



THE DILEMMA OF BEING ÈNÌYÀN (HUMAN), TOWARDS EMERGENCY VICTIMS IN THE AGE OF CELL PHONES: A STUDY OF LAGOS NIGERIA

AKIN-OTIKO, Akinmayowa

Institute of African and Diaspora Studies, University of Lagos

E-mail: pakin-otiko@unilag.edu.ng

ABSTRACT

This study examined the developing attitude of Nigerians towards victims with health challenges using a Yoruba ethical principles, which is *Hu ìwà sí i bí ènìyàn eléran ara* (act towards him or her as a human being with flesh and feeling). Mobile phones with cameras have increased online reporting in Nigeria, however it also challenges the disposition to being *ènìyàn* (being human) towards others during emergency situations. Rather than assisting emergency victims, many first-responders video or take pictures of victims. This change in attitude raises a fundamental question of humanness of first responders to emergency situations in Nigeria. This principle guides human relationships among the Yoruba, however, when applied to ethical issues, it creates a framework, which makes human feelings count. The study showed that if the principle is adapted during emergencies, it will give strength to the humane relationships in Nigeria. The study focused on selected cases to evaluate the attitude of first responders (FR) in emergency situations; it also showed how antithetical the attitude of FR is to the general sense of African good neighbourliness, that is being human. There is a departure from the attitude of common support of the other as *ènìyàn*.

Keywords: Attitude, Ethics, *Ènìyàn*, First Responders, Camera-mobile Phones.

INTRODUCTION

This anecdote creates a context for this study:

Chidi had lived an amazing life. He was a good friend at LASU-Laws and a colleague at the Bar, making his points slowly but with convincing submissions. His collapse in Court on March 15, 2016 proved fatal. He had been rushed outside the courtroom on that fateful day for fresh air in the absence of first aid. Applying a cardio-pulmonary resuscitation or external chest compression would have saved him, perhaps a little dose of aspirin (Ayojimi, 2016).

The world has always had and understood how humans are to respond to one another, especially in emergency situations. In Yoruba language and society for instance, the roles of *èniyàn* (a person or human being) towards another *èniyàn* in an emergency situation, are usually not ambivalent; despite the fact that social relations among people as well as their cultures are ever evolving and changing.

In the *Ifá* spiritual and ethical tradition, *èniyàn* is a fundamental concept that speaks to the moral status and moral considerability of the human person. In fact, it is the hub and hinge on which *Ifá* moral anthropology turns. The word *èniyàn* in the Yoruba language, the parent language of *Ifá*, literally means “chosen one(s)” and at the same time is the word for human being (Karenga, 2009).

Among the Yoruba, the attitude of *èniyàn* can be seen to be similar to the attitude of trained First Responders (FR) as they have evolved within the context of a formal discussion. First responders, as a term “evolved in the media—especially since 9/11—to mean all emergency responders, but officially just refers to the medical folks who beat the ambulance to the scene” (Brouhard, 2020a).

Among humans in general, it is believed that humans are meant to respond to calls or need for help from ‘the other’ as efficiently and as urgently as possible. It is to ensure this normal human disposition that some parts of the world have included laws that hold people responsible for not acting or responding when they witness an emergency. First Responder roles are either community-decided or based on the knowledge and instinct of the responder if untrained. Nigeria as a country has had a good share of first responders’ interventions, which have mitigated more devastating consequences. People have been saved from drowning by first responders, accident victims have been rushed to hospitals, and first-degree -burn victims have been given first aid at different times. For the West, these roles are assigned to FR, but for the Yoruba, it is in being *èniyàn* towards the other, that these roles are realized.

The role of first responders in Nigeria cannot be over emphasized given the nature of emergency situations such as; vehicular accidents, armed robbery attacks and kidnap situations, among others. It is the centrality of the role of the first responders that makes it important to investigate the idea of being *èniyàn* among the Yoruba, particularly in emergency situations, and how this idea is being eroded by the introduction of cell-phones with cameras in recent times. Although there are broader social influences affecting the attitude of people living in Lagos towards accident victims, this paper focuses on the negative influence of cell-phones.

