



<https://ojshostng.com/index.php/ajbr>

Afr. J. Biomed. Res. Vol. 27 (May 2024); 183- 185

Mini Review

Ethical Leadership in Health Sciences: A Short Review on Moral Theories Guiding Health Practitioners in South Africa

***Makhoahle, P.M.¹, and Khetsha Z.P.²**

¹*Department of Health Sciences, Biomedical Technology, Faculty of Health and Environmental Sciences, Central University of Technology, Free State, South Africa.*

²*Department of Agriculture, Faculty of Health and Environmental Sciences, Central University of Technology, Free State, South Africa.*

ABSTRACT

Moral theories play an important role in the shape of healthcare institutions and health practitioners. Under the recently described VUCA world, the health science discipline has been confronted with ethical dilemmas and work burdens due to the socio-cultural politics globally, and this has been reported widely in South Africa due to the population and migration of foreign nationals. This commentary reviewed recent studies in ethical leadership, and moral theories, where deontology, consequentialism, and virtue ethics were used as lenses to trouble the current approaches to ethical leadership and moral theories in health science. In brief the study used contextual analysis, it was observed that the common setting, applying the interpretation and application of these theories ethically are essential for preserving patients' rights, ensuring equitable care, and maintaining professional integrity under any socio-cultural political stances of any country.

Keywords: *Moral theories, deontology, consequentialism, virtue ethics, South Africa*

*Author for correspondence: Email: pmakhoahle@cut.ac.za; Tel: +27 51 507 4022

Received: September 2023; Accepted: February 2024

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.4314/ajbr.v27i2.1>

© 2024 The Author(s).

This article has been published under the terms of Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC 4.0), which permits noncommercial unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided that the following statement is provided. "This article has been published in the African Journal of Biomedical Research"

INTRODUCTION

The higher education environment follows any high-performing organization structure with a clear mandate to empower students, and scholars to meaningful contributions towards the institutional value-based strategy and competency attributes in the ever-changing volatility, uncertainty, complexity, and ambiguity (VUCA) world (Korsakova, 2020). As with the World Health Organization (WHO), health practitioners in South Africa subscribe to the norms and standards encompassed in the Health Professions Council of South Africa (HPCSA) which is made of 12 subcommittees (Pilusa *et al.*, 2023). Al-Alawy and Moonesar (2023) reported that the notion of health care for all South Africa is clearly described. However, recently xenophobic trends have been observed, where international communities are classified, disrespected, and maltreated on social media by high-ranking health professionals and politicians; thus, calling for social justice for all. This commentary article seeks to reiterate the interpretation of the Act practitioners that there are guiding

frameworks driving the legislation of the Protection of Personal Information (POPIA) (Act 4 of 2013) which came into effect in South Africa on 1st of July 2021 (Stauton *et al.*, 2020; Bronstein and Nyachowe, 2023). In the context of decolonisation which aligns with Africanism and Ubuntu philosophy, the moral theories are deemed important to correlate with the health standards and code, where non-discriminatory health practices are always expected to be upheld (Nicolaidis, 2023; Pilusa *et al.*, 2023). As described in the Health Profession Act, 1974 (Act no. 56 of 1974), besides the interpretation, all health practitioners need to practice being reflexive practitioners; thereby comprehending the silent and unspecified values as described by the Africanism and Ubuntu philosophy in the health sciences discipline (Gray and Vawda 2016; Nicolaidis, 2023). Understanding these moral theories is important, this theory makes a claim as to what makes an action or a choice morally valuable in health sciences as prescribed by WHO and HPCSA, globally and in South Africa, respectively (Knox, 2023; Mills and Wilner,

2023; Stoeklé *et al.*, 2023). Moral theories are human invented based on the agreement from the concept of choice for ethical aspects (Guinebert 2020). The following theories were based on semantics, ontology, epistemology, and moral theories as described by Brenna (2007).

