the process of trafficking are also accommodated by the Centre for rehabilitation. The Centre provides counseling services for these girls, introduces them to alternative skills, and strives to ensure that they are not publicised in order to preserve their dignity and self esteem. The skills provided by the Centre include computer and secretarial studies, home economics, hairdressing, fashion designing and tailoring. The Centre collaborates with organisations in Italy such as TAMPEP that are involved in similar projects in its attempt to find a more permanent solution to the Nigerian situation.

Another remarkable endeavour targeted at the trafficking for sex trade problems is that initiated by the wife of the Nigerian Vice President, Mrs. Titi Abubakar in 1999, within the framework of the Women Trafficking and Child Labour Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF). The objectives of the organisation include the prevention of trafficking, the prosecution of traffickers, and the protection and assistance to the victims of trafficking. WOTCLEF sponsored a Bill on the National Agency for Trafficking in Persons and Child Abuse which was passed by the House of Representatives and the Senate and signed into law on July 14, 2004 by President Olusegun Obasanjo. This provided a legal framework for the apprehension and prosecution of individuals involved in women trafficking and child abuse. WOTCLEF has embarked on series of enlightenment campaigns in which it has emphasised prevention and persuasion as important strategies for dealing with the problem of trafficking. The Foundation has also organised several national workshops and in-house discussions, where experts have come together to brainstorm on related policies. The Foundation has widely circulated relevant publications to educate the public on the subject in question. WOTCLEF organised the first Pan African Conference in human trafficking in Abuja, Nigeria with the aim of evolving an African regional initiative against trafficking.

Another innovative strategy is the catch-them-young schools programme, which promotes the establishment of chapters of WOTCLEF in institutions of learning as moral re-armament clubs. To carry the campaign further to the grassroots, WOTCLEF embarked on a national sensitisation tour, with the issue of trafficking and child labour in view. A weekly drama series on women/child trafficking at the instance of WOTCLEF is usually aired on the Nigeria Television Authority Network service. In recognition of its efforts, the United Nations (UN) granted special consultative status to the WOTCLEF – a decision at the United Nations Economic and Social Council's Substantive session of July 2003 in New York. The World Bank similarly recognised the WOTCLEF initiative with a grant of N10 million as assistance to the Foundation in tackling the rise in local and cross-border women and child trafficking in the country.

#### Some Conclusions

The factors associated with the motivation for girl/women trafficking for international commercial sex work are complex. Any meaningful effort at dealing with the problem must be holistic. Several forms of interventions and advocacy are currently being facilitated by governmental and non-governmental organisations to stem the trend. While the government's perspective on the crisis remains coercive, non-governmental initiatives towards a more viable solution are hinged on moral persuasion and enlightenment. Such intervention programmes would, however, be more effective if related factors that tend to generate and sustain girls' trafficking for commercial sex work are simultaneously targeted for action. They include the massive devaluation of the naira and the foreign exchange earning potential, relative deprivation, and endemic poverty as well as push factors located in gender-biased primogeniture cultural systems (Onyeonoru 2003a). Curiously, this involves a contradiction and creates a policy dilemma for the Obasanjo-led government, given its unrelenting disposition towards a neo-liberal approach to reforms, which tend to reproduce the aforementioned.

Furthermore, there is a very urgent need for an aggressive employment creation programme for the youth of the country. A major anxiety expressed by participants in the Eki Igbenedion's Skill Acquisition Centre, for instance, is that the graduates remain unemployed after training – to the effect that the risk of being trafficked is invariably not averted. There is therefore a need for government-private sector partnership in this regard to promote the absorption of these youths into the labour market. Soft loans could be arranged for the girls through the National Directorate of Employment (NDE) or through the banks in such a way that would ameliorate the problem of collateral, and promote the Small Scale Enterprises (SME) aspirations of the government.