For the Yoruba, FR are IS similar to individuals who act as *èniyàn* (human beings). To be *èniyàn* towards a neighbour or another individual, generally and in particular during an emergency situation, is guided by the Yoruba principle of good neighbourliness which is to treat the other as ‘*èniyàn eléran ara*’ (Human being with flesh or human being who can feel pain). This explains the sentiment that guides the idea of being *èniyàn* and acting as *èniyàn* towards one another. This study places the principle of good neighbourliness, which is, to treat the other persons as *èniyàn eléran ara*, in dialogue with the changing attitude of *Lagosians* (people who live in Lagos State, Nigerian) to emergency healthcare situations. Findings explain how the principle of *èniyàn eléran*

ara in emergency situations in Lagos has been eroded by the introduction and use of cell phones with cameras.

The author of the anecdote at the beginning of this work believes that the government at every level should engage in the following: provide first aid equipment, give specific training for first aiders and provide first aid support with best practices (Ayojimi, 2016). This study however, shifts the blame from lack of facility and government neglect of development to a rising departure from the principle of *Hu iwà sí i bí ènìyàn eléran ara* (*act towards him or her as a human being with flesh and feeling*); where individuals now have attitudes that portray lack of sympathy for victims in emergency situations. The paper addresses this as a social phenomenon with disturbing moral implications, as where individuals who witness persons in need, choose to record the event on their cell phones rather than provide aid.

CONCEPTS

This section clarifies recurrent concepts so as to place them in context and show the meaning that the concepts have within this study.

First Responders (FR): In the Western orientation, a FR is generally believed to be an individual who in the early stages of an incident, is either assigned or voluntarily takes up the responsibility of protecting and preserving life, property, evidence, and the environment. Within the context of the Iowa State in the USA where documents around FR have been developed, a FR, means an “emergency medical care provider, a registered nurse staffing an authorized service program under Iowa Code section 147A.12, a physician assistant staffing an authorized service program under Iowa Code section 147A.13, a firefighter, or a peace officer as defined in Iowa Code section 801.4 who is trained and authorized to administer an opioid antagonist” (Law Insider, n.d.)

FR largely takes care of what is called the pre-hospital emergency medicine (PHEM), also referred to as pre-hospital care, immediate care, or emergency medical services medicine (EMS medicine), this is a medical subspecialty which focuses on caring for seriously ill or injured patients before they reach hospital, and during emergency transfer to hospital or between hospitals. It may be practised by physicians from various backgrounds such as anaesthesiology, emergency medicine, intensive care medicine and acute medicine, after they have completed initial training in their base specialty (Mackenzie, 2018).

FR are usually well-integrated with local emergency medical services, and are dispatched together with emergency medical technicians or paramedics where potentially life-threatening trauma or illness is suspected that may benefit from immediate specialist medical treatment (Wilson, et. al. 2015). There are also civilians who have no formal training but volunteer to respond in care as is contained in the German penal code.

In an African setting as well as other places in the world, FR will be witnesses or persons close to emergency situations. “They jump in and help when the going gets tough. A witness comes forward and tells the authorities what he saw. A Good Samaritan pulls the injured to safety or tries to stop the bleeding. Whatever needs to be done usually gets done by the person on the street or

the patient's co-workers. Most people don't just stand by” (Brouhard, 2020) when an emergency occurs.

In the Nigerian setting, a FR does not enjoy a formal training, this is because, “Emergency Medical Services (EMS) care in Nigeria has been a long and challenging one. Before 1995, ambulances in Nigeria were known for undertakers’ services and not for carrying live patients” (National Emergency Department Inventories, n.d.). There are not many trained FR in Nigeria; private companies and different civil societies train their members to be FR, but this is a far cry compared to what Nigeria needs and the level of knowledge that average Nigerian has regarding the function and expertise of a FR.

To be able to engage in the moral process, one has to be human. This is why for the Yoruba, the concept of being *èniyàn* (human) adequately makes up for the role of a FR. In the German penal code, not to respond as a FR is a crime; a person has to render aid in cases of accidents or other common dangers, unless such person would thereby endanger himself or herself or it would be contrary to some other important obligation (Strafgesetzbuch 2019). Among the Yoruba, caring for one’s neighbour is expected to be *èniyàn* acting towards another *èniyàn*.