Virtue ethics: Virtue ethic theory explicitly describes the moral character a health practitioner should possess as innate before exposure to deontology or consequentialism theories (Crisp, 2000). As described by Pratt (2023), this theory signifies one's hopes, beliefs, and inclinations (Howell and Larsen., 2015); therefore, any health practitioner subscribed to this theory is seen to be making themselves a developed human being who espouses excellence in these clinical activities and relationships. As embedded within the 1996 South African constitution Bill of Rights - Chapter 2 number 7, every citizen and foreign national has a right to live, if this theory could be one of our life's cosmoeses, then our view on others will change drastically (South African Government, 1996; Bhattay-Loonat *et al.* 2023). Health Professions Council of South Africa is clear on ethical behavior and nondiscrimination of patients on color, religion, ethnicity, beliefs, and health conditions (Adams *et al.*, 2023; Bhattay-Loonat *et al.* 2023). For this matter, this is the reason behind the South African government expanding the legislation coverage by introducing national health insurance (Tiwari *et al.*, 2023).

Deontological ethics: Deontological ethics theory emanates from the idea of law and describes that the morality of an action should be based on whether that action itself is right or wrong under a series of rules and principles, rather than based on the consequences of the action which allows any health practitioners to seek objectively and dispassionately promote morality rather than any individual interest or need (Guinebert, 2020). This moral ethic allows health practitioners to their professional conduct in a form of law that has no conflicts with personal benefits and inclinations (Gray and Vawda 2016; O'Neill., 2001). Additionally, this theory argues that the policy reviews in the health sector and engagements that are free from one's opinion and interest, and constantly seek to protect human-kind and preserve life in the context of translating reasons to law governing behaviors and ethical responses of individual health practitioners when vested with powers to do so.

Contractualism: Another moral ethic theory is contractualism. This moral ethic theory has become a norm and standard that all employees including health practitioners sign a contract or mutual agreement that outlines expected behavior, and the discourses by health practitioners (Guinebert., 2020). Levine *et al.* (2023) explicitly describes this as an important part of moral psychology; thereby forming a triple theory of moral cognition. In the health fraternity, such agreements even cut across to the health council that health practitioners are members of, for example, HPCSA in South Africa. In brief, Hodson (2023) describes this as a moral-philosophical tool as adopted from Rawlsian and Scanlonian contractualism. This theory guides and ensures that every practitioner, including politicians working in the health sector

environment, is amenable to the law and all are compelled to comply as such.

Consequentialism: In the global context, whether an act is morally good or acceptable depends on its consequences. For example, an act that maximises and protects the life and integrity of Ubuntu, that is, if and only if that overall amount of good is greater than the incompatible act available at that time (Sinnott-Armstrong., 2019). In South Africa, at least eight Batho Pele Principles seeks to address and clarify what should be considered a priority at health institutions (Mojapelo *et al.*, 2023). The Batho Pele principles empowers health practitioners with guidance to execute the decisive role of assumption about their entrusted role and the patient as the end users of our health institutions. The pandemic caused by COVID-19, as it brought the world to a halt, bringing forward discourses such as VUCA world has demonstrated that it does not suffice to concentrate on one's own virtue, but rather a collective concerted effort leading to actions that have a positive impact on the world made us surviving mass death by the virus (Găman, 2023). Contemporarily, what defines the consequences depends on the anthropological assumptions based on axiology.

Conclusion: In conclusion, the above-mentioned is not limited towards seeking to remind health practitioners about their role and expectations of considering global standards. These moral theories clearly indicate what ethical behavior is expected and be able to use combined strategies from the different moral theories if it provides what works. It is for the reason that not every strategy that works is necessarily good, one still needs to converge a few theories or strategies and apply the consequentialism approach to obtain best practice. Choosing moral theories should prioritise those that preserve the principles of Batho Pele. As South Africa is a democratic and a developing country, we need to engage in moral reasoning if humans are so multifaceted, living in poverty and undefined. Health practitioner's rights of freedom should be exercised with caution such that those rights are self limiting as they are equal to the patients' rights and at the time of patients needs rights to care supersede all and patient right should be uphold without dehumanizing anyone. Health practitioners should always engage with moral theories to keep and uphold the principles of Ubuntu and make South Africa a better place for all living in it.

REFERENCES

- Adams, J., Unwin, D., Unwin, J., Deakin, T., Ifland, J. and Friedman, M.I., (2023): Psychological, behavioural, and ethical considerations. In *Ketogenic* (pp. 485-514). Academic Press.
- Al-Alawy, K. and Moonesar, I.A., (2023): Perspective: Telehealth—beyond legislation and regulation. *SAGE Open Medicine*, 11, p.20503121221143223.
- Anscombe, G. Elizabeth M. (1958): Modern Moral Philosophy. *Philosophy*, 33: 1–19. Accessed on the 20 August 2023.
- Bhattay-Loonat, S., Gardner, J. and Miniggio, H.D., 2023. Is it ethical to immobilize patient's jaws for weight loss? A

deontological perspective. *South African Dental Journal*, 78(3), pp.160-163.