#### Notes

- 1. The author gratefully acknowledges the funding of this study by the Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA) Gender Institute, Dakar, Senegal.
- 2. Henceforth to be called 'Notes 2'.
- 3. The Centre was founded by the First Lady of Edo State, Nigeria, Mrs. Eki Igbinedion as part of the intervention programmes against girls trafficking for sex work.
- 4. See African Journal of Peace and Conflict Studies, Volume 1, No. 1.
- 5. The English translation means: 'Death is common in Nigeria! People die through accident on the highways. The risk of AIDS infection is not limited to sexual intercourse. Patronising a barbering saloon could infect one. People who get infected with AIDS through sexual contact are not wise. I will insist that my clients use condom or else I will use the female condom. I understand that it is effective'.
- 6. The full names of the respondents are not used for the ethical reasons.
- 7. Period for which data are available.
- 8. Union Bank (Nigeria) Plc is, for instance, involved in the sponsorship of the Igue festival in Benin, probably as a mark of appreciation for high patronage.
- 9. Translated into English: 'Help me my son. My daughters are too rigid on the matter. Serving God should not translate into stupidity. I just don't understand them'.

#### References

- Abraham, Yvonne and McNaught, Sarah.1997. 'Legalize Prostitution', *The Boston Phoenix*, October 23-30, http://www.bostonphoenix.com/index.html.
- Adegbola O. and O. Babatola. 1999. 'Premarital and Extramarital Sex in Lagos, Nigeria', in Orubuloye et al. *The Continuing HIV/AIDS Epidemics in Africa: Responses and Coping Strategies*. Canberra. Health Transition Centre, Australian National University.
- Adepoju A. 1985. Internal Migration, Population and Distribution and Regional Development in Africa: Emerging Issues and Policy Considerations. Regional Institute for Population Studies (RIPS), University of Ghana, Legon, Research Monograph No. 2.
- Adepoju A. 1998. 'Emigration Dynamics in Sub-Saharan Africa', in R. Appleyard (ed.) Emigration Dynamics in Developing Countries Vol. 1: Sub-Saharan Africa. United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), International Organization for Migration (IOM), Ashgate, and Brookfield.
- Afolayan A.A. 1998. 'Emigration Dynamics in Nigeria: Landlessness, Poverty, Ethnicity', in R. Appleyard (ed.) *Emigration Dynamics in Developing Countries* Vol. 1: Sub-Saharan Africa. United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), International Organization for Migration (IOM), Ashgate, Brookfield.

- Aina T. A. 1997. Globalization and Social Policy in Africa: Issues and Research Directions CODESRIA, Dakar.
- Bindman J. 1997. 'Redefining Prostitution as Sex Work on the International Agenda'.

  Anti-Slavery International With the Participation of Jo Doezema Network of Sex Work Projects, London.
- Bangura Y. 1989. 'Crisis and Adjustment: The Experience of Nigerian Workers', in Onimode B., (ed.) *The IMF, The World Bank, And African Debt: The Economic Impact.* Vol. I, London, Zed Press.
- Braverman H. 1998. Labor and Monopoly Capitalism. New York. Monthly Review Press.
- Caldwell, J.C, I.O. Orubuloye and P. Caldwell. 1991. 'The Destabilization of the Traditional Yoruba Sexual System'. Population and Development Review, Vol. 17 No. 2.
- Caldwell J.C., Pat Caldwell, B.K. Caldwell and Indrani Pieris. 1998. 'The Construction of Adolescence in a Changing World'. *Studies in Family Planning*. Vol. 9, No. 2 1998, pp 137-153.
- Durkheim, E. 1951. *Suicide: A Study in Sociology*: London, The Free Press, Glencoe and Rutledge and Kegan Paul.
- Ekeh P. 1996. 'Political Minorities and Historically-Dominant Minorities in Nigerian History and Politics', in Oyeleye Oyediran (ed.) *Governance and Development in Nigeria, Essays in Honour of Professor Billy J. Dudley.* Ibadan, Agbo Areo Publishers.
- Federal Office of Statistics. 1995. Annual Abstract of Statistics. Lagos, Federal Republic of Nigeria.
- Federal Office of Statistics. 1997. Annual Abstract of Statistics. Abuja, Federal Republic of Nigeria.
- Federal Office of Statistics. 2001. Annual Abstract of Statistics. Abuja, Federal Republic of Nigeria.
- Frey W.H. 1996. 'Immigration, Domestic Migration, and Demographic Balkanization in America'. *Population and Development Review*. Vol. 12, No. 4, December 741-763.
- Finnegan, Frances. 1979. Poverty and Prostitution: A Study of Victorian Prostitutes in New York. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Giddens A. 1990. The Consequences of Modernity. Cambridge, Polity Press.
- Giddens A. 1991. Modernity and Self Identity. Cambridge, Polity Press.
- Hoigard Cecilie and Liv Finstad. 1992. *Backstreets: Prostitution, Money, and Love.* Translated by Katherine Hanson, Nancy Sipe and Barbara Wilson. First published as *Bakgater* in Norway, 1986, Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Idia Renaissance. Undated Handbook. Female Trafficking. Notes 2. Benin, Idia Renaissance.