The concept *èniyàn* (human), in some cases refers to a person as an individual or individuals belonging to species called *Homo sapiens*. In other contexts, human person “refers to individuals who enjoy something comparable in relevant aspects, to the type of mental life that characterizes normal adult human beings” (Tooley, 2001:117). The idea of personhood is important to “the formulation of many basic moral principles, including ones concerned with the morality of killing” (Tooley, 2001:117).

Scholars such as Idowu (1996) have defined a human being or a person as a three-dimensional entity, with *Ara* (body), *Èmí* (soul/spirit) and *Orí* (spiritual head which is responsible for human destiny). But this definition does not explain why a human being *èniyàn* is obliged to act morally towards another individual in order to be described as *èniyàn*. In Gbadegesin’s view, there is a normative and ordinary meaning of ‘*Èniyàn*’. The normative dimension attempts to prescribe standards. For example, the Yoruba would usually describe someone who is amoral as ‘*Kií se èniyàn*’, meaning that the individual in question is not a person. This kind of remark is a product of observation and assessment of an individual’s action. This is quite different from the ordinary or literal meaning (Gbadegesin, 2018).

To be able to appreciate the idea of *èniyàn* beyond the ordinary, it is important to highlight the meaning of a vital part of a human being, outside the three common elements of *ara*, *èmi* and *orí*. Gbadegesin (2018) among others identified *Okàn* which he listed as the second feature of the four elements that make up a person in the Yoruba worldview. For him, “*Okàn* has a dual character in the Yoruba conception of a person, in the ordinary sense, it is recognised as the physical organ responsible for the circulation of blood, and secondly, it is conceived as the source of emotional and psychic reactions” (Gbadegesin, 2018). Following Gbadegesin’s input, for the Yoruba, the *Okàn* (heart) defines the moral basis or quality of *èniyàn* and that is what defines a good person or not. The other elements, *ara*, *èmi* and *orí* define the existential nature, it can be good or bad, it is common to all, but *okàn* separates *èniyànburúkú* (bad person) from *èniyàn rere* (good person). It

is based on the idea of a good person that Idowu holds that humans “have an intuitive knowledge of goodness. He then goes on to list eleven virtues of the Yoruba, among them chastity, hospitality, kindness, truthfulness and the capacity to refrain from theft” (Idowu, 1977:146 quoted in Amadi, 1982:53).

A person is defined as *èniyàn* by the Yoruba given the fact that he/she has *Okàn*, that is courageous in doing good. For the Yoruba, one is expected to be good, because “kindness pays in the end, whatever may be its immediate outcome. Therefore, one must go on being kind whatever happens” (Idowu, 1996:167). Beyond the idea of *èniyàn*, scholars have also discussed the concept of *Omolúàbí* as it “connotes respect for self and others. An *Omolúàbí* is a person of honor who believes in hard work, respects the rights of others, and gives to the community in deeds and in action” (Adeniji-Neill, 2008:2).

A true *Èniyàn* is a first aider. This is a person, “usually without training, who steps in to do whatever he or she can to stop the bad things from happening and start doing the good things” (Brouhard, 2020a). These are innocent persons who are in the proximity of an incident. *Èniyàn* will include all who arrive at the scene of accidents and engage in the following two distinct steps: “Stop the emergency from progressing to more dire consequences, and transport the patient to definitive care (hospital emergency department, burn center, trauma center, cardiac catheterization lab, etc.) These are simply, “folks who beat the ambulance to the scene” (Brouhard, 2020b) because response times are often seen as very important.