Brennan, J. (2007): The Best Moral Theory Ever: The Merits and Methodology of Moral Theorizing. Electronic Dissertation. The University of Arizona. Accessed 14 June, 2023.

Bronstein, V. and Nyachowe, D.T., (2023): Streamlining regulatory processes for health researchers: To what extent does POPIA apply?. *South African Medical Journal*, pp.30-33.

Crisp, Roger (ed.). (2000): Aristotle: Nicomachean Ethics. Cambridge: CPU. Transl. Roger Crisp. Accessed 19 August 2023.

Găman, M.A., (2023) Health Sciences before, during and after the COVID-19 Pandemic. *European Journal of Investigation in Health, Psychology and Education*, 13(4), pp.759-761.

Gray, A. and Vawda, Y., (2016): Health policy and legislation. *South African health review*, 2016(1), pp.3-15.

Guinebert S, (2020): How do moral theories stand to each other? Some moral metatheoretical thoughts on a longstanding rivalry. *Zemo*, 3 279-299. Accessed the 20 August 2023.

Hodson, J., (2023): Digital marketing and misinformation: Why we need a new professional ethics to guide our practice. *Journal of Digital & Social Media Marketing*, 11(1), pp.79-88.

Howell, A.J., Larsen, D.J. (2015). Definitions and Attributes of Hope, and Their Application to Other-Oriented Hope. In: *Understanding Other-Oriented Hope*. Springer Briefs in Well-Being and Quality of Life Research. Springer, Cham.

Knox, J.B.L., (2023): The Ethics Laboratory: A Dialogical Practice for Interdisciplinary Moral Deliberation. In *HEC Forum* (Vol. 35, No. 2, pp. 185-199). Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.

Korsakova, T.V., (2020): Higher education in VUCA-world: New metaphor of university. *European Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, 6(1), pp.93-100.

Levine, S., Chater, N., Tenenbaum, J. and Cushman, F., (2023): Resource-rational contractualism: A triple theory of moral cognition.

Maureen Pratt MTS, M.F.A., (2023): Crippled Grace: Disability, Virtue Ethics, and the Good Life by Shane Clifton.

Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality, 23(1), pp.173-175.

Mills, B. and Wilner, A., (2023): The science behind “values”: Applying moral foundations theory to strategic foresight. *Futures & Foresight Science*, 5(1), p.e145. Anscombe, G. Elizabeth M. 1958. *Modern Moral Philosophy*. *Philosophy*, 33: 1–19. Accessed on the 20 August 2023.

Mojapelo, M., Modiba, M. and Saurombe, N., (2023): Applying Batho Pele principles in South African public archives—Do public programming initiatives count?. *Information Development*, 39(2), pp.357-375.

Nicolaides, A., (2023): Considering the philosophy of Ubuntu in South African healthcare ethical practices. *Journal of Medical Laboratory Science & Technology of South Africa*, 5(1), pp.71-76.

Pilusa, S., Myezwa, H., Sekome, K. and Maleka, D., (2023): Response of a South African university physiotherapy curriculum to contemporary national health needs and decolonialization priorities: rationale, content and lessons learnt. *Physiotherapy Theory and Practice*, pp.1-11.

Sinnott-Armstrong, W. (2019): Consequentialism. In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Summer 2019 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.). Accessed 15 June 2023.

South African Government, (1996): Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. Accessed 03 September 2023

Staunton, C., Adams, R., Anderson, D., Croxton, T., Kamuya, D., Munene, M. and Swanepoel, C., (2020): Protection of Personal Information Act 2013 and data protection for health research in South Africa. *International Data Privacy Law*, 10(2), pp.160-179.

Stoeklé, H.C., Ivasilevitch, A. and Hervé, C., (2023): Good practice in medicine and biology: scientific integrity needs global bioethics. *Journal of translational medicine*, 21(1), pp.1-6.

Tiwari, R., Grobbelaar, H.W., Vermaak, C. and Chikte, U., (2023): Strengthening the biokinetics workforce for improved services: A human resources for health review from 2000 to 2020. *South African Journal of Sports Medicine*, 35(1), pp.1-8.