- Isiugo-Abanihe U.C. and Sim O. Odiagbe. 1998. 'Sexual Life on the Highway: Nigerian Truckers and Commercial Sex Workers in the Era of AIDS', African Population Studies. No. 13 Vol. 2 September 1998/ Vol. 13, No. 2.
- Lancaster, Roger N. 2003. The Trouble With Nature: Sex in Science and Popular Culture. California, California University Press.
- Leslie J.A.K. 1963. A Survey of Dar es Salaam. London, Oxford University Press for the East African Institute of Social Research.
- Loxley J. 1995. 'Rural Labour Markets in an Adjusting Mineral Economy', in Vali Jamal, *Structural Adjustment and Rural Labour Markets in Africa*. Geneva, International Labour Organization.
- Massey D.S. 1995. 'The New Immigration in the United States'. *Population And Development Review* Vol 21, Number 3, September, 631-651.
- Marck, J. 1999. 'Long-Distance Truck Drivers' sexual cultures and Attempts to Reduce HIV Risk Behaviour Amongst Them: A Review of the African and Asian Literature', in J.C. Caldwell et al. (eds.) Resistance to Behavioural Change: to Reduce HIV/AIDS Infection in Predominantly Heterosexual Epidemics in Third World Countries. Canberra, Health Transition Centre, Australian National University.
- Mcleod, Eileen. 1982 Women Working: Prostitution Now. London, Croom Helm and Canberra.
- Milazi D. 1998. 'Migration Within the Context of Poverty and Landlessness in Southern Africa', in R. Appleyard, (ed.) *Emigration Dynamics in Developing Countries Vol 1: Sub-Saharan Africa*, United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), International Organization for Migration (IOM), Ashgate, Brookfield.
- Offe C. 1995. 'Prostitution and Violence: Towards a Feminist Practice', in M. Hester, J. Radford, and L. Kelly (eds.), *Women, Violence and Male Power: Feminist Activism, Research and Practice, London, Open University.*
- Olukoshi A.O. 1989. 'Impact of IMF/World Bank Programmes on Nigeria', in B. Onimode (ed.), *The IMF, The World Bank, And African Debt: The Economic Impact*, Vol. I, London, Zed.
- O'Neill, M., Sue Johnson, Mo Mc Donald, Terry Webster, Michelle Wellik and Helen McGregor. 1994. 'Prostitution, Feminism and the Law: Feminist Ways of Seeing, Knowing and Working with Women Working as Prostitutes'. *Rights of Women Bulletin*, Spring.
- Onimode B. 1989. 'Crisis and Adjustment: The Experience of the Nigerian Worker', in B. Onimode (ed.), The IMF, *The World Bank, And African Debt: The Economic Impact*, Vol. I. London, Zed.
- Onyeonoru, Ifeanyi. 1994. 'Labour Migration and Rural Transformation in Nigeria'. *International Sociology*, Volume 9, No. 2, June, pp 217-221.
- Onyeonoru, Ifeanyi. 2001. 'Globalization and Labour Migration: The Socio-Economic Context of Nigerian Newbreed Commercial Sex Workers'. *Journal of the Nigerian Anthropological and Sociological Association*, Vol. 2, No 1 October, pp. 209-218.