The situation of things in Nigeria, a developing nation, places a vital role on being *Èniyàn* in emergency situations. The Nigerian State cannot adequately respond to emergency situations on time. There are no active emergency numbers to call, and where some numbers have been established, situations such as heavy traffic, bad roads, little or no access roads, etc. do not allow for smooth and efficient response. And here we are, Information Technology (IT) and the social media along with the good they bring, have also added to the issues that strain the practice of the principle of treating the other persons as *èniyàn eléran ara*. Among the Yoruba, responses to emergency situations were guided by the principle of treating the other persons as *èniyàn eléran ara* (a human being who has flesh), this study investigates what has changed in Lagos, Nigeria through a case study approach. This is important because Africans are known to care and show sympathy for humans in general and this sympathy is unalloyedly shown during emergency situations, whether the FR/IR is trained or not. A drastic shift became noticeable with the introduction of mobile phones which have cameras. The impression/experience of many Nigerians is that individuals show more interest in taking pictures or capturing video clips of emergency situations rather than responding to the needs of persons in critical conditions. Studying the (changing) attitudes of some Lagosians towards their neighbours in emergency situations can help to better understand the present (moral) challenges to the very fabric of the Yoruba bioethical principle of *èniyàn eléran ara* (a human being who has flesh). Every *èniyàn* is meant to save lives, but now a significant number of Nigerians watch fellow *èniyàn* lose lives without their hearts (*okàn*) being moved. This study highlights camera phones as one of the major reasons for the shift, pursuing the belief that the new attitude highlights the anonymity provided by recent ICT

technology which enables abuse. It would seem that with the availability of smartphones, previously held compassionate attitudes are gradually disappearing, people are now more interested in recording and broadcasting accidents rather than being focused on sourcing emergency care for victims. After analysing the material along these lines, the paper asks what can be done to restore the sympathy that made humans care for humans, as enshrined in the Yoruba principles of *èniyàn eléran ara*.

THEORY

This study is adopting an Afrocentric theory developed from the understanding of *okàn* (heart) as a base for the moral construct of *èniyàn* as conceived among the Yoruba. *Okàn* serves as a basis for moral construct because it is believed that choices and decisions flow from *okàn*. As the site of emotion and decision, *okàn* is used to evaluate the attitude of human beings among the Yoruba, and for this study it will be used in evaluating the action of those who run into emergency situations. Among the Yoruba, it is expected that *èniyàn* will treat the other persons as *èniyàn eléran ara* (a human being who has flesh) when duty calls. The response to the other as *èniyàn eléran ara* is what makes such an individual *èniyàn* (human). In this study, the theory guides the evaluation of the attitude of Lagosians in emergency situations, considering the impact the use of cameras phones have on care for others in emergency situations. This theory is unique because of the relevance to existential human interactions. The principle of *Hu iwà sí i bí èniyàn eléran ara* (act towards him or her as a human being with flesh and feeling), examines personhood from an individual point of view and explains the duty and rights that arise from being *èniyàn* (human) with a heart (*okàn*) and as an individual – *ipso facto* –; this translates into a relationship of response to other humans in pain or sickness. The theory of *Hu iwà sí i bí èniyàn eléran ara* is a development on the basic principle that, ‘the other person is a human being like me, and I OUGHT to FEEL and RESPOND to his or her pain as I know best. It asks the questions; who is THIS BODY (human being), what OUGHT I do to him/her? “According to the principle of *èniyàn eléran ara* a patient or the OTHER, in pain has the right to be cared for because he/she is a human being with flesh and blood (*èniyàn eléran ara*)” (Akin-Otiko, 2022:17). This principle generally guides human relationships, when applied to neighbourliness, it creates a framework which places human feelings for the other person at the centre of every bioethical situation.

METHODOLOGY

Over a period of 12 months (January – December 2020) the researcher directly observed some cases and the attitude of some *Lagosians* during selected major emergency scenes and observed the attitude and behaviour of those that were found at the selected emergency scenes towards victims in need of care. Twenty cases were observed around Lagos city in Nigeria, but four have been analysed as broad categories into which the twenty cases can be grouped. The four cases have been analysed because they represent the broad spectrum that was covered across four different types of emergency situations. A Focus Group Discussion (FGD) on the implications of the attitudes of *Lagosians* was conducted. The FGD comprised three millennial (under 30 years of

age) and four who are over 50 years. All group members have at one time or the other been at the scene of accidents not necessarily one of the 20 selected cases. The group was made up of three females and the four males, all are educated enough to use mobile phones. Accident scenarios were relayed to the group by the researcher and then, they were asked questions that bother on: i) the changing pattern in the attitude of *Lagosians* towards emergency victims; ii) what is responsible for the attitudinal change; iii) what is promoting the change and iv) what must be done to reverse the situation. Data were analysed using a descriptive method.

RESULT

Table 1: Bio data of members of Focused Group Discussion

S/N	Item		
1	Gender	4 males	3 females
2	Age range	4 over 50 years	3 millennial – under 30
3	Possess Android phone	4 males	3 females
4	Used phones to record emergencies	4 males	3 females
5	Reaction to recording emergencies	Felt it was insensitive but felt helpless because of the system.	never thought about what they were doing as insensitive.

Table 1 shows that there were four (4) males and three (3) females that made up the FGD. Four (4) out of the seven (7) were over 50 years and the remaining three (3) were millennials, under 30 years. All seven have android phones and all seven have at different occasions taken pictures in emergency situations without helping. The three millennials felt it was a natural thing to do, they did not think that they were being insensitive in taking pictures at emergency scenes, whereas the other four (4) who are over 50 years felt they were insensitive, but blamed it on the Nigerian system ‘what could we have done they said?’

Table 2: Selected Representative Emergency Cases

Table 2 shows bystanders observing and taking pictures of accident victims but were not willing to help. They were more interested in taking pictures of victims and events. The table contains different responses as to why they were not involved in helping the emergency victims. The responses span across issues and ideas that are further discussed in the section for analysis.

S/N	Cases	<i>Lagosians'</i> - bystanders' responses to 'Why are you not helping the victims?'
1	Car accident on Lagos Ibadan expressway involving a truck and a cyclist who was severely injured and was losing blood on the head.	i. "I do not want police 'wahala'." ii. "I do not know if he was drunk o." iii. "He looks already dead, too much blood."
2	Fire incident, pipeline explosion in Abule Ado, Lagos which affected school children.	i. "I am not in the fire service." ii. "I cannot go close to the fire o." iii. "I have called fire service."
3	Fight with an underdog bleeding from a cut in the head in <i>Ojú elégba</i> , Lagos (a Street in Lagos mainland).	i. "Ah I do not know if the gang are around, I do not want to be attacked." ii. "I do not want the Police to raid me with them when they come." iii. "They should be left alone so that they will not fight again."
4	Robbery attack that left the victim bleeding from a gun shut wound in Isolo, Lagos (a Street in Lagos mainland).	i. "Ah I do not know what happened to him." ii. "I do not want the Police to think that I am one of them." iii. "I do not know what he did to his attackers, I do not want to be involved."

FGD Questions and Responses

Q1) What do you think make people take pictures or videos instead of helping victims?

Interestingly, all the members of the FGD agreed that many people take pictures and record videos at emergency scenes instead of helping victims because they want to be the first to post the incident on the social media platform or to be the first to break the news. A second dimension was added to this, however, it was said that pictures are taken to inform the government or relevant agencies so that they can come to the help of victims when the emergency situation is serious or out of control. Examples were given with fire incidents, where the Fire Services will be needed or in cases of serious accidents that required towing vans to clear the road and reduce traffic. The young members of the FGD held that most pictures and videos are taken today because there are more blogs and news outlets that engage journalists that are either trained or not, or take pictures as part of their jobs and report these experiences as mere reporting news as long as their relations are not victims of the said accidents. "In place of first aid, an onlooker prefers to take pictures of a misfortune for onward transmission to the social media" (Ayojimi, 2016).

Q2) What has changed since the introduction of cell phones?

The FGD was divided, the millennials think that nothing has changed, since the inception of the android camera phones. It is a normal thing to mind one's business and if necessary, to take pictures and go on one's way. For the millennials, it is not the camera phones that has changed the attitude of Nigerians to being humans, they say the society does not encourage helping others anymore. The society is more hostile, the hospitals are no longer as receptive of patients especially where little or nothing is known about the patient and a lot of money is required to settle the medical bills. It was also observed that the experiences that people have with reporting cases to the police makes it difficult to render help in emergency situations, especially when the incident is not in an open area. For those that have tried it before, they claim that it is time consuming to engage police and the 'willing to help individual' may end up being accused of being involved in the accident and it is always very difficult to get one's side of the story out if death is involved.

However, the older members of the FGD opined that the camera phones have changed the attitude of Nigerians. For them, Nigerians have not always been insensitive to emergency situations, but the situation today makes people look out for themselves more than ever, 'we are becoming more insensitive especially with the advent of social media'. People want to be the first to report, or just do as others are doing.