- Onyeonoru, Ifeanyi. 2002. 'Anomie and Workplace Deviance: A Sociological Analysis of Bureaucratic Corruption in Nigeria', in Uche Isiugo-Abanihe et. al. (cds.), *Currents and Perspectives In Sociology*. Lagos, Malthouse, Lagos (Chapter 17, pp. 325-345).
- Onyeonoru, Ifeanyi. 2003. 'Push Factors in Girls' Trafficking For International Commercial Sex Work and the Gender Implications: A Study of Benin, Edo State'. *African Journal of Peace and Conflict Studies* Vol. 1. No. 1, pp. 118-139.
- Oppong C. 1993. 'Occupational and Conjugal Inequalities and Insecurity: Effects on Family Organization and Size', in S.N. Federici, K.O. Mason and S. Sogner, (eds.), Women's Position and Demographic Change. Oxford, Oxford University Press.
- Oppong C. 1995. 'A High Price to Pay: for Education, Subsistence or a Place in a Job Market'. *Health Transition Review*, Supplement to Volume 5, pp. 35-56.
- Orubuloye I. O., P, Caldwell, and J. C. Caldwell. 1994. 'The Role of High Risk Occupations in the Spread of AIDS: Truck Drivers and Itinerant Market Women In Nigeria', in Sexual Networking and AIDS in Sub-Saharan Africa: Behavioural Research and the Social Context, *Health Transition* Series No. 4.
- Overs C., and Longo P. 1997. *Making Sex Work Safe*. London, Network of Sex Work Projects in Collaboration with AHRTAG.
- Peil M. 1976. 'African Squatter Settlements: A Comparative Study'. Urban Studies, No. 13.
- Peil M. 1977. Consensus and Conflict in African Societies: An Introduction to Sociology. London, Longman.
- Pronk J. P. 1993. 'Migration: The Normad in Each of Us'. *Population and Review* Vol. 19, No. 2, June.
- Sawyerr, Akilapa. 1998. 'Globalization and Social Sciences in Africa', Presidential Address at the 9th General Assembly of CODESRIA Dakar, Senegal, December 14-18.
- Scholfe J. A. 2000. Globalization: A Critical Introduction, Houndmills, Macmillan.
- Shaw R.P. 1975. *Migration, Theory and Facts.* Regional Science Research Institute, Pennsylvania, Bibliographical Series No. 5.
- Stichter, Sharon. 1985. Migrant Laborers, African Society Today. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Taylor Ian. 1998. 'Crime, Market Liberalism and the European Idea', in Rugierro V, South N., and Taylor I., (eds) *The New European Criminology: Crime and Social Order In Europe.* London, Routledge.
- The World Bank. 1996. Nigeria, Poverty in the Midst of Plenty: The Challenge of Growth With Inclusion. Report No.14733-UNI.
- The World Bank. 1998. World Development Report. Washington DC.
- The World Bank. 2005. World Development Report. Washington DC.
- Tod, David. 1994. *Nigeria Poverty Assessment*. Background Document. London, Overseas Development Administration.

- United Nations Development Programme. 1996. Human Development Report, Nigeria. Oxford, Oxford University, Press.
- United Nations Development Programme. 1998. *Human Development Report, Nigeria*. Oxford, Oxford University Press.
- United Nations Development Programme. 2003. Human Development Report, Nigeria. Oxford, Oxford University, Press.
- Vanwesenbeeck, Inc. 1997. 'The Context of Women's Powerlessness in Heterosexual Interactions', in Segal, Lynne (ed.). New Sexual Agendas. New York, New York University Press.
- Went Robert. 2000. Globalization: Neo-Liberal Challenge, Radical Responses. London, Pluto Press.
- Woodword, D. 1992. *Debt, Adjustment and Poverty in Developing Countries*. London, Pinter Publishers in Association with Save the Children.
- Worsley P. 1994. 'The Nation State, Colonial Expansion and the Contemporary World Order', in T. Ingold, (ed.), *Companion Encyclopedia of Anthropology, Humanity, Culture and Social Life.* London, Routledge.
- Zanini, Gianni. 1994. 'Nigeria's Structural Adjustment Programme: Policies, Implementation and Impact'. Address Delivered at the Weekly Seminar of Agricultural Economics/Economics Department, University of Ibadan, July 5.

Newspapers, Television and Magazines

BBC News. 2004. 'The Pulse of Africa'. http://news.bbc.co.uk/go/pr/fr/-/2/hi/africa/3747212.stm

National Concord. February 21, 2000.

New Age. December, 31, 2003.

Newswatch. July 26, 1999.

Nigerian Television Authority, March 22, 2000.

Sunday Punch. October 28, 2001.

Sunday Punch. June 22, 2003.

The Anchor. July 25, 2001.

The Economist. February 14, 1998.

The Punch. June 23, 2003.