Generally, the average Nigerian feels some level of helplessness to perform any rescue function in cases of emergency partly because of the state social system which has a lot of bureaucracy. It was expressed that *Lagosians* think that they do not have laws that protect them, as is the case in the US, where there is the existence of the Good Samaritan laws, implemented to protect bystanders who acted in good faith. Respondents believe that the system of the country makes people less committed to helping others who need help.

Q3) Do you consider the attitude of people, either taking pictures or videoing emergency situations instead of helping a shift from èniyàn eléran ara?

The group was divided: members of the FGD who are over 50 years, think Nigerians still show compassion in emergency situation, therefore, Nigerians are still guided by the principle of *èniyàn eléran ara*. Where it seems as if there is no compassion, the group provided exceptions, by giving different reasons to excuse the actions of the people. First, it is believed that the many *Lagosians* are afraid of what may happen to the victims and the possibility of being implicated. Many cannot handle the stress of police reports and hospital procedures. Some others claim that some *Lagosians* may be afraid of blood and so may not be able to go close to the victims if there is a lot of blood spilled.

The younger members of the group are of the opinion that people feel connected only to those they know, if there are no relations in an emergency situation, it can pass for a movie scene, and so pictures and videos are taken so as to share on social media, in a sense it may be that Nigerians are drifting away from the principle of *èniyàn eléran ara*.

Q4) Do you consider taking pictures and videos in emergency situations inhumane attitude?

The group did not have a consensus on this question; for the younger generation, it is believed that Nigerians have grown to become insensitive to the situation. And rather than stop in

an emergency situation to take pictures or videos, people should actually mind their business and not gather at the scene. Government should be responsible for providing basic health care. And so it is considered inhumane to stop and take pictures, if one is not helping out, it is better to leave the emergency scene. The older generation however, think Nigerians are still sensitive and humane, and that is why they stop in emergency situations. The inability to do anything for victims is linked to the Nigerian system and not an inhumane attitude. The under 30 all think it is normal to look out for oneself and one's family first. Nigerians are becoming insensitive, and this is reflected in the system; the questions that are asked at the police station, the demand for money at the hospital.

DISCUSSION

The introduction of cell phones with cameras has added to the factors that affect the attitude of many *Lagosians* in emergency situations. The findings show that *Lagosians* are cut in-between being *èniyàn* who are relevant and helpful to their neighbours during emergency situations and just being mere onlookers or bystanders who do not intervene in emergency situations except to take pictures and video the incidents.

The findings of the paper show that the attitude of *Lagosians* can be linked partly to the availability of camera phones among other things. This explains the responses of the millennials in the FGD to question four (4) (*Do you consider taking pictures and videos in emergency situations inhumane attitude?*). The younger generation feel that *Lagosians* are not responding to emergency situations because they want to report the news and capture the event on their cameras. This attitude is worse when the FRs are in the company of those they do not know; they simply mind their phones. This response aligns with Bibb Latané and Judith Rodin (1969) experiment to show that “the presence of others inhibits helping, often by a large margin” (Hudson, & Bruckman, 2004:165–195). These experiments were conducted when the FR were either with a friend, or with a stranger to show when they will more likely help accident victims. Results show that “70 percent of the people called out or went to help the woman alone after they believed she had fallen and was hurt, but when paired with a stranger only 40 percent offered help” (Meyers, 2010:40).

The emerging attitude is that rather than *Lagosians* helping or assisting accident victims, they bring out their mobile phones to video or take pictures. This change in attitude has raised a fundamental question around the attitude of *Lagosians* to emergency situations. Beyond the influence of strangers, people also turn to their cell phones when they are not directly related to accident victims. There is the issue of connection with the emergency victims that was raised in question four (4). In discussing the degree of responsibility of a bystander towards an emergency situation, Darley and Latané determined that “the degree of responsibility a bystander feels is dependent on three things: i) Whether or not they feel the person is deserving of help, ii) The competence of the bystander and iii) The relationship between the bystander and the victim” (Darley & Latané 1968:377).

The result of this experiment agrees with the responses in the FGD that ‘so long as most *Lagosians* are not related to the victim, pictures are not seen as wrong’, because in the first place,

they would not be held accountable since the picture could not be traced to them, and secondly, the FGD participants said that people want to be ‘the first’ to spread sensational bit of news. This supports strong moral arguments against the act of taking pictures of accident scenes, because it appears that bystanders objectify victims.

One other point that the FGD described as helping FR apathy which has promoted the use of cell phones is the issue of number of witnesses at the emergency scene: it was observed that if there are many other bystanders, people are more likely to remain bystanders. This is the ‘bystander effect, or bystander apathy’ which is “a social psychological claim that individuals are less likely to offer help to a victim when other people are present; the greater the number of bystanders, the less likely it is that one of them will help” (Philpot, et. al. 2020). This issue in the context of Lagos however goes beyond bystander apathy, as FR get involved with their cell phones in ways that have no direct impact on victims.

Ethical Issues Linked to the Shift in Attitude

What ought to be done is not done – there is a dichotomy between the ought and the practicable. What ought to be done is guided by the principle of *èniyàn eléran ara*, whereas, what is often witnessed is guided largely by the desire to capture events on camera or videos among other social issues. This is reflected in the dichotomy between what was observed in the field and what is discussed in the FGD. Many *Lagosians* have visibly become insensitive to the experience and feeling of people in need and these questions the fundamental basis of the principle of *Hu iwà sí i bí èniyàn eléran ara*.

Hu iwà sí i bí èniyàn eléran ara as a principle stands far from the attitude of those that rather than help victims in emergency situations take pictures or video. The principle does not justify any of the reasons provided during the FGD responses. What the principle states is that every human being is to be treated as *èniyàn eléran ara*, persons who have Okàn (hearts) can feel pain, and they would rather give a helping hand than stand and take pictures. For the Yoruba, a person referred to as *èniyàn* will do everything within his/her power to help out in emergency situations.

Èniyàn (a person with a heart) will never be justified for taking pictures or videos for the fun of it, or just to break news, in an emergency situation, if the victim is not equally receiving help. Taking pictures and videos in an emergency situation may help in letting the authorities know or help to warn other people about danger because they are *èniyàn eléran ara*, but just taking pictures and video for the fun of it cannot be justified.

Although many attribute the shift in attitude to the “state of the system” but the nature of the principle cannot explain insensitivity in emergency situations, using the system as excuse for insensitivity is not permissible. The ineffective system is not enough explanation for people not to treat emergency victims as *èniyàn eléran ara*.

CONCLUSION

Advancement in Information Technology (IT) has come to stay and is rapidly changing how things are done, what *Lagosians* must guide against is allowing the negative impact of IT to erode and destroy basic ethical or relational principles that have guided healthy and helpful relationships in Africa. The emergence of phones with camera is one among many possible IT feats that are changing the African moral space. Ayojimi even says “Our attitude [to IT] must change in order to save lives” (Ayojimi, 2016). This study confirms a departure from the attitude of common support that Africans are known for, it therefore recommends ways and campaigns that can help save more lives.

Foremost among the recommended ways is a return to the principle of *Hu iwà sí i bí ènìyàn eléran ara*. Respondents indicated that *Lagosians* still think and love *Hu iwà sí i bí ènìyàn eléran ara* as a guiding principle, what is considered a stumbling block for its application is the placing of personal desire and self as well as the security system in Nigeria. The application of *Hu iwà sí i bí ènìyàn eléran ara* as a moral principle requires that people are protected by the law when they opt to save lives. Findings also show that it is not a bad thing to take pictures during emergency situations, but pictures and videos must be for the good of the victim. Taking pictures is a way of reaching out for help, it makes sense when it does not make particular cases worse. Taking pictures can be counterproductive, when lives are lost as a result of indifference.

RECOMMENDATION

The Nigerian social and medical systems need to improve.

Immediate Responders should be taught basic First Aid Principles.

There should be recruitment and training of Volunteer First Responders across Nigeria.

Nigerians should feel safe to help each other, and not be afraid of police or of bureaucratic procedures in hospitals.

REFERENCES

- Adeniji-Neill, D. (2008). *Parental Expectations in Education: A Case Study of Nigerian Immigrant Parents to the United States*, Tennessee: VDM Verlag Publishing Co.
- Akin-Otiko, A. (2022). *Hu iwà sí i bí ènìyàn eléran ara: A Ethical Theory of Interaction in African Traditional Medicine (ATM)*. Lagos: Lagos-African Cluster Centre. University of Lagos Press and Bookshop Limited. ISBN:978-978-998-457-2.
- Amadi, E. (1982). *Ethics in Nigerian Culture*. Ibadan:Heinemann Educational Books.
- Ayojimi, M. (2016). Where are the first responders? *The Guardian online news*. <https://guardian.ng/opinion/where-are-the-first-responders>
- ‘HSPD-8, Homeland Security Presidential Directive’. Office of the Press Secretary, The White House, (n.d.). Retrieved 2020-05-11.
- Brouhard, R. (2020a). How Not to Be a Bystander.

- <https://www.verywellhealth.com/rod-brouhard-emt-p-1298152> (2020b). What You Should Know About First Responders. <https://www.verywellhealth.com/what-is-a-first-responder-4090444>
- Darley, J. M., & Latane, B. (1970). *The unresponsive bystander: why doesn't he help?* New York, NY: Appleton Century Crofts.
- Darley, J. M. & Latané, B. (1968). "Bystander intervention in emergencies: Diffusion of responsibility". *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 8 (4, Pt.1): 377–383. doi:10.1037/h0025589. PMID 5645600. Archived from the original on 2013-05-07. Retrieved 2011-02-06.
- Gbadegesin, O. (2018) *Destiny, Personality and the Ultimate Reality of Human Existence: A Yoruba Perspective*. <https://doi.org/10.3138/uram.7.3.173>. April 24, 2018.
- Hagler, G. (2012). *Careers as a First Responder*.
- Hudson, J. M. & Bruckman, Amy S. (2004). The Bystander Effect: A Lens for Understanding Patterns of Participation. *Journal of the Learning Sciences*. 13 (2): 165–195. CiteSeerX 10.1.1.72.4881. doi:10.1207/s15327809jls1302_2.
- Idowu, E. B. (1996). *Olodumare God in Yoruba Belief*. Ikeja:Longman Nigerian Plc.
- Karenga, M. (2009). Eniyan. In M. K. Asante, & A. Mazama (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of African religion* (pp. 239-239). SAGE Publications, Inc., <https://www.doi.org/10.4135/9781412964623.n154>.
- Law Insider, (n.d.). legal definition of First responder. <https://www.lawinsider.com/dictionary/first-responder>.
- Legal Information Institute, (1992). 6 U.S.C. Homeland Security Organization. Chapter 1:101. <https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/6/101>.
- Mackenzie, R. (2018). Brief history of Pre-Hospital Emergency Medicine. *Emergency Med Journal*. 35 (3): 146–148. doi:10.1136/emermed-2017-207310. PMID 29463631.
- Meyers, D. G. (2010). *Social Psychology* (10th Ed). New York: McGraw- Hill. ISBN 978-0-07-337066-8.
- National Emergency Department Inventories. (n.d.) Emergency Medical Network. Retrieved May 3, 2020, from www.emnet-nedi.org
- Philpot, R.; Liebst, L. S.; Levine, M.; Bernasco, W.; Lindegaard, M. R. (2020). Would I be helped? Cross-national CCTV footage shows that intervention is the norm in public conflicts. *American Psychologist*. 75: 66–75. doi:10.1037/amp0000469. hdl:10871/37604. ISSN 1935-990X. PMID 31157529.
- Strafgesetzbuch (2019). Unterlassene Hilfeleistung; Behinderung von hilfeleistenden Personen § 323c (1) Strafgesetzbuch, (StGB) <https://dejure.org/gesetze/StGB/323c.html>.
- Tooley, M. P. (2001). In Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer (eds) *A Companion to Bioethics*. Malden, MA USA: Blackwell Publishing. 117-126.
- Wilson, M.H, Habig K, Wright C, Hughes A, Davies G, Imray C.H. (2015). Pre-hospital emergency medicine. *Lancet*. 386 (10012): 2526–34. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(15)00985-X. PMID 26738